

:34 / 9:24:52

YouTube Uncorrected Automated Transcript

January 24th, 2024: City Planning Commission Public Meeting



[NYC Department of City Planning](#)

1,597 views Streamed live on Jan 24, 2024

Calendar for January 24th*, 2024: [https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/planning/...](https://www1.nyc.gov/assets/planning/) *Meeting held in person in the New York City Department of City Planning Hearing Room, 120 Broadway, Lower Concourse, and remotely via ZOOM Webinar. Upcoming CPC meetings:

<https://www1.nyc.gov/site/planning/ab...> City Planning Commission (CPC) Public Meetings are open to the public and typically begin at 10:00am on Wednesdays, following a Monday CPC Review Session. The CPC Public Meetings are comprised of: - Scheduling dates for future public hearings - Reports (Commission votes) - Public hearings, during which testimony is accepted regarding land use applications in public review.

Transcript(3:14)

okay please take your seats we're going to get started good morning everyone I'm Dan(3:21)
garodnick chair of the City Planning Commission director of the Department of City Planning welcome to today's public meeting we're going
to start this(3:28)
morning's agenda with several votes starting with the Brownsville Arts Center and apartments part of the(3:34)
Department of housing preservation and development Brownsville plan to create thousands of new homes this project(3:40)
would bring 290 income restricted homes new community facility space and nearly(3:46)
20,000 square feet of open space to 376 Rockaway Avenue it's close to multiple(3:52)
bus and Subway Lines and the Long Island Railroad in Elmhurst Queens we will vote(3:57)
on the 8808 Justice Avenue restrictive deck termination a proposal *next* to the(4:04)
Queens Place Mall that would include around 180 homes offices Community facilities and Retail the building would(4:11)
be less than a block from the M and R train and several bus lines our final(4:16)
votes for today are centered on individual home authorizations or certifications on Staten Island we'll(4:22)
vote on an enlargement of a single family home at 76 Cedar Cliff Road in(4:28)
Sunnyside and enlargement of a single family home in new patio and swimming pool at 283 Ocean Terrace in Tottenville(4:36)
the development of a single family home a walkway driveway and a patio at 18 Kon(4:42)
Avenue in that same neighborhood and the development of two single family homes at 113 Glenwood Avenue in Sunnyside for(4:49)
today's first public hearing we'll open the Florida testimony on the renewal of office space at 300 Gold Street for the(4:56)
New York City Police Department this space would continue to house over 200(5:01)
Personnel for the *next* 5 years as the NYPD searches for more(5:06)

suitable and modernized spaces to fit its needs *next* up is our public hearing on the second phase of will its point an(5:13)
extensive plan to create 1,400 incom restricted homes a 25,000 seat soccer(5:20)
stadium a new hotel and nearly 3 acres of open space in an underutilized part of Queens all steps away from the seven(5:27)
train with the groundbreaking for phase one having(5:34)
occurred in December this priority of Mayor Adams that is being led by The Economic Development Corporation is(5:40)
expected to create 16,000 jobs at over \$6 billion to the New York City economy(5:47)
and bolster this area's role as a premier Sports Hub for New York City the(5:52)
commission will also hear testimony on a proposal to turn a parking lot at 341 10th Avenue I'm sorry 10th Street in(5:59)
Park Slope Brooklyn into two new mixed use buildings with around 300 homes over(6:06)
half of which would be income restricted about 100 of those income restricted homes would be for seniors and families(6:11)
making at or below 50% of the area median income the buildings would be(6:17)
less than a block away from the FG and R train stations along 4th Avenue last but(6:23)
certainly not least the public is invited to testify on city of yes for Economic Opportunity this important city(6:29)
wide initiative will Foster vibrant neighborhood corridors and Street Scapes bolster flexibility update outdated(6:36)
zoning rules and boost growing businesses across our commercial and Industrial sectors many parts of our(6:43)
zoning resolution for commercial and Industrial districts have not been updated in over 60 years and arbitrarily(6:50)
and needlessly restrain small business growth entrepreneurship and Innovation for example in certain(6:58)
commercial cars you can easily site a model car hobby center but not laser tag in a home you(7:06)
can be a music teacher but not a home decorator you can have a rock band in a(7:12)
bar but in many places zoning doesn't allow you to **dance** to the music that you are listening to you can bake bread but(7:19)
you can't make salsa on a retail Street these barriers mean a less vibrant City(7:26)
that styes people from being able to start a business that has vacant storefronts dotting our commercial(7:32)
carers and that causes businesses to move out of their neighborhood or City(7:38)
to find room to expand and Thrive city of yes will make sure our zoning helps(7:44)
and does not hinder our City's ongoing economic success under these changes we will say yes to more types of stores in(7:51)
our neighborhoods making it easier for small businesses to open and grow and help to reduce storefront vacancies yes(7:58)
to the largest expansion of space available for manufacturing in over 60 years by permitting smallscale clean(8:06)
production to locate in commercial areas for the first time more than doubling the space available for businesses like(8:12)
Pottery Studios micro breweries and apparel makers yes to making it easier(8:18)
for life science hubs to grow and expand securing the New York City Region's role(8:24)
as the national leader for this fast growing industry for decades to come yes(8:29)
to supporting entrepreneurs by expanding the range of home businesses allowed to create more opportunities in this(8:35)
ecosystem in our residential areas where more than 600,000 New Yorkers work at(8:40)
76,000 businesses that's more people than live in Baltimore yes to creating a(8:46)
path for 265,000 New Yorkers to gain easy access to new corner stores where(8:53)
they could buy a carton of milk or other basic necessities an option that can't be easily built under today's zoning in(9:00)
these residential areas the department of City Planning has been to all 59(9:05)
Community boards uh and we've had 140 meetings with Community boards on this(9:11)
subject alone there's lots of views on this of course this is New York I will note that(9:18)
I I shared with my 13-year-old son this morning we were going to have a hearing on this uh issue uh and told him uh(9:24)
about the The Proposal in a little more detail and shared with him that there are a lot of opinions on the subject(9:29)
he listened and then he asked me for the link and and I was so excited my 13-year-old was taking an interest in(9:36)
what I was doing and I said you want to listen in today and he said no I actually want to offer my opinion so with that I will note that we(9:44)
have a busy day ahead of us uh with lots of expected testimony so Sarah let's get to it the floor is yours and *thank you*(9:50)
Commissioners uh for your time and attention today good morning this is the City Planning Commission public meeting held(9:56)
remotely through the NYC engage portal in in person and the CPC hearing room 120 Broadway lur Concourse today is(10:02)
Wednesday January 24th 2024 I will now call the role chear rodnik here Vice chair Knuckles here commissioner(10:09)
Benjamin present commissioner thulu here commissioner cral present commissioner dck here I believe we have commissioner(10:16)
gold on Zoom yes here commissioner Goodridge commissioner kman here(10:24)

commissioner M here commissioner oio here commissioner rad here a quum is(10:29)
pres the first item is the approval of the minutes of the public meeting of Wednesday January 3rd 2024 great on the(10:34)
minutes I make a motion to approve the minutes of January 3rd commissioner rampersad is second *thank you* very much(10:40)
all those in favor please say I I oppose nay minutes are approved scheduling calendar numbers 1-9(10:48)
we have resolutions for adoption scheduling Wednesday February 7th 2024 for a public hearing to be held in(10:53)
person in the CPC hearing room 120 Broadway and remotely through the NYC engage portal great *thank you* on the(11:00)
resolutions I make a motion to approve the resolution been seconded by commissioner maren all those in favor(11:06)
please say I I oppose Nate resolution is adopted thank(11:11)
you the *next* part of the calendar is the report section on page 7 burough Brooklyn calendar numbers 10 11 and 12(11:18)
Brownsville art center and apartments cd16 calendar number 10 C 2429 h a calendar number 11 C(11:27)
2430 zmk calendar number 12 n 2431 zrk in the(11:34)
matter of applications for a UD udap designation project approval disposition of City own property zoning map and(11:40)
Zoning text amendments concerning Brownsville art center and apartments for favorable reports on calendar numbers 10 11 and 12 chair
garodnick I(11:47)
Vice chair Knuckles yes commissioner benjaman I commissioner CA yes(11:52)
commissioner crra yes commissioner dock yes commissioner gold(11:57)
yes commissioner kman yes commissioner M yes commissioner oio yes commissioner R(12:03)
pad yes favorable reports have been adopted on U calendar numbers 10 11 and(12:09)
12 Bar of Queens calendar number 13 8808 Justice Avenue restrictive uh(12:16)
declaration termination CD4 m210 229 Idq and the matter of an application for(12:22)
the cancellation of a previously approved restrictive declaration concerning 8808 Justice Avenue for a(12:27)
favorable report on C number 13 CH rodnick I Vice chair Knuckles yes commissioner Benjamin I commissioner(12:35)
C yes commissioner cral yes commissioner dck yes commissioner gold(12:42)
yes commissioner kman yes commissioner muten yes commissioner oio yes commissioner R padus recused(12:50)
yes a favorable report has been adopted on calendar number 13 bur Staten Island(12:55)
calendar numbers 14 15 16 and 17 17 calendar number 14 n230 265 Z calendar(13:03)
number 15 n230 266 z uh cd1 76 Cedar Cliff Road calendar(13:10)
number 16 n230 175 Z calender number 15(13:16)
n 2301 76 Z cd2 283 Ocean Terrace and(13:22)
the matter of applications for the grant of authorizations concerning 76 Cedar Cliff Road and 283 Ocean Terrace(13:29)
for the adoption of calendar numbers 14 15 16 and 17 Check(13:37)
rodnick Yes commissioner Benjamin hi commissioner suu yes commissioner crw(13:42)
yes commissioner dock yes commissioner gold yes commissioner Goodridge yes and I(13:49)
also vote Yes for the Brownsville art center and the 8808 Justice Avenue restrictive declaration thank *thank you*(13:56)
uh commissioner kman yes commissioner M yes commissioner oio yes commissioner R(14:01)
prashad yes calendar numbers 14 15 16 and 17 have been(14:07)
adopted R Island calendar numbers 18 and 19 calendar number 18 n 24119(14:14)
CCR cd2 18 Ken Avenue calendar number 19 N(14:19)
2465 zcr uh cd1 13 Glennwood Avenue and(14:24)
the matter of applications for the grant of certifications concerning 18 K Avenue in 113 Glennwood Avenue for the adoption(14:32)
of calendar numbers 18 and 19 chck grodnik v i and I will note um we do(14:38)
appear to have a oh the microphone is on okay thought maybe that we lost them for a moment several mics are off just to so(14:45)
for the benefit of those behind the scenes uh and we just want to make sure that we are properly recording and and(14:51)
able to be heard but I vote I and we'll just alert okay maybe we're back I sure yes(14:59)
commissioner Benjamin I I work commissioner suro(15:08)
yes commissioner crwl yes commissioner jock yes and this mic(15:14)
is out okay commissioner gold yes hopefully(15:20)
my mic's working yeah commissioner Goodridge yes(15:26)
commissioner kman yes commissioner M yes commissioner oio yes commissioner R yes

(2:55:15)

Citywide calendar numbers 30 and 31 city of yes for Economic Opportunity(2:55:21)
n2410 z r y calendar number 30 calendar number 31(2:55:26)
n2400 11 z r y public Hearing in the matter of applications for zoning text(2:55:31)
amendments concerning city of yes for Economic Opportunity and city of yes for econom
Economic Opportunity in(2:55:37)

Matt Waskiewicz

districts great *thank you* very much on behalf of the applicant here uh we have(2:55:43)
the department of City Planning and Matt whitz Matt welcome and uh *thank you* for all of your work today and we know(2:55:48)
you've run through all this with the Commission in great detail uh on Monday(2:55:54)

but you can give us a quick quick overview here to kick us off and then we'll go directly to public comments(2:55:59)

thank you sure *thank you* good afternoon Commissioners good to see you again and for everyone gathered here this(2:56:06)
afternoon *my name* is Matt Levitz I am the project manager of of this application and I have 10 minutes of(2:56:12)
presentation I'm going to keep it snap happy so that we can have time for getting right to public(2:56:20)
testimony C EVS for Economic Opportunity is the second in sequence of Citywide reforms to our zoning resolution and the(2:56:28)
journey that led us to this moment coming out of the pandemic our city saw unprecedented shocks to both our economy(2:56:35)
in addition to the Public Health crisis and we at the department of City Planning were engaged in trying to(2:56:41)
understand the ways that businesses were adapting to rapidly changing economic conditions so we were speaking with(2:56:46)
organizations and businesses trying to navigate a change in rules and(2:56:51)
discovering often times zoning was getting in the way of that adaptation and so over the last year and a half we've been busy at work
meeting with(2:56:58)
well over 100 different organizations trying to understand way zoning was getting in the way of establishing or expanding business at the
same time(2:57:04)
speaking with members of the public through information sessions through every means we could uh to understand(2:57:10)
and balance the the need for addressing regulations for small business with the need to protect quality of life for New(2:57:16)
Yorkers so the proposals here today are a result of that iterative process four goals for the work first(2:57:23)
making it easier for businesses to find space and grow second boosting growing(2:57:28)
Industries emerging business types third enabling more business-friendly streetscapes and fourth and finally(2:57:34)
creating new opportunities for businesses to open there are 18 components within the city of yes for(2:57:40)
Economic Opportunity I will only refer to these at the highest of level of detail but for anyone who's interested(2:57:46)
in learning more on our website nyc.gov yes Economic(2:57:52)
Opportunity goal number one we want to make it easier for businesses to find space and grow lifting zoning barriers(2:57:58)
so our businesses can locate closer to their customers because in most cases our zoning rules governing businesses(2:58:03)
have not been updated since the early 60s and it's long past due to make sure that our zoning reflects to and responds(2:58:09)
to today's economy so our first proposals do exactly that making our zoning more simple more adaptable and(2:58:15)
more modern so businesses can more easily locate and grow so proposal one(2:58:20)
today storefronts deemed non-conforming they face an arbitrary two-year time clock in many areas or else they have to(2:58:26)
remain vacant so we want to remove that time clock so vacant stence can become reoccupied proposal two many places of(2:58:33)
our city we have different zoning districts located along the same Corridor even on opposite sides of the(2:58:39)
street and so they allow for different kinds of businesses we want to simplify the differences between similar zoning(2:58:45)
districts and make it easier for businesses to know where they can go and what they can do proposal three despite(2:58:51)
changes in technology in a vastly different economy today our zoning rules treat many kinds of small production(2:58:57)
businesses like they're the same as those from the mid-century in large factory settings we want to allow for(2:59:04)

production businesses that are clean and quiet such as a Pottery Studio Bakery coffee roaster jewelry maker apparel(2:59:10) designer 3D printer and the like to locate in empty offices or storefront proposal four if one of the businesses I(2:59:16) just mentioned wanted to move into an upper floor of an office building today they would face zoning rules that may(2:59:22) require them to add additional loading even if they don't need it even if the building can't physically accommodate it(2:59:27) so we want to address and allow for buildings to adapt over time proposal(2:59:32)

five today zoning allows for many buildings to have a mix of residential and Commercial uses but our zoning(2:59:38) sometimes restricts the the order in which these uses can locate on upper floors we want to enable Renovations or(2:59:45) new construction of mixed use buildings in places where it makes sense uh provided that we have complete separation between uses and that these(2:59:52)

safeguards for S sound mitigation are maintained proposal six our zoning hasn't updated terms to classify(2:59:59) businesses in more than 60 years so it's full of things like typewriter repair and Taxidermy we want to update the(3:00:04) terms we use for our businesses to make it clear on where you can locate what you can do goal number two we want to(3:00:11) boost growing industries by reducing obstacles for emerging business types so proposal seven businesses that want to(3:00:17) operate indoor agriculture today face uh confusion around uh today's zoning rules(3:00:23)

so if you want to have a vertical Farm we want to clarify that indoor agriculture is allowed in commercial(3:00:28) districts some more food can be gr grown closer to communities proposal eight Life Sciences Laboratories face outdated(3:00:35) and confusing terminology that can slow the development of new facilities we would make it clear that Labs without(3:00:41) the potential for environmental hazards are appropriate in office settings and we'd expand where an existing special(3:00:46) permit could be used so Laboratories might be able to locate in the future closer to research centers like(3:00:52) hospitals and universities proposal nine in any bar or restaurant in the city today you can have live music such as a(3:00:58) concert so long as you're under 200 people but often times the zoning prohibits you from being able to dance to that music or having Live Comedy or(3:01:05)

Open Mic nights in the same space we're simplifying the rules so that music dancing and comedy are all treated the(3:01:11) same way in zoning while removing the last parts of the discriminatory Cabaret laws that prohibited the AC of dancing(3:01:16) in many places proposal 10 zoning has outdated terms for experiential retail(3:01:22)

businesses like virtual reality or children's arcades and often restricts these businesses to places like Coney(3:01:28) Island in the city's industrial areas so we would simplify and modernize how zoning treats amusement and recreational(3:01:34) activities make it clear these businesses are allowed indoors and at a small scale along neighborhood streets and at a larger scale in office(3:01:40)

districts proposal 11 many New Yorkers start their business in the home zoning allows for a wide range of homebased(3:01:46) business activity today but the pandemic changed Town New Yorkers work from home and Zoning has not kept up prohibits(3:01:52) specific occupations like Barbers or interior decorators and many other kinds of restrictions that hold back business(3:01:57) creation entrepreneurship we're proposing to enable that entrepreneurship with modern rules while keeping in place safeguards to ensure(3:02:03)

that home occupations are not creating a nuisance goal number three is about(3:02:09) enabling more business-friendly streetscapes we know that economic vibrancy is just what occurs within a building but how that business interacts(3:02:16)

with its surroundings so these three proposals are focused on ensuring that businesses contribute to Active safe and(3:02:21) walkable streets proposal 12 in many parts of the city you either have inconsistent or completely absent rules(3:02:29) around ground floor design so we're proposing a more consistent easy to understand understand Baseline set of(3:02:35) rules ones that are more responsive in areas with more pedestrian activity less responsive or more relaxed in the city's(3:02:41) Auto oriented corridors proposal auto repair businesses typically considered um industrial and located in(3:02:49) industrial areas but there's some forms of auto repair that are allowed today in commercial areas as of right sometimes(3:02:56) this results in activity spilling out into the sidewalk and into the street and it can create conflicts with others(3:03:01) so we're addressing this through uh creating a board of standards and appeals site review process for any kind(3:03:08) of auto repair use that would seek to locate in a commercial area sorry one more(3:03:14)

um proposal 14 you can have a post office in every neighborhood but unless you're the federal government you can't(3:03:19) do the same kind of parcel pickup and delivery within buildings except in industrial areas this often forces the(3:03:25) activity onto sidewalks and streets leads to more traffic congestion both in the area where the delivery occurs but(3:03:31)

also in the industrial areas where the packages typically originate so we're proposing to create a new kind of use in our zoning called micro distribution(3:03:37)

facilities and allow these in a small scale in commercial areas goal four is about new new(3:03:43)

opportunities for businesses to open so these are all kinds of zoning tools that go through a public review process and(3:03:49)

can update our zoning toolkit for future job growth and the economic success of our city proposal 15 many large-scale(3:03:56)

residential developments our zone is residence districts meaning that retail services and maker space cannot easily(3:04:02)

locate and it places residents of these developments further from local goods and services and access to many kinds of(3:04:08)

entrepreneurial space so this proposal creates a CPC authorization to allow for a limited amount of commercial space in(3:04:14)

underused officer storage areas and a large scale residential campus could give residents greater access to B(3:04:21)

Necessities or space to grow a new business proposal 16 portions of the city that are not within walking(3:04:27)

distance of a local store oftentimes zoning has no Pathways to potentially consider uh on a case-by Case basis new(3:04:34)

locally serving businesses so we're creating a public review pathway CPC authorization where a business could(3:04:40)

initiate a process to consider locating a small small store on the corner of an intersection provided that that(3:04:46)

commercial use does not generate any environmental concerns or traffic congestion proposal 17 businesses often(3:04:53)

lack options for waving or addressing non-c density and use related zoning(3:04:58)

rules for example film studios often struggle to build sound stages because of certain rules that that limit the(3:05:05)

shape of their building or a clothing store I want to occupy an empty uh storefront *next* door but finds that size(3:05:11)

limitations in the zoning prevent them from doing so so we're expanding our zoning toolkit so businesses could initiate a waiver process on a case-by(3:05:19)

Case basis and proposal 18 lastly in some instances it's our zoning districts not(3:05:25)

Pathways to modify them that are obsolete this is particularly true of our City's manufacturing or M zoning(3:05:30)

designations and so this proposal creates a range of new job intensive zoning districts at a range of densities(3:05:36)

and Heights to expand our zoning toolkit for future job hopes so I will close now uh with a bit(3:05:43)

of an update on our public review process so far so since we referred on October 30th we've been out to 158(3:05:50)

Community boards on this prop community board meetings on this proposal we've met multiple times at or at least once(3:05:55)

with all 59 Community boards because of the complexity of this proposal I'll note we're giving boards additional time(3:06:01)

to evaluate the zoning changes and recommendations uh offered up for your consideration so as of today we've had(3:06:08)

35 boards that have voted on a resolution and most are providing us with detailed feed back on all of the 18(3:06:14)

components not just the overall package of reforms I'll also note we have recently received um conditional(3:06:20)

approval from the Queens uh Brooklyn and Bronx borough presidents as well as the(3:06:28)

Manhattan borough board and so this concludes my presentation I am 12 seconds over but I'll yield my time(3:06:33)

thank you we'll forgive you but *thank you* uh very much Matt and I will uh again *thank you* for what was the number(3:06:40)

uh that you said of the number of uh visits to community board 158 meetings(3:06:45)

as of last night yeah okay well I had cited a lower number even in my opening remark so uh I wasn't um as up to date(3:06:53)

but that obviously was an extraord extraordinary amount of work and deliberate on behalf of the department obviously because we know that this is a(3:07:00)

complicated proposal and we know that when we as a department try to do big things uh the process requires require(3:07:06)

us to send a lot of text to community board so we're very sensitive to that and so uh 158 meetings is reflective of(3:07:13)

the amount of care and attention that the department uh intended to make uh in this process and of course as you just(3:07:20)

noted we all we also are continuing to receive community board um and burrow(3:07:25)

board and borough president recommendations um that the the typical time frame is today as the as the(3:07:33)

deadline but we're we are going to continue to to receive them we don't want anybody to feel like they're(3:07:38)

unnecessarily uh on a uh a strict uh clock but we obviously appreciate every(3:07:44)

board uh that has grappled with these topics and have uh weighed in in in any(3:07:51)

form we we we we appreciate it because we know well I've spent enough time on or around Community boards to know how(3:07:57)

hard this stuff is so we thank them uh no matter where they uh they came out on the subject and thanks to you too Matt(3:08:04)

um okay we're going to go to uh to the public uh let us uh move first we again(3:08:09)

traditionally we go to um nose and then the yeses Nos and yeses um and so we're(3:08:16)

going to start with

Susan Nile

I believe uh

commissioner Sor

do you have a comment yes you have a did you have a(3:08:21)
question go ahead Matt you may come back commissioner go ahead uh *thank you* chair(3:08:26)
and and *thank you* again for uh the the the presentation and addressing our comments both at the review session um(3:08:33)
at the review session I I raised a series of questions and potential recommendations regarding the process(3:08:39)
now I wanted to just uh also State a couple questions associated with kind of like some of the substance behind the(3:08:45)
proposed them districts and so I was wondering if you can further explain(3:08:50)
sort of like in in your rationale uh for the core industrial uh whether there's a(3:08:56)
possibility to clearly you're you're creating an F sort of like um a system to to be able to expand uh density but(3:09:03)
I'm wondering if it's if you've considered the the need or the opportunity to cap the square footage of(3:09:10)
non-industrial uses that's the first question the second question that I have has to do with the transitional(3:09:16)
districts I I'm I'm a little concerned in terms of you know what exactly are they transitioning too and so in that(3:09:22)
regard I want to I was wondering if again there could be clearer standards uh given also the limitations of the(3:09:28)
enforcement of you know the new a uses to be incorporated here which clearly(3:09:33)
you know go beyond the jurisdiction of the Department of City Planning I'm wondering if if there is if you've(3:09:40)
identified or would consider a clear opportunity ities to establish what the minimum amount of light industrial or(3:09:46)
industrial would be number one and number two in places where the developer(3:09:52)
has tried but has not been able to find tenants to meet the industrial(3:09:58)
requirement whether in the zoning resolution we could include guidelines as to how to(3:10:04)
demonstrate hardship whether BSA like uh(3:10:09)
requirements could be in place so that we all can AG ree in terms of like what are what are the minimum amount of what(3:10:16)
is the minimum amount of planning that needs to happen and also how can the developer facilitate uh the lease or the(3:10:22)
or the recruitment of those industrial tenants and then finally in terms of the growth districts I I just want to(3:10:28)
understand from your end why do we really need them in my mind from your(3:10:34)
presentation and from the materials that you shared it sounds to me that between the transitional districts and the core(3:10:41)
districts we we would be allowing the goals that you've stated yet the growth(3:10:47)
District in my mind again lend themselves to having a scenario with no industrial tenants and so why would we(3:10:54)
have proposed manufacturing districts without industrial so those are additional questions if you want to(3:11:00)
address them now here if not anything you can share with us later that would be fine sure I'll I'll start and then I(3:11:06)
might hand things over to Carolyn and definitely want to continue this conversation with you commissioner um I'll I'll start with the growth
and kind(3:11:12)
of describe the rationale and we recognized uh in many different kinds of ways the existing M1 district is is(3:11:20)
challenging to say the least it's based on a rationale that at the time most(3:11:25)
manufacturing and production in the future would be focused in low slung large scale Factory type settings in(3:11:32)
more Suburban type environments and the zoning reflects that in the way that it forces you to set back towards the center in the limits of
intermediate F(3:11:41)
options and so we started this process recognizing first and foremost we need an updated version of an M1 District um(3:11:48)
particularly one that has the ability as we've seen in the past to have uh mixed use settings where we have the ability(3:11:55)

for residential to be paired with with industrial uses so that was kind of the starting place and we were speaking a(3:12:02)
lot with folks who do industrial work Industrial Service Providers and uh as(3:12:07)
well as council members from primarily industrial areas and uh heard loud and(3:12:13)
clear the need for a wider range of tools we were working with them and understanding what kinds of tools are needed uh we settled on
similar(3:12:20)
terminology to what was used in a North Brooklyn industry study a few years back on having a core District a transition(3:12:27)
District uh which is meant for transitional areas and me and then a gross District um but really what we're(3:12:34)
seeing is updated Suites of an M3 heavy industrial district an M2 through medium(3:12:41)
uh industrial district and update of an M1 light industrial district and we see the use case for all these three working(3:12:47)
in tandem but also um having very particular and very useful use cases so(3:12:53)
with the growth we see this as being appropriate for areas where we see the the potential both for continued(3:13:00)
industrial space but also for the potential of residences particularly areas that are very close to Transit(3:13:05)
areas that have the potential for higher densities um for the transition District we see this as an opportunity to kind of(3:13:11)
put our thumbs on the scale a little bit and say we want to guarantee the building of space that's guaranteed for(3:13:17)
industrial users and recognize that in many instances and especially if you look to other cities across the country(3:13:24)
there's not a lot of new kinds of industrial space being built so this is our are design to try and create uh(3:13:32)
space that can have a wide range of users But ultimately lead to the creation of new guaranteed industrial(3:13:37)
space and then lastly the core we recognize that there are many areas and some areas that we want to especially(3:13:43)
make sure there is not transformation of of the existing businesses there are some businesses particularly ones um(3:13:51)
close to other kinds of uh say industrial access whether that's(3:13:56)
Maritime or uh you have kinds of businesses that the city needs to function simply put uh and so in in(3:14:03)
areas where we're looking at at that kind of heavy industry we want to make sure that we have a core District that(3:14:09)
reflects that and for the first time a type of zoning tool that restricts the F of non-industrial users I'll stop there(3:14:16)
Caroline is there anything you would like to add but I also recognize this is a much longer(3:14:22)
conversation thanks Matt thanks commissioner um I'll only add that the existing M districts do not require uh(3:14:30)
industrial uses it's not um Our intention um as part and and in general(3:14:36)
I think the city of yes is really looking at creating more flexibility for um for business outcomes so it is not(3:14:42)
our intention to obligate somebody to build an industrial outcome as Matt(3:14:48)
described We Are For the First Time creating tools that preserve industrial(3:14:53)
on the grounds today or incentivize guaranteed industrial space as a way to(3:14:58)
try and encourage that outcome but that's our overall goal and why we're creating those different tools as we(3:15:03)
discussed on Monday and we'll continue to to to uh work with you um we do believe there's a role here for Citywide(3:15:10)
planning to think about over all the city's reservoir of industrial space and where we may need to apply preservation(3:15:17)
tools or incentivize more industrial space to be created where we can um help(3:15:23)
to uh to encourage that outcome it's not our intention for individual sites to(3:15:28)
require that the uh industrial space to be created um so we'll be looking forward thinking about that application(3:15:35)
but that's the um based on the underlying allowance for um a wide range(3:15:40)
of uses today the growth is built on that and transition and core are creating new um ways to incentivize or(3:15:48)
restrict *thank you* Carolyn do you want to make a final final statement then we'll get to the public because we want to yeah *thank you* no I I
don't mean to(3:15:54)
do this right now I'm just I just want but I just want to say that I I I would love the opportunity to actually discuss(3:15:59)
some of those substantive responses because there are specific aspects of what you said that I I think we we don't(3:16:05)
know or we can't anticipate or fully flesh out without having done the impact anal assessment that we should have if(3:16:12)
those districts had been mapped I understand that you know we don't have time right now to get into that but I would love and I'll just clarify
again(3:16:19)
that the it is the nature of them not being mapped that does not require us to do an environmental review at this point(3:16:26)
and so we that the an analysis was done you know robustly under the guidance of(3:16:32)
the secr tech manual um any future actions where we utilize those districts(3:16:37)
will of course require additional environmental review and that's consistent with um you know precedent(3:16:43)

not just by this agency but anyone under Seeker standards yes but regardless of whether they were mapped or not the(3:16:50)
transitional District specifically uh creates an additional a pressure on the(3:16:58)
M3s because it you would expect that as some manufacturing areas begin to(3:17:04)
receive other uses you could be having uh an impact an environmental justice impact if the concentration of noxious(3:17:11)
uses further conc Tres in the M3s *thank you* hold the response for a moment let(3:17:16)
me just note that we have to get to the public uh and there will be plenty of opportunity for followup with the agency(3:17:22)
and of course no pressures are created because nothing has been mapped yet so these are just tools that at some point(3:17:29)
when it is proposed by somebody that is the that's a good time for us to have this detailed engagement because(3:17:35)
obviously there our concerns about whatever the tool you know how the tool is used and the council has passed(3:17:41)
legislation which encourages us and requires us to think about broader industrial policy which I think is very(3:17:47)
much the core of what you're you're getting at commissioner but I think we should we should follow up and and address these concerns and
continue to(3:17:53)
have this conversation but I do want to get to public testimony uh yes no and everywhere in between that's okay with(3:18:00)
you carolyn I jumped in on your answer but I just want to make sure absolutely we'll have every opportunity both here(3:18:05)
and in future applications to continue to consider those issues *thank you* okay *thank you* commissioner okay now let's go(3:18:11)
to the first group which is in opposition to the proposals starting with

Susan Nile

and followed by Agnes(3:18:19)
vanina uh both remote(3:18:30)
great Susan you should be able to turn on your microphone and(3:18:38)
Camera okay sorry yes I have now done that so again hello good afternoon my(3:18:46)
name is Susan Nile and I've owned property in New York for over 25 years and have been involved in land use(3:18:52)
issues for about that long I also a licensed lawyer to practice in the C state of New York it has been said that(3:19:00)
the choicest function of government is to protect the weak from the unrighteous acts of the strong in this context the(3:19:08)
residents of the city of New York are the weak and in my opinion the government of the city of New York is(3:19:14)
failing the residents no matter what their race national origin gender religion or economic status is well(3:19:23)
there's been a lot of discussion about public engagement here and in fact we've just heard about it I've been to some of(3:19:28)
those uh engagement meetings and quite frankly they are nothing but tokenism(3:19:34)
meetings uh where the listeners the city Representatives Fain interest in what(3:19:40)
the public has to say basically the comment was made if you oppose the changes you don't understand(3:19:46)
them I'm not going to spend a lot of time on the intricacies of this this(3:19:52)
proposal because there's a lot of them but I will say these things deregulation(3:19:57)
is not I mean modernization is not the name of the game the name of the game is(3:20:02)
deregulation so residents will have to rely on the good offices of the persons(3:20:08)
who benefit corporations and others uh to do the right thing that is highly unlikely the purpose of(3:20:15)
zoning is to separate uses that are IM inimicable to residential use that is(3:20:21)
not going to happen here because those protections going to be stripped out of this(3:20:27)
proposal 311 is pointed to is the way that residents will be able to deal with that issue 311 is overburdened already(3:20:34)
as are the agencies who respond to 311 over 20% of the of the proposal here uh has(3:20:44)
been estimated to exclude not just the public but the city council this is(3:20:51)
unacceptable The Proposal will allow expansion of commercial interest into(3:20:56)
residential areas thus conflicting with our need for for housing I see my time(3:21:02)
is running so I will finish with this the city of yes does not say yes to(3:21:08)
Residents it means yes to corporate interests it means yes to developers(3:21:14)

although I have little hope that the department of planning tasked by the mayor to push these changes through will(3:21:19)
consider these problems I urge the CPC to reject these proposals and reject(3:21:25)
them soundly *thank you* so much *thank you* very much Miss n *thank yo*

u for being with us let me move on to(3:21:31)

Agnes Vina

followed by yatin(3:21:40)

Chu(3:21:47)

Agnes you should be able to unmute your phone yes(3:21:52)

hello hello we can hear you okay great *my name* is Agnes V I'm vice president of(3:21:59)

Oakwood civic association on Staten irland and my topic today is about marijuana and cannabis products in the(3:22:06)

city of yes economic plan I read through the 40 page zoning text dimensions uh(3:22:12)

project descriptions and I want to refer to page 37 regarding uh the corner(3:22:18)

stores allowed in our residential neighborhoods and page 10 which speaks to Urban agriculture which includes(3:22:25)

vertical planting and hydroponic cultivation now uh these agricultural(3:22:31)

means are also a method for cannabis to uh grow and harvest cannabis indoors(3:22:38)

during the public meetings which many of us have attended here on stat I city of yes and zoom meetings um with planning(3:22:45)

um Department of City Planning staff spoke to us about these corner stores and housing mainly bakeries and pottery(3:22:53)

shops but they failed to speak about marijuana stores and the growth and cultivation of marijuana in these small(3:23:01)

corner stores or in the res or the apartment rentals above the(3:23:06)

store we were told yes I understand it's the state regulated but we were told yes(3:23:12)

they these owners business owners can apply to New York State Office of(3:23:18)

cannabis for licenses to sell um(3:23:23)

marijuana uh also uh I know it's still a federal it's(3:23:29)

still federally illegal we know that it's legal in New York state but the DEA(3:23:34)

still LS it as the schedule one controlled substance because of the potential for abuse so these corner(3:23:42)

stores which we proposed are going to be on our residential streets in our neighborhoods where our children are work uh playing and(3:23:50)

outside uh so we were told by City Planning that the word marijuana was not(3:23:56)

used in the text proposals and not to confuse anybody but I would say we are not(3:24:03)

confused many of us have scientific backgrounds we have backgrounds in medicine nursing pharmacology and we(3:24:10)

have a broad space of knowledge and experience and we'll make we're making our own decisions based upon that and we(3:24:17)

are not in agreement with the city of yes economic proposals we are opposed to(3:24:23)

them our goals are different from the business owners's goals their goals are(3:24:29)

profit and it's different from the politicians goals their goals are also profit too and the fact that they(3:24:36)

can collect tax revenue and use it for their own political purposes by taxing(3:24:42)

marijuana but we want out our main goals are the safety of our residents who live in our community and(3:24:49)

particularly our children they should not be exposed to a drug culture or the(3:24:55)

odor of marijuana or plants or or anything like that it is har(3:25:00)

so would like this New York City Planning RP it because of the problem(3:25:06)

with creating a drug environment *thank you thank you* Miss Vina we appreciate(3:25:12)

your you're being with us so we understand the concern that you are raising let's move on to yatin Chu uh to(3:25:17)

be followed by George(3:25:32)

James hello there can you hear me we certainly can welcome uh *thank you* for(3:25:38)
the opportunity to speak uh *my name* is yatan Chu I'm am the President of Asian wave Alliance Northeast Queens is where(3:25:45)
I call home I strongly oppose the city of yes Economic Opportunity proposals(3:25:50)
this is a massive deregulation plan that takes a sledgehammer approach to what must be community-driven I love New York(3:25:58)
City but the reason why I choose to live and raise my children in Northeast Queens is because it provides the(3:26:03)
quality of life that I want for my family the 18 actions proposed will destroy everything I love about the low(3:26:09)
density owner occupy residences in my part of Queens having lived down the(3:26:15)
block from an auto repair shop I've suffered the consequences of what it's like cars and queue for repairs line the(3:26:22)
block rotating in one broken car for another they treat the entire block as if it's their own parking garage and(3:26:28)
block residents from parking our cars auto repair shops should have no place on residential streets street parking is(3:26:36)
a huge challenge everywhere even in residential areas with installation of bike Lanes everywhere throughout(3:26:41)
throughout the city the parking situation has gotten worse permitting more commercial activities in homes(3:26:47)
upper floors indoor Farms will bring more traffic more cars onto residential areas that we have no space for foot(3:26:54)
traffic and use of homes for more business cannot be supported on mass these homes and infrastructure were(3:27:00)
built over a hundred years ago sewage Plumbing electrical supports were designed for families and residential(3:27:06)
usage we do not have the structures to support anything else we incur the inconen venience of living and(3:27:12)
transportation deserts to have this quality of life we rather drive a block or two or walk a bit to the Village(3:27:18)
strip for Commercial Services entertainment and convenience shops we do not want bodegas built on every(3:27:24)
corner of our residential streets the car and foot traffic Corner commercial stores will destroy the feel of our(3:27:31)
quiet residential blocks I strongly oppose the city of yes Economic Opportunity proposal it is an awful(3:27:38)
one-size fits-all plan for the entire city it will destroy destroy my neighborhood and my community thank(3:27:45)
you *thank you* very much uh Miss Chu uh we appreciate it um I will note(3:27:52)
obviously I I strongly disagree with your characterization that it would uh destroy anything but we'll we will put(3:27:58)
that aside for the moment um but I do want to draw your attention to the fact that the auto usage that you express(3:28:03)
concerned about is something we actually are trying to address in this proposal so I would encourage you to uh to take a(3:28:09)
look at how we have um tried to further restrict Auto uses on Commercial uh streets uh and of(3:28:17)
course corner stores which you noted would result in bodegas and every block of course does not actually uh do that(3:28:23)
it it creates a possibility for a bodega in a location at a time uh which is(3:28:29)
prohibited in so many areas of the city today so anyway we appreciate your testimony but I did want to just do some(3:28:35)
uh real time factchecking on on the proposal itself let's move on uh to George Janes to be followed by Megan uh(3:28:57)
Fitzpatrick he there okay George you should be seeing a popup(3:29:05)
on your screen accepting a promotion to app there we go(3:29:21)
may just be taking a moment to uh(3:29:40)
promote(3:29:51)
George we see you in the panelist column now you should be able to(3:30:10)
unmute(3:30:15)

hello *my name* is

George James

I'm an urban planner uh and these views are my(3:30:20)
own um the text amendment is a mixed bag uh there's some great stuff in here uh the improvements to the uses and use(3:30:27)
groups are long overdue the reorganization of the special permits is great um and loading requirement(3:30:33)
category that's a great idea but it's not all good and there are some obvious(3:30:39)
mistakes uh it's clear that the Special Districts were thrown in at the end with almost no review the special Governor(3:30:46)

Island dist Governor's Island districts still refers to use groups 16 17 and 18(3:30:52)
even though they're supposed to be obsolete the map for the special Soho noo district is unchanged even though it(3:30:59)
refers to a section which is deleted and the map itself uh no longer clearly works for the state purpose it all needs(3:31:06)
a very close read more serious are other prop proposals that in my opinion can(3:31:12)
only be considered bad planning for instance we are looking at looking to(3:31:18)
allow enclosed agricultural uses in residential districts which sounds(3:31:23)
innocuous but the agricultural buildings use Community facility bulk reg(3:31:29)
regulations which often provide preferential FS you could even do a(3:31:34)
community facility Tower in an r72 or in an R8 District if you believe that the(3:31:39)
city is in a housing crisis why on Earth would we want agricultural uses to compete with housing honestly I(3:31:46)
thought this was another error but DCP has defended it it makes no sense the(3:31:52)
authors of this amendment also seem to misunderstand the purpose of C1 and C2 districts these districts exist to(3:31:59)
provide goods and services to Neighborhood residents The Proposal will allow most(3:32:05)
manufacturing to occupy these spaces gcp has said that this is for bakeries and(3:32:11)
pubs which of course would be fine but that's not how the zoning is written there is no requirement for an accessory(3:32:18)
retail component the manufacturing use can be closed to the public and make goods for another Community this is(3:32:25)
serious in communities where the rents are the lowest if we open these spaces to manufacturing uses that don't serve(3:32:32)
the community and they push out neighborhood commercial uses where are folks going to shop get their haircut do(3:32:39)
their laundry further think about what makes vital and active commerci Urban(3:32:44)
streets commercial activity is important manufacturing uses that don't serve the(3:32:50)
community have the potential to deaden the streets Rob them of foot traffic and harm the remaining commercial uses why(3:32:57)
do we want that again it seems like a mistake but it's not now I'll be(3:33:02)
submitting detailed written comments and I encourage the commission and DCP to make improvements and Corrections before(3:33:09)
this gets to City CC *thank you thank you* very much Mr James we appreciate it we'll look forward to(3:33:15)
receiving that from you uh let's move on to

Megan Fitz Patrick of landmark 3:33:27 West on(3:33:33)

Zoom hello Commissioners Megan Fitzpatrick speaking on behalf of Imar West Imar West is an upper west Side(3:33:41)
neighborhood historic preservation nonprofit and we advocate for sensible Community focused land use and Zoning of(3:33:48)
the massive 1,127 pages of zoning text some of the proposal addresses long outdated zoning(3:33:55)
unfortunately the proposed changes don't stop there at its worst they show a blatant attempt to forsake the community(3:34:02)
and flout the city's zoning regulations in favor of business interests the(3:34:07)
expansion of commercial activity into Residential Building is not only harmful to housing in a housing crisis but will(3:34:14)
have a negative effect on the community increased commercial uses on upper floors of mixed buildings is(3:34:19)
unacceptable any commercial use such as bars will be permitted to operate on upper floors and smaller businesses are(3:34:26)
entirely exempt from all environmental standards the size or capacity of an establishment should not matter only how(3:34:33)
much of an impact it will make on its surroundings there are a few M districts on the upper west side but this proposal(3:34:39)
will allow most manufacturing uses to be located in any commercial District including neighborhood commercial(3:34:45)
districts under the existing zoning manufacturing uses don't have to be open to the public we want to ensure this(3:34:51)
proposal will serve the community and specify that products made on site must be sold on site so as not to impinge on(3:34:59)
the community's quality of life and suffocate other businesses with this proposal manufacturing Agricultural and(3:35:05)
Commercial uses will bleed into residential zones and cover more space ultimately AI pushing out residents(3:35:12)
lately the finger has been P pointed at preservation for exasperating the current housing crisis we wholeheartedly(3:35:19)
disagree and can't help thinking these proposals are single-handedly causing more harm to the current housing crisis(3:35:25)
by making existing housing less livable and shering housing in favor of business(3:35:31)
interests it is frustrating that all city of yes proposals function independently and sometimes at odds with(3:35:37)
direct housing production proposing to introdu all introduce all types of nightclubs in every commercial district(3:35:44)
will prove disastrous for the livability of mixed zoning districts expanding(3:35:49)

amusements into districts could be transformative for the city and not for the better city of yes will also(3:35:55)
eliminate most of the custom rules made for Manhattan Special zoning districts which were designed to encourage the(3:36:01)
retention of smallscale retail to keep big establishments like banks at Bay the(3:36:06)
sum total of these proposals seek to dismantle Decades of zoning that while Siz has adapted to the unique character(3:36:12)
of New York and its neighborhoods abolishing them in one Fell Swoop such as this will not only harm each(3:36:19)
neighborhood but will create a city of sameness in total opposition to the very qualities that make New York New York(3:36:26)
thank you very much *thank you* M for Fitzpatrick we appreciate you being with us um I'm(3:36:32)
going to go on to uh NOA anari and Ronda whis both from Friends of the upper Eide(3:36:38)
historic districts uh signed up to testify in favor of the proposal let me just note(3:36:44)
um that just one point that the proposal doesn't lessen any environmental standards either through zoning as we(3:36:52)
talked about on Monday um or through the many other(3:36:57)
regulations that currently exist including buildings own rules uh to protect the public here so there are(3:37:03)
protections that are in place we do not change those protections um okay let us move on and uh welcome(3:37:10)

up um ne **wa anari**

and

Ronda whis *next* on Zoom

(3:37:16)

although I believe I saw them here earlier okay chair G rodnik honorable(3:37:22)

Commissioners I think actually Ronda is not in the room any longer but we will be submitting written testimony as well(3:37:29)

from friends so I'm speaking on behalf of friends of the Upper East Side historic districts where an organization(3:37:36)

founded in 1982 dedicated to preserving the architectural Legacy livability and(3:37:41)

sense of place of the upper e side friend strongly agrees with the Department of City Planning that local(3:37:48)

businesses are the lifeblood of our neighborhoods we also believe that for the city to become safer and livelier(3:37:55)

the three city of yes initiatives carbon neutrality Economic Opportunity and(3:38:00)

Housing Opportunity must complement each other we are hopeful that with today's(3:38:06)

hearing and follow-ups that City Planning will be able to trade in the current peacemeal approach for a(3:38:12)

comprehensive location-based proposal friends believes that many of these tweaks could have unintended con(3:38:20)

consequences the upper e side contains both historic districts and vast areas that are not protected by the landmarks(3:38:27)

law our comments refer to both areas first mixing of uses would seem on(3:38:34)

its face to conflict with the city's goal of increasing housing for example(3:38:39)

increasing home occup patient square footage as well as the number of employees could cause conflicts between(3:38:45)

residential and Commercial uses and reduce both the number of Apartments as well as the livability and safety within(3:38:52)

multiple dwellings in addition this this does nothing to revitalize streets and(3:38:58)

reduces the need for actual commercial spaces second allowing manufacturing(3:39:03)

uses to be located in neighborhood commercial districts does not serve local needs instead it calls for the(3:39:10)

city to really strengthen and support the few manufacturing districts that remain we also note that for decades the(3:39:17)

city has required commercial and Manufacturing uses to be located beneath residential uses two entrances will do(3:39:25)

little to resolve conflicts both of these proposals could also lead to more Apartments being converted to(3:39:31)

non-residential uses third micro distribution facilities(3:39:36)

have already been shown to have a delerious effect on Street escapes our sidewalks are already filled with Amazon(3:39:43)

boxes we question why the proposal encourages additional facilities fourth we are also concerned(3:39:51)

about nightclubs no one wants to live *next* to one because of the noise trash and crowds again we don't understand why(3:39:58)

this proposal removes restrictions and safeguards since we are all concerned about(3:40:04)

housing this proposal also includes changes to regulations covering commercial development on nit campuses(3:40:12)

we hope that the New Uses proposed will benefit nitar residents by incorporating(3:40:17)

the developments into the neighoring grids the Upper East Side like many(3:40:23)

areas in the five burrow suffers from a huge number of vacant storefronts if the city is truly interested in(3:40:29)

strengthening the commercial corridors which would also make our streets safer(3:40:34)
perhaps they should concentrate on a holistic approach that includes enacting commercial rent regul(3:40:41)
we are very glad that City Planning is taking this step and we hope that the proposal will will improve as a result(3:40:47)
of this process *thank you thank you* very much um *thank you* Miss Ansari and I um(3:40:54)
welcome any additional uh comments you wish to send in including from Miss Wist if she or any of your team wishes to(3:41:02)
send that in after the hearing um but my understanding is I should take her off the list she's not going to be coming(3:41:07)
back to testify is that correct yes that's right okay okay great *thank you*

very much um I'm going to call up I see(3:41:14)

um in the room I see

Rob Bookman!

<https://www.youtube.com/live/M26QL4yNSNA?si=mfW6GN3e01HzTvyk&t=13315>

uh and I have Howard slatkin coming up *next* let(3:41:21)

me just make one one point up Mr Bookman you can you can make your way up to the podium what one point that I think it's(3:41:26)

just worth worth noting uh for the benefit of the public because I think it's just frequently misunderstood is(3:41:32)

that mixing of uses is rather commonplace in our zoning resolution um(3:41:37)

you know you can do Residential and Commercial commercial areas you can do commercial and Manufacturing areas you(3:41:42)

can do home occupations today this is rather commonplace so the notion that there's the strict divisions that I(3:41:49)

think I'm you know I'm hearing is not really um that's not really the the way that the zoning resolution operat so(3:41:56)

I just wanted to make that point because it's an important one and worth worth noting Mr Bookman good to see you *thank you* for uh *thank you* for being here same(3:42:03)

same good to see many of you again

Rob Bookman!

<https://www.youtube.com/live/M26QL4yNSNA?si=mfW6GN3e01HzTvyk&t=13315>

My name is Robert Bookman. I am Counsel and(3:42:08), a founding member of the New York City Hospitality Alliance, the trade Association in the city representing(3:42:14) thousands of New York's bars lounges nightclubs located in all five boroughs.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify(3:42:20) in full support of the City of Yes zoning proposals, especially those that relate to entertainment and dancing and(3:42:26) eating and drinking venues.

I would also like to thank your staff. I think their outreach has been fantastic.

We are(3:42:32) we are thrilled with it, and those who know me know I'm rarely thrilled.

Small business is in crisis in New York(3:42:39) City Many and these proposals will help keep make small business(3:42:45) thrive again .

Dancing and entertainment is an issue near and dear to me that I have been intricately involved with for(3:42:50) over 30 years now, having represented multiple entertainment venues as well as the predecessor organizations going back(3:42:56) to the late 1980s.

Before that I was actually counsel at the New York City Department of Consumer Affairs when we (3:43:01) adopted the padlock law. I was the first lawyer going out padlocking large clubs because of the of the horrible(3:43:07) thing that they were dancing .

That enforcement morphed into a much more aggressive one in the Giuliani years when small neighborhood(3:43:14) bars and lounges, where people where moving rhythmically to music, including juke boxes, were cited and often closed. New(3:43:22) York City then truly became the town in footloose with a vibrant dance police,

The repeal of the outdated Cabaret Laws (3:43:28) under the DeBlasio Administration while a great step forward, did not do anything to allow dancing and a single additional(3:43:34) location, to the surprise of many small business owners around the city, because of zoning which prohibited dancing in (3:43:41) in many locations.

As an appointee to The Nightlife Advisory Board, I made sure this issue was raised and in fact one of(3:43:48) one of the recommendations of the Advisory Board was to liberalize zoning laws where so dancing could be had.

The (3:43:54) proposal before you therefore is long overdue and welcomed. Small businesses with a capacity of under 200 people(3:44:01) should not be prohibited from allowing people to get up and dance.

In fact 300 person capacity would be a better number(3:44:07) from our perspective, quite frankly. This is something that the industry has advocated for, as I have said, for decades(3:44:14).

There are many other building codes, fire safety codes, and noise codes to protect the public, without restricting(3:44:21) dancing.

Dancing in and of itself in a neighborhood bar on a Saturday night does nothing from a land use perspective(3:44:28).

It's these other laws which will still be in place noise laws, Etc., liquor laws which have Community Board review, which(3:44:35) will continue to protect residents

We've got to get out of the dance Police business.

There is one issue in the proposal(3:44:42) however, which we would otherwise support in its entirety with which we have concerns.

There are many restaurants and bars with a capacity over 200 in C1 and C 2 (3:44:50) districts that have what we call Accessory or incidental entertainment from time to time.

This could include things like a scheduled Friday Night (3:44:56) karaoke night or an advertised piano player or small band on a Saturday night (3:45:01).

We are concerned that under the current wording of the Proposal, these existing establishments will be prohibited from providing this (3:45:07) entertainment without going through the lengthy and expensive BSA process

[Question: okay wait you're out of time but let me just(3:45:13) understand that let me. Just finish that thought because if there's something you think we've introduced something(3:45:18) which creates a new obstacle for them.]

Bookman: Yes

Because if you I have a 201 person restaurant based on the current(3:45:25) reading of scheduled showtime, and I advertise Friday night is karaoke night(3:45:31), that could easily be interpreted down the road by a less friendly Administration or a less friendly Buildings Department as requiring a BSA (3:45:38) special permit. Hundreds of restaurants around the City do that now. It's incidental.

They are not music (3:45:44) clubs; they're not entertainment clubs. It's incidental. There should be some language to make it clear (3:45:50) that they don't have to go through the lengthy and expensive BSA process to continue doing what they've always been doing.

I know that the intent here is not (3:45:57) to make things more restrictive, but that in fact could very well result.

[okay got it thank you very much we appreciate it(3:46:03)
thank you for being here. It's great seeing many of you again thank you}

Not in definition of Accessory Use in 12-10

Howard slatkin

uh *next* up is Howard slatkin of the citizens housing and planning Council to(3:46:11)
be followed by Sandra Jaz on Zoom hello Howard Mr slatkin good(3:46:18)
to see you great to see you too um happy to be back uh good afternoon I think uh(3:46:26)
to CH grodnik and the Commissioners um uh I'm the executive director of citizens housing and planning Council a(3:46:33)
nonprofit organization which is dedicated to the well-being of the city's housing stock and the residents(3:46:38)
it serves one of the central land use lessons from the covid-19 pandemic is the importance(3:46:44)
of allowing space to be repurposed quickly and without unnecessary costs the city of yes for Economic Opportunity(3:46:51)
proposal tackles the daunting but important issue of rationalizing use regulations to make our business or(3:46:56)
sorry our buildings and our economy more Nimble it will give businesses greater Clarity and more options for where they(3:47:02)
can locate and make it easier for building owners to fill their spaces this proposal would also be beneficial(3:47:08)
to housing and to affordable housing ground floor commercial and Community facility spaces provide important(3:47:14)
Revenue to support the operations of residential buildings and their occupancy and the services they provide(3:47:21)
support the quality of life in neighborhoods when non-residential spaces can be retened quickly and without the need for a new certificate(3:47:27)
of occupancy residents also benefit from this when zoning becomes too prescriptive it can increase costs for(3:47:34)
doing business unaffordability and vacancy and other problems striking the right balance of flexibility and(3:47:41)
predictability is critical there are two areas in which the current proposal We Believe misses the mark on this balance(3:47:47)
and should be amended the streetscape requirements and the home occupation Provisions the proposed tier b(3:47:55)
streetcape regulations would dramatically expand mandates for ground floor non-residential uses in commercial districts and would create
unnecessary(3:48:02)
impediments for housing by doing so streetscape continuity is a desirable objective but it shouldn't impede our(3:48:08)
efforts to address more pressing priorities like the housing crisis I've reviewed an example of an affordable(3:48:13)
building currently in design uh this propos this building would need to create an isolated 20ft X 30ft(3:48:18)
storefront *next* to its parking entrance that the builders did not intend to build or operate this flows counter to(3:48:24)
one Central purpose of this proposal for space to be built and occupied in a way that's responsive to needs an affordable(3:48:31)
unit need to be eliminated parking relocated and mechanically ventilated at greater expense um there are also(3:48:37)
complexity issues with these regulations so we think that uh reducing the applicability of The Tib requirements(3:48:43)
reducing the requirement for 100% of non ground flow non idential use to 50% uh(3:48:49)
simplifying the applicability standards and making more flexibility for existing buildings would address this uh I want(3:48:55)
to touch briefly on some additional uh uh safeguards that we think are(3:49:01)
important for home occupations the home occupation Provisions that are proposed are by and large sound but the existing(3:49:06)
home occupation regulations restrict uses that would invite large numbers of customers into a residential building in(3:49:13)
order to help property managers address the potential for nuisances uh that disrupt the residential environment we(3:49:19)
think it's important to explicitly clarify that home occupations cannot use residential common areas such as(3:49:25)
hallways lobbies and stairwells for their operations I'm happy to answer any questions okay okay got it *thank you* um(3:49:32)
let me let me just ask one point of clarification then I'm going to go to commissioner Benjamin but *thank you* for that uh we take your your
points on(3:49:38)
streetscape hereb and also on the home occupation uh recommendation we will certainly look at that um you know we(3:49:45)
one of the things that we have heard um from some members of the public some(3:49:50)
Community boards is that allowing uh commercial above residential is an anti-(3:49:56)
housing um concept um do you or um chpc do you have(3:50:03)
any any view on that or how how should we be thinking about that well I think in general(3:50:10)
the the the concerns that I would have about conflicting with housing(3:50:15)
objectives would be where we require commercial instead of Housing and I think that the streetscape regulations(3:50:21)
are the only in instance where those where the regulations dip into that that territory being permissive of more(3:50:28)
flexibility and more options is generally going to be fine I think second floor commercial is so rarely uh(3:50:35)

an economically uh attractive use that I think it's going to be really limited(3:50:40)
the number of instances where there would be true competition there um certainly if there are instances where(3:50:47)
there is existing residential in a building on a second floor should that be allowed to convert to commercial(3:50:53)
that's an issue that I think the commission could look at more closely um it doesn't seem to be the objective I(3:50:59)
don't think anyone's proposing to try to convert Second Story residences to commercial space and it if that's not(3:51:05)
the goal of the proposal then it would seem uh harmless to not allow it under(3:51:11)
the proposal and I know that in uh several districts over the years where Second Story commercial was newly(3:51:16)
allowed it was allowed only in new buildings okay got it *thank you* very(3:51:22)
much commissioner Benjamin how are you it's good to see you um I'm interested in have a concern(3:51:30)
about whether we are reducing potentially the quality of life in our residential districts by allowing more(3:51:38)
and more intensive commercial uses um for instance you cited in the(3:51:44)
home occupations the current rules both restrict the number of employees the(3:51:50)
number of space and have a goal that the home(3:51:58)
occupation doesn't unduly affect the residential so(3:52:03)
it's a lower intensity use we are proposing it's proposed that(3:52:10)
that be changed and basically allow one up to four employees which it is an(3:52:17)
intensive use uh particularly in a already existing(3:52:23)
building um and and the example that I gave the other day was you have four(3:52:30)
employ how do they get into the building of course they have to use common space to get into the building um if you are a building that(3:52:38)
doesn't have a dorm in that means either they're leaving those key things(3:52:44)
outside which I have seen for home occupations for their(3:52:49)
employees or they're waiting for they're giving out extra keys I(3:52:56)
mean including you can in The Proposal you can be a maker of things and a(3:53:03)
seller of what you make in the building and there's not a lot of discussion of the regulation of how many people can(3:53:09)
come I there's regulation about you can't have signage Outdoors you can't do(3:53:15)
a number of things but in terms of the intensity of the impact on the residential people who are(3:53:22)
looking for a residential feel how do you think this maintains(3:53:29)
it I'll make sure that I answer all pieces of that question please um the I(3:53:35)
think the the the questions you rais are questions of that we've asked ourselves and I think the only concern that we(3:53:41)
have uh uh that that I've identified in looking at this is the idea that you(3:53:46)
might get queuing of uh you know people waiting or businesses operating at odd(3:53:53)
hours in a way that uh building owners couldn't uh enforce you know the the the(3:53:59)
the owners of the building couldn't enforce would have difficulty or it would be strenuous or difficult in order(3:54:05)
to to sort of bring resolution to those uh instances the existing regulations(3:54:11)
allow an awful lot of what you've just described um and I think that um you(3:54:16)
know there are very few uses that are on the list of uses that are not allowed it's like nail salons opic(3:54:23)
dispensing yes jewelry makers uh hair you hair salons and I think that there have been you know those those one of(3:54:31)
the issues that's been flagged about those uses previously is the bias baked into some of them about the kinds of(3:54:37)
activities that routinely do happen in people's homes and the fact that there are people to do hair styling in their home and it is a routine
practice today(3:54:45)
the number of employees in the establishment is you know say one is allowed generally there are many(3:54:52)
districts in which three are allowed I in my time at City Planning I don't know Others May um you know can can ask the(3:54:59)
same question but never heard a complaint about uh the number of employees when it was increased to three(3:55:04)
in MX districts being uh A disruption I think one of the the conc that we were trying to approach this with is that(3:55:11)
building managers and property managers have to have the ability to manage their buildings for the benefit of the(3:55:17)
residents right and if a resident through the operation of a home occupation is causing a nuisance and(3:55:23)
it's in violation of their lease in some manner then they have some recourse that said it would be a large lift for a(3:55:30)
property manager to take a resident to housing court in many instances and in order to enforce that and many property(3:55:38)

managers particularly a property manager of a rent regulated building might say you know what that's a lot of trouble I'm(3:55:43)
just going to let this situation so what we wanted to do is make sure that the text includes sufficient language to(3:55:51)
enable the city to enforce against the improper use of common areas uh uh in(3:55:56)
the building in a way that detracts from the quality of life of residents and there already is language in the text(3:56:01)
about undo noise and other things that allow violations to be issued in enforcement to occur right but I would(3:56:08)
just want violation violations are not against the business they're against the(3:56:13)
building so if somebody in the building complains let's say it's a co-op then it(3:56:19)
they're complaining about themselves and they're going to pay the fines and the entity that's the problem(3:56:26)
has complete recourse to continue doing it and so I think the again I come back(3:56:31)
to the the question of Home occupations exist all over the city today um many of(3:56:37)
them don't formally comply with these regulations um but seem perfectly(3:56:43)
reasonable um I am not aware of massive enforcement issues though there may be enforcement issues and I think that(3:56:49)
figuring out how to approach those enforcement issues across the board is is an important complement to this but(3:56:54)
you would say we should pass it and then figure out the enforcement I would say if I'm if I(3:57:02)
can I wait can I just interrupt for one sec because we're going we have a long day ahead I just would ask that um(3:57:08)
members of public refrain from um support or objection to any of the things that they're hearing just to allow us to proceed sorry to interrupt(3:57:14)
but *thank you* no no of course and I I would say I would say that uh the nature of(3:57:21)
the changes is limited and I think that going from one to three employees is not serious I think that making sure that(3:57:28)
when the list of uses that's in the text that provides some uh hook for uh for(3:57:34)
for enforcement and and implementation of the regulations at do that there be sufficient language in there to enable(3:57:41)
to the text to prevent building uh op businesses that invite large numbers of(3:57:46)
customers into the building and that's that should be sufficient *thank you* Howard *thank you*(3:57:51)
commissioner commissioner Soro *thank you* chair *thank you* for for your presentation and I look forward to reading your comments I have a
quick(3:57:58)
question to build on something that you said although we've heard from the Department that is not likely to happen(3:58:05)
that due to for example the costs of separating the uses a residential uses could be displaced by new commercial do(3:58:11)
you think that there is the need to include something in zoning that prevent(3:58:17)
that any commercial any new commercial could potentially displace existing residential do you see the need for that(3:58:22)
I you know that wasn't part of our our our evaluation of the text in the proposal but I I think I think it's a it(3:58:30)
would be an it's not something that I would anticipate to be a problem but as I said it's also not really what the(3:58:36)
text is trying to accomplish yeah but it it could potentially happen and my question is whether we should anticipate(3:58:42)
that and you know put that Safeguard in place given that you know there's a housing crisis and so forth that's a(3:58:47)
good question I think I will probably defer that to the department staff to evaluate but I I do want to say that(3:58:54)
some one of the challenges in writing zoning is trying to distinguish between(3:59:00)
the things that are true concerns that require additional regulations and the(3:59:06)
things that could in theory happen but really we shouldn't be worrying so much about because too many regulations(3:59:12)
trying to address concerns that are not significant or severe leads(3:59:17)
to the growth of the zoning regulations and the growth of complexity in the(3:59:23)
zoning which makes it harder for everyone to do business so I I I know I'm not answering your question(3:59:28)
directly um but I think it's it's a good question I appreciate that thanks *thank you* very much *thank you* Howard

Sandra Jaz

uh let's(3:59:34)

uh let you go but we appreciate your feedback we will take a look at those uh those comments uh let's move on to to(3:59:41)

Sandra Jaz on Zoom followed by Carlo(3:59:48)
Casa by(4:00:00)
phone Sandra you may be seeing a um message box on your screen asking it for(4:00:08)
um uh you to accept for motion to panelist you may need to click on(4:00:14)
that there we(4:00:37)
go(4:01:22)
we may have lost Sandra but we'll let you know if she comes back into okay let's come back to(4:01:27)
Sandra and

let's go to **Carla Casa** of the building Congress we'll come back to her when when she's back um do we have Carlo(4:01:35)

Casa Carlo you should be able to unmute on your phone in Zoom(4:01:42)
hello can you hear me we can oh great well uh as noted *my name* is(4:01:49)
car loaasa I'm the director of policy and research at the New York building Congress *thank you* for allowing me to(4:01:55)
testify today building Congress represents over 500 constituent(4:02:01)
organizations and over 250,000 skilled Trad people and professionals dedicated(4:02:07)
to the growth and PR prosperity of our city we strongly express our support for(4:02:12)
the city of yes for Economic Opportunity a common sense initiative that holds the potential to reshape the landscape of(4:02:19)
small businesses and Commercial corridors in New York City the pandemic challenged the(4:02:26)
resilience of our small businesses and tested our economic Foundation having more flexibility in(4:02:32)
Zoning for local businesses to best use their existing space is precisely the so(4:02:38)
ber rational response our city needs to not only recover but(4:02:43)
Thrive one of the standout features of the city of yes is its commitment to allow small businesses to repurpose(4:02:50)
their own available space we support eliminating Antiquated rules that(4:02:55)
dictate how a business's own space can be used and where certain businesses can be located we also support simplifying(4:03:02)
regulations that contribute to store front vacancies this initiative fost ERS a(4:03:08)
more adaptive and dynamic environment for our local entrepreneurs simplifies(4:03:13)
and streamlines zoning regulations and makes it easier for businesses to find(4:03:19)
and utilize space to flourish contributing to a more inviting commercial environment for all New(4:03:25)
Yorkers these changes also pave the way for companies to grow responsibly by(4:03:31)
establishing consistent streetscape rules that contribute to Lively active(4:03:36)
commercial areas while conforming to Modern environmental standards that simply did not exist under the 1961(4:03:43)
zoning resolution we urge you to support the city of yes for Economic Opportunity it(4:03:49)
is a strategic move that will firmly cement New York City's position as a beacon of opportunity and Innovation(4:03:56)
thank you for your consideration *thank you* very much okay(4:04:02)
uh we're now going to move on to uh Paul gratiano of the queen Civic Congress(4:04:09)
uh and then I think we may have an elected official coming in okay Mr graciano when(4:04:15)
you're ready you have three(4:04:28)
minutes hello hi we can hear you okay great *thank you* uh Paul graciano I'm an urban(4:04:36)
planner with three decades of experience authoring text amendments and Zoning changes in New York City many of which(4:04:42)
have been adopted and I will be submitting detailed written testimony in total opposition to this package of(4:04:49)
proposals I've been retained by the queen Civic Congress which represents dozens of Civic and homeowners(4:04:54)
associations across queens and I'm also representing and Advising other similar associations across the city who are(4:05:01)
also in total opposition to the city of yes I have been in attend~~ance~~ at more than a dozen separate community board(4:05:07)
meetings across Queens Brooklyn and the Bronx since November and will actually be attending yet another one tonight my(4:05:14)
personal observations of these meetings is as follows DCP staff have been(4:05:20)
woefully unprepared and lack basic knowledge and understanding of this set of proposals most have been reading(4:05:27)

woodenly off of pre-printed pages while showing what can only be described as your puppy dogs and ice cream slides(4:05:34)
that are to put it mildly extremely misleading and don't reflect what's in the 1127 pages of zoning text and(4:05:43)
clearly don't reflect reality whatsoever um these examples are unrealistic and(4:05:48)
represent the most harmless examples possible rather than the worst case scenarios which are much more likely in(4:05:54)
our city in many cases I had to actually correct the presenters during their presentation when asked pertinent(4:06:00)
on-topic and critically important questions by the community board members or public about various aspects of the(4:06:06)
18 proposals there were numerous instances of DCP staff being unable to respond at all with statements like we(4:06:12)
will have to get back to you that's the limit of my knowledge we weren't trained in this all as the land use committees(4:06:18)
or full boards were encouraged to vote as soon as possible on the complex package of 18 proposals in front of them(4:06:23)
and multiple instances staff have gotten extremely rude combative dismissive disrespectful and downright aggressive(4:06:30)
with community board members and the public who disagree and are concerned with the deregulatory goals and negative(4:06:36)
outcomes of this propos proposal which was essentially authored by the biggest developers and business groups in the city to benefit them
not small(4:06:44)
businesses or local communities from a personal perspective in several instances where I have spoken to(4:06:49)
community boards in opposition to this proposal I have literally been shouted down by your staff while I was speaking(4:06:55)
and in one instance I was told by one of your senior staffers who shall remain nameless that my opposition to the(4:07:01)
proposal was quote unproductive and quote against democracy extremely(4:07:07)
disturbing statements coming from an agency representing the public Viewpoint and agenda of Mayor Adams's(4:07:13)
Administration the deterioration of DCP in both behavior and best practices(4:07:18)
apparent to anyone as is the fact that city of yes for Economic Opportunity and soon to be certified Housing Opportunity(4:07:25)
is a raging dumpster fire waiting to happen urge the commission to withdraw(4:07:31)
these applications immediately before you lose all credibility with the public and cause irreparable harm to the fabric(4:07:37)
of the city *thank you* uh Mr gratiano

we're going to move on to um Nebraska Hernandez and uh(4:07:45)
um I will note um that uh we um(4:07:51)
completely disagree obviously with the level of preparedness of the Department of City Planning staff excuse me(4:07:58)
everybody will have an opportunity to uh to be heard and I will note that saying to a member of the community that they(4:08:04)
don't have the answer at that moment they'll get back to you is actually totally appropriate response uh what we(4:08:10)
do not want to do is give answers that are not accurate um and we have worked extremely hard uh to uh engage and to(4:08:18)
meet people where they are throughout this entire city uh I also will note that uh the behavior that um Mr gratiano(4:08:25)
noted um uh is something that our staff experienced directly in some cases for(4:08:30)
members of the community including him so I will just note that uh for the record uh and I will go to commiss(4:08:38)
Benjamin yeah as as someone who has concerns about this proposal and has(4:08:45)
spoken with staff and obviously have asked questions here I have to say that the staff has been extraordinarily(4:08:52)
professional and that it does not represent the behaviors that I have(4:08:58)
seen I would commend the staff on trying to address my concerns talk about them(4:09:05)
debate with me about them and so my experience is directly contradictory(4:09:11)
to what Mr gratiano has said and I would like to commend the staff for what they(4:09:18)
have done *thank you* commissioner and I know they appreciate that uh let me move on(4:09:24)

Nebraska Hernandez

to Nebraska Hernandez of upros uh to be followed by lesan(4:09:36)
Ellis hello can everyone hear me we can(4:09:44)
perfect I just got back from the bathroom so that was perfect timing(4:09:49)

um that's a that's a lot of information but we're glad you're here um but good afternoon *my name* is(4:09:55)
Nebraska Hernandez the climate Justice Hub Advocate at upros a community organization based in Sunset Park that(4:10:00)
works at the Nexus of racial and climate Justice I want to first and foremost thank the City Planning Commission for(4:10:05)
the opportunity to speak today um my main concern is addressing the explosive rise of e-commerce since the beginning(4:10:12)
of the covid-19 pandemic in 2020 the city of yes includes proposal 14 under goal three which is enabling(4:10:19)
micro distribution unfortunately as of now the proposal fails to address the larger Last Mile warehouses that operate(4:10:25)
Around the Clock contributing significantly to congestion safety risks and environmental concerns as a part of(4:10:32)
The Last Mile Coalition upro supports the proposal of a zoning text amendment that specifically defines last mile(4:10:37)
warehouses as a distinct category that ACC company's proposal 14 our proposal includes the establishment of a specific(4:10:44)
permit process for Last Mile warehouses exceeding 50,000 square feet this amendment is crucial for addressing the(4:10:50)
impacts of community character vehicular traffic flow and air quality while everyone in the city enjoys the benefits(4:10:57)
of e-commerce workingclass communities of color like Red Hook Hunts Point and Sunset Park are disproportionately(4:11:02)
burdened with the detrimental impacts of Last Mile facilities and the trucking industry that accompanies them(4:11:08)
this by definition is environmental Injustice Additionally the guanas expressway in Sunset Park is already(4:11:13)
heavily utilized by Last Mile Trucking and this racist piece of infrastructure continues to result in negative Health impacts on our community
by(4:11:20)
incorporating the last M coalition's proposal the city can support economic growth while still ensuring the well-being of our residents in a
just(4:11:27)
economy um and you'll be hearing from other members of the last M Coalition um(4:11:32)
sometime during this hearing but *thank you* again um for giving us the opportunity to speak(4:11:38)
great *thank you* very much we appreciate your testimony

Lesean Ellis

now leson Ellis I believe is in the room Alis welcome *thank you*(4:11:45)
very much hello hello um so I'm Lesean Ellis and I'm here from Crown Heights(4:11:52)
Brooklyn um born and raised in Brooklyn New York uh I liked your comment earlier(4:11:58)
and you know and I just wanted to say youth have given accurate truthful information are often times the best(4:12:03)
judges of new ideas such as this one I would be curious to know what teenager thinks of this plan but let's be mindful(4:12:10)
of the words accurate and truthful zoning environmental assessments impact statements in the ulip process were(4:12:16)
created to protect the people of the city from ubiquitous oversized buildings blocking sunlight and sucking up(4:12:21)
valuable resources like water sewage and waste disposal protect us from pollutants toxins and noise providing(4:12:29)
people with a certain quality of life to eliminate these protections of the people is a punch in the face and(4:12:34)
multiple kicks in the ribs as we lie bloodied on the ground the mere fact that the city of yes along(4:12:40)
with your city of yes sweatshirt swag was created with the help of business(4:12:45)
and corporations with no input from City residents is an absolute offense big business and government sitting around(4:12:51)
the table rubbing their grubby little hands together to strategize how they are going to take more land from the people at little to no cost to(4:12:58)
themselves and at all cost to us the minions right in the midst of the largest housing crisis the city has(4:13:05)
never seen the city has ever the mayor and DCP are proposing to eliminate thousands of apartments and convert them(4:13:11)
into commercial spaces despite the fact that there is an overabundance of vacant storefronts all over New York City and(4:13:17)
every Community as a lot of people have said before this false show of support for small businesses in this proposal is(4:13:23)
not lost on people who are paying attention why would you incentivize a property owner to remove and eliminate(4:13:28)
rent stabilized apartments in order to have more commercial spaces when there are plenty available in commercial(4:13:33)
corridors but they are either being warehoused for tax write off off or the rent is too damn High what are your(4:13:40)
solutions to this problem clubs anywhere auto repair shops anywhere manufacturing(4:13:45)
can leave outskirts and head to commercial zones noise toxins pollution all allowed closer to our residential(4:13:51)

areas a retired FDNY Lieutenant said This spells disaster having no idea what(4:13:57)
is located where not knowing what to bring in case of a fire a homeowner lamenting the years of headache stress(4:14:04)
anxiety and structural damage caused by the coffee shop bar below that added live music and **dancing** to their(4:14:10)
offerings lithium batteries exploding in hallways and homes killing entire families ebikes and mopeds currently(4:14:17)
riding rampant around the city killing and maiming people left and right public parking spaces being sold to(4:14:24)
corporations for less than a dollar a year for two spaces this is happening now with regulations and you want to(4:14:30)
write into law no regulations the city of yes is a freebie for corporations and big businesses welfare as welfare as(4:14:38)
they laugh all the way to the bank and who will suffer we will the residents of this city first the people of color then(4:14:43)
the poor then the rest no one will be Untouched by this irrevocable text Amendment the city of yes is a city of(4:14:49)
mess please vote no **thank you** very much let me move on to roxan Delgado on(4:15:06)
Zoom(4:15:11)
roxan you may be seeing a message on your screen asking you to accept a promotion to(4:15:33)
panelist roxan you should be able to unmute also(4:16:02)
appears roxan declined promotion and uh I don't see the name anymore okay um all(4:16:08)
right well we we'll come back to her if she shows back up um

Alicia Boyd

I believe is in the room is Boyd welcome(4:16:16)
back third time right oh you already know me so I can I don't I can skip the(4:16:22)
the the introductions okay you know what's really disappointing about this committee and this commission is how you(4:16:29)
sit here and you try to convince the community that it's going to be okay that all the things that you're asking(4:16:35)
is not really going to happen to us like oh don't worry you know those businesses are going to have people walking all(4:16:42)
through my all through my apartment building oh don't worry that's not going to happen and all that you know guy(4:16:48)
who's going to be able to grow that weed and then sell it out from his apartment(4:16:54)
oh no that's not going to happen and oh those manufacturing businesses that you(4:16:59)
have not defined inside of the text Amendment as safe you have not made any(4:17:04)
determination of what a safe Manufacturing businesses nor have you grouped them into safe manufacturing(4:17:10)
what you did is you merged them from the 17 and 18 group and then merged it all between all other 10 groups and then you(4:17:17)
just allow them in our community and say oh but don't worry it's not going to happen to you it's not going to come(4:17:24)
into your neighborhood it's not going to come into your commercial quarters well we all know the only reason why you're(4:17:29)
emptying out the manufacturing zones and let's be honest here is so that you can build that's what your text amendments(4:17:36)
from the housing is going to do it's going to allow developers to go into those manufacturing zones and sit there(4:17:42)
and build while the manufacturing businesses come into our(4:17:47)
community causing all kinds of Havoc oh did you do an environmental impact(4:17:53)
analysis oh no you didn't what you did is you worked around the environmental(4:17:58)
procedure what you did is you did a an alternative environmental you didn't do(4:18:04)
an environmental impact you said oh no nothing is going to happen if all of a sudden we let all these manufacturing businesses into our
community we allow(4:18:11)
dancing in our apartments and we allow them on the top floor and the bottom floor and on the on the side of us oh(4:18:16)
none of that's nothing's going to happen but let's change the regulation just in case it does let's sit there and put(4:18:24)
that 15 feet between the new business and that's called a mitigating(4:18:30)
scenario you mitigated an environmental impact you're supposed to actually do an(4:18:36)
environment mental impact before you can mitigate it which means you violated your own laws by not doing an(4:18:41)
environmental impact but then you mitigated a scenario where you know an(4:18:47)
impact would happen so if you're not following your own environmental laws you want us now to believe that(4:18:54)
somehow when these manufacturing businesses and all these people coming into our community and and all these(4:19:00)

things happening in our community somehow this city is going to sit there and protect us damn it we can call 311 (4:19:06)
we should be comfortable with 311 coming in and making sure that those toxic waste from that jewelry maker isn't(4:19:14)
thrown down the toilet B and causing fires we should be(4:19:19)
so comfortable with you guys protecting(4:19:24)
us and you don't even follow your own rules we're not we don't feel protected(4:19:30)
time we don't feel protected and you're failing in your job *thank you* very much

Ray Mo

let's move on to(4:19:36)
Ray more of safety(4:19:41)
Partners followed by Charles U of the Long Island City(4:19:59)
partnership hello good afternoon can you hear me we can greet a good afternoon my(4:20:06)
name is Ray Mo and I am a senior quality research and training specialist at safety Partners we create environmental(4:20:12)
health and safety programs for life science companies working with hazardous materials to keep their employees safe(4:20:17)
and to ensure compliance with regulations in the 30 past 30 plus years we have implemented programs for more(4:20:23)
than 900 companies in Massachusetts New York and throughout the United States safety Partners is providing this(4:20:29)
testimony about lab safety and regulations in support of the city of yes life science proposal life science(4:20:35)
work involves hazardous materials and there are risks associated with it on the other hand there's oversight from(4:20:41)
all levels of government to keep the workers environment and public safe and a regulator can inspect a facility at(4:20:46)
any time let's start at the local level the FDNY requires a lab unit permit in(4:20:51)
order to store and use chemicals this permit involves a thorough review of the department of building approved floor(4:20:57)
plans to confirm that the facility is constructed in accordance with construction and fire codes it also(4:21:02)
involves an initial inspection where the inspector Compares floor plans with the facility checks that chemicals are(4:21:08)
stored within established thresholds and that chemical storage and Fire Protection equipment are in place and that permit is renewed with
an(4:21:13)
inspection annually the FDNY also requires a Certificate of Fitness holder to be present whenever lab work is(4:21:19)
taking place and that holder must demonstrate competency with the fire code and safe chemical practices and this requirement is unique to
New York(4:21:27)
City uh the Department of Environmental Protection over sees the community right to know program which requires annual(4:21:33)
reporting of hazardous material that exceeds their reporting thresholds which which are much lower than Federal thresholds and they
conduct annual(4:21:40)
inspections the D also regulates sewer use their regulations outline what is(4:21:45)
prohibited from discharge and can require Wastewater pre-treatment before it is discharged into the system the(4:21:50)
department of sanitation requires an annual reports from generators of biomedical waste at the state level the(4:21:56)
Department of Environmental Conservation regulates biomedical waste and along with the EPA regulates hazardous(4:22:02)
chemical waste the regulations outline required registrations how waste is stored on site the use of licensed waste(4:22:09)
haulers to remove waste off site for appropriate treatment and Disposal and recordkeeping at the federal level OSHA(4:22:15)
standards such as Hazard communication lab and bloodborne pathogens among any others among others cover the specifics(4:22:22)
of hazardous material safety and include training and documented procedures OSHA's general duty Clause(4:22:28)
requires employers employers to provide a place of employment that is free from recognized hazards that can cause harm(4:22:33)
to employees this clause allows OSHA to reference any advisory documents such as(4:22:39)
the Cornerstone advisory document uh from the CDC the BIOS safety and microbiological and biomedical(4:22:44)
Laboratories when making this determination finally employees who work(4:22:50)
in these Labs who are part of the community want to go home at the end of each workday they are at the greatest(4:22:57)
risk to these hazards I have just mentioned and by implementing safe and compliant work practices they are(4:23:02)
keeping themselves their co-workers and the general public safe than *thank you*(4:23:07)

great *thank you* very much uh

moving on to Charles you Sor this(4:23:14)

isand *thank you* hold hold on one(4:23:19)

Ray Moore

second hold on let's let's stay with Ray Moore for a moment if we can bring her(4:23:25)

back we have a question for her and if they're a member of the public that's speaking from the audience let me just(4:23:30)

say please sign up we will gladly hear you because everybody's going to have a chance and we will stay here until(4:23:36)

literally every person who wants to speak has an opportunity but just can't do it out from the audience so commissioner ooro you'll have the floor(4:23:42)

can we bring uh Ray Ray Mo m m Moore okay great commissioner go ahead thank(4:23:48)

you thanks so much for your your testimony I have a quick question so I'm familiar with the DP Community right to(4:23:53)

know regulation that govern the use of Hazard and the storage of hazardous substances but these regulations have(4:24:00)

been mainly designed for industrial areas and I'm wondering if you foresee any adjustments required when these uses(4:24:07)

are collocated with residential uses in other words should we be are they sufficient one in that regard and do you(4:24:14)

think that they reflect sort of like the potential exposure of chemicals in the in the context of severe weather given(4:24:20)

climate change impacts and so forth um if you don't mind uh the second one do(4:24:26)

you mind if I give you a written response um after this because yeah you can you can respond to both in writing(4:24:32)

if you prefer *thank you* absolutely I I would say for the the answer to the first one I I mean um the exemptions of(4:24:39)

who should be reporting or I mean it it's any business right the the(4:24:45)

exemptions are you know pretty small actually um and the threshold levels are(4:24:50)

really low um you know I I I can mainly speak for these life science you know(4:24:56)

labs and many of their materials that they commonly use have to be(4:25:02)

reported *thank you thank you thank you* very much thank is more okay now let's(4:25:08)

let's move on to actually Mr Mr U please hold for a moment I think we may have um(4:25:15)

uh

Roxanne Delgado

I think we heard her a moment ago so let's while she's here(4:25:22)

let's let's have her go and then we will go back to you Mr youu at the the Long Island City(4:25:27)

partnership *thank you* New York City Planning Commission first I to say I've been on this uh call since 10: a.m. and(4:25:34)

I would advise *next* time when you do a city y text amendment to hold a separate meeting for that alone because it does(4:25:40)

require lots of public input and it should the priority should be on such a Citywide text Amendment which is a massive project will change actually how(4:25:47)

the city does the UL process and based on city Charter I like to really really commend the two women one regarding the(4:25:54)

city of mess and the second one who follow that you're not doing your job like to thank them for the courage and for advocacy for their voice V Community(4:26:00)

because unfortunately the powers thatb are not speaking for the people they're speak speaking for special interests on(4:26:06)

the zoning application portal it it mistakenly states that the Comm Board review process ended on from November 8(4:26:13)

to I think January 8 and then I was found out after the fact that there was an extension which was not shared by Me(4:26:18)

by the Comm board who tends to list Miss deadlines and I'm also very disappointed regarding the Nicha uh commercializing(4:26:25)

Nicha property um that is not good for Nicha resident it doesn't benefit the the needed repair and it's again taking(4:26:31)
away public use of their uh public land uh they already took a lot of their community centers to give to to lease to(4:26:38)
nonprofits that don't really serve the community and it this is what disempowered the N resident which I live(4:26:44)
right across Palm Parker houses regarding the laboratory I don't want to live *next* to any animal testing so(4:26:49)
definitely no no and the cornerstones that's you know people may know zoning people may have I degrees but you don't(4:26:56)
live in this community that I live in I see these Cornerstone open to for7 there stabling there there're shooting there(4:27:02)
there's lack of quality of life no enforcement by the police because they said they cannot Force these laws anymore 3 in1 is overwhelmed
and this(4:27:09)
brings a lot of uh detriment and public issues to the community uh our community is most majority of people color this is(4:27:15)
not a white issue like oh they're racist they don't want anything they're against uh uh uh Evolution no no this is about(4:27:22)
us people we are all people we're all human and the city is not acting in our best interest and it has put a lot of(4:27:28)
detriment and harm on the community and lastly regard going commercializing uh on second floors that's ridiculous we(4:27:35)
we constantly talk about housing shortness and now you want to put more commercial space the reason why business are not drive is not
because the lack of(4:27:42)
due to zoning it's because the rent is too high we lost a 49y old Diner just recently because the rent uh was(4:27:48)
increased over 10,000 we lost a 25y old cleaner that people are missing already because of the rent most of our mom pop(4:27:55)
shops are dying out not because of zoning and there's a lady who's very involv this community wants to open open(4:28:01)
her own bookstore that's very diverse but she can't even rent here because they only rented to illegal Cannabis(4:28:07)
stores because they they could afford that rent so please let's be real this is not about uh supporting businesses or(4:28:12)
supporting the community this is about special interest I *thank you* commissioner for your time *thank you* uh *thank you* for your(4:28:19)
testimony don't go anywhere though because commissioner Goodridge has a question for you so stay put for a sec(4:28:24)
commissioner go ahead first person or unless I'm wrong(4:28:31)
that brought up about the commercialize commercialization of Nicha and I wanted to give you an oppor to talk a bit more(4:28:37)
about that that's a much larger issue but it's something um can you talk a bit(4:28:42)
more about that uh *thank you* commissioner for that question I live across public houses I attend Aller me(4:28:48)
and I'm very invested in public housing because I feel like there are the major um uh tenants in the commun in p parkit(4:28:55)
district and they've been disempowered and without their involvement this has actually weaken the whole pel park(4:29:01)
community right now there's two Community censors have been leased to two nonprofits now they do good services(4:29:06)
but most of the service are provideed to outside residents not to nitri Residents second they want to now put commercial(4:29:12)
use in and up to 15,000 square feet that's not going to go into uh uh it's(4:29:18)
going to go to general fund it's not go directly to Residents not employee resident it's not going uh have residents create their own
businesses(4:29:24)
and now that most nichas are going into U the pack or rad program and some are actually going to Section 8 because(4:29:29)
they're supposed to know money for repairs now they want to commercialize that takes away public use right now we(4:29:35)
have a beautiful Courtyard that provides clean air for the for the uh p park resid we have a playground that provides(4:29:42)
relief dur the Summer with the sprinklers why are we taking uses from the public housing that will not benefit(4:29:48)
public housing residents I *thank you* for that question because I'm very adamant about public housing even though I don't directly live in P
Park(4:29:57)
Housing *thank you* very much um and before I go to Mr U let me just uh make(4:30:03)
a couple of quick points about about process and then also one about um about Nicha um on process I did want to note(4:30:11)
that um we were very clear with Community boards about the extension of time that they had uh I started that(4:30:17)
today that we told every community board they could have as much time as they needed up(4:30:23)
until any votes were taken and that we would consider their views and we will continue to to consider their views(4:30:29)
right up until the moment that this commission has to vote and we also even said if you can't get it in even by our(4:30:35)
V vote we certainly encourage you to send it to the city council so I I don't you know to me uh the notion that we(4:30:40)
either did not welcome Community boards or were not president Community boards is fallacious and um uh as it relates to(4:30:50)
um Nicha I do think it's important for us to talk about what is actually being proposed here and I and people can(4:30:57)
disagree on the substance but let's just talk about what what the proposal says um The Proposal creates a process only(4:31:05)
process an authorization process um for the possibility for Nicha to use this(4:31:12)

zoning tool doesn't mandate it it doesn't you know actually effectuate it(4:31:18)
on its own um but in our conversations uh it is clear that there are old(4:31:25)
offices storage underutilized spaces which Nitra and(4:31:31)
its residents um might see an an opportunity for whether that's Retail(4:31:37)
Services maker space or whatever they believe is needed um and we also have(4:31:44)
heard from Nicha Nicha residents asking for better access to local goods and services for many years so it is a(4:31:49)
process only uh and to address specifically the needs that Nicha and Nitra residents may want to effectuate(4:31:56)
so it's it is not us uh you know changing anything it is US creating an(4:32:02)
opportunity for Nicha and Nicha residents in a way that is strictly prohibited in zoning today so just it's(4:32:08)
worth it's worth noting so let's go on to

Mr U charles

Mr U of the Long Island City(4:32:23)
partnership change providing an opportunity change I you able do you(4:32:29)
hear me we are *thank you* very much yes *thank you* uh good afternoon *my name* is(4:32:35)
Charles you I'm the vice president of the Long Island City partnership and uh(4:32:40)
the Long Island City part for good afternoon and *thank you* for this opportunity to testify today uh the Long(4:32:46)
Island City partnership is the Local Economic Development Corporation for the Long Island City area and we founded in(4:32:53)
1979 uh we manag the uh LIC business improvement district as well as the uh(4:32:58)
industrial business Zone uh the proposal here today aims to eliminate confusing(4:33:03)
and outdated regulations that have hindered the growth of of small businesses and limited their potentials(4:33:10)
uh it provides the flexibility local businesses needed to grow and adapt as(4:33:16)
our local economies continue to evolve and create a stronger foundation for the city's economic recovery for our bid(4:33:24)
corridors the amendment recognizes the importance of and supports vibrant(4:33:29)
thriving commercial streets where communities gather culture converges and(4:33:35)
neighborhoods are enriched so in short um we thank the city of yes economic OPP(4:33:41)
uh for for Economic Opportunity is a crucial step towards re reimagining the(4:33:46)
future of our local communities by giving small businesses clear and sensible rules that give them the(4:33:53)
flexibility to evolve and grow and uh it will ensure local communities like long(4:33:58)
and City remain places where people will continue to want to work and live so(4:34:04)
thank you very much and *thank you* for your thoughtful considerations great *thank you* very much(4:34:10)
um *next* I'm going to welcome um the commissioner of the Department of small(4:34:15)
business services Kevin Kim um commissioner we're delighted that you are able uh to join us today and uh(4:34:23)
whenever you are ready uh we'll look forward to hearing from you thank(4:34:34)
you(4:34:58)
I don't think we're seeing commissioner in the okay we don't see him yet okay um all right no problem then let us go(4:35:06)
to uh Jared Grim of the downtown Brooklyn [Music](4:35:28)
partnership hello everybody uh *my name* is Jared Grim I am the vice president of real estate and economic development at(4:35:34)
the D downtown Brooklyn partnership on behalf of Regina Meyer and DBP I'd like to express our strong support of the(4:35:41)
Department of City planning's proposed City vs for Economic Opportunity zoning amendment to modernize the city's zoning(4:35:47)
rules to support small businesses create thriving commercial corridors and bolster the city's economic recovery in(4:35:54)
this time of recovery it is crucial to remove outdated limitations on businesses and ensure that our Central(4:35:59)
Business districts and Commercial corridors remain Dynamic and vibrant we would like to highlight the following proposals that are of
particular(4:36:05)
importance to downtown Brooklyn allowing opportunities for a greater diversity of businesses to(4:36:11)
locate on ground and upper floors with consumers shopping habits evolving this change would enable establishments(4:36:17)

Beyond traditional retail stores to activate space along our main shopping corridors additionally allowing(4:36:24)
commercial uses above the ground floors of residential buildings would allow food and beverage establishments to locate in new and
unique(4:36:31)
spaces supporting nightlife and entertainment through common sense regulations currently such entertainment(4:36:37)
uses such as arcades virtual reality or bowling alleys are constrained or prohibited along Filon Mall these uses(4:36:44)
will support ground floor Vitality in downtown Brooklyn in addition to complimenting the Street's other retail(4:36:50)
businesses by encouraging much needed foot traffic on evenings and weekends removing use of bulk removing(4:36:57)
use and bulk regulations for businesses in growing Industries such as life science and Film Production these uses(4:37:04)
are full compatible with downtown Brooklyn's existing complement of tenants and institutions and we fully(4:37:10)
support this change to further stimulate the post-pandemic office Market we encourage you to support the city of yes(4:37:16)
for Economic Opportunity zoning amendment that will drive business growth and Foster Viber neighborhoods(4:37:21)
thank you for the opportunity to testify great *thank you* very much uh we(4:37:28)
appreciate you you're being here let's move on to

Jesse Solomon

Jesse Solomon of Southwest Brooklyn Industrial Development(4:37:34)
Corporation be followed by Cecilia(4:37:39)
Kushner of EDC *thank you* Cecilia we see you(4:37:46)
here hi everyone good afternoon uh *my name* is Jesse Solomon and I am the executive director of Southwest Brooklyn(4:37:53)
Industrial Development Corporation our mission is to help industrial and Manufacturing businesses grow in order(4:37:59)
to continue providing family supporting jobs with career Pathways to workingclass New Yorkers(4:38:05)
we serve the communities of STI Park Red Hook and guanas we've been in conversation with the Department of City(4:38:11)
Planning um for several months now along with our Coalition members of the industrial jobs Coalition housed at anhd(4:38:18)
we are largely supportive of the Zeo text amendments we consider the goals of Zoning for Economic Opportunity to be(4:38:25)
admirable and forward-looking increasing commercial and Industrial densities and allowing for more(4:38:31)
flexibility in building layout and bulk will help local economies grow and add to the vibrancy of our City's commercial(4:38:38)
corridors however we do believe that the M Zone components of proposal 18 should(4:38:43)
be strengthened to better preserve existing industrial businesses incentivize new Industrial Development(4:38:49)
and Foster the associated forms of job retention and creation which provide Brooklyn residents with clear Pathways(4:38:56)
to the middle class so we have three recommendations for the M Zone tools listed in proposal(4:39:02)
18 the first recommendation is for the m3a or core District we recommend the(4:39:08)
creation of a higher density option of 5 f for Industrial Development our second(4:39:13)
recommendation is for the m2a district or transition District we recommend increasing the industrial incentive in(4:39:20)
that application and including design requirements for qualifying industrial portions that can ensure these(4:39:26)
industrial spaces uh be put to productive industrial uses this is not included in the Zoning(4:39:34)
for econom IC opportunity but I do want to note here that our third recommendation is about Freight mobility(4:39:39)
generally um in tandem with the city of yes proposals outcomes we strongly encourage the department of City(4:39:45)
Planning and other City agencies to dedicate time and resources towards more(4:39:50)
comprehensive transportation and Freight planning that prioritizes a Blue Highway Network or Maritime based Freight we(4:39:57)
think this is aligned with the goals of the city of yes Zoning for Economic Opportunity and some of the exciting(4:40:02)
announcements that came out today in the mayor's um city of state I'm happy to answer any questions and our full(4:40:09)
written testimony has been submitted to both gcp and CPC *thank you* for your time today great *thank you* very much(4:40:15)
commissioner Sero *thank you* chair thanks for the testimony and I look forward to reading uh the written version of it but(4:40:22)
really quickly on the core um I'm wondering you suggest a a a higher(4:40:29)
density option but I'm I'm wondering if you can if you can explain whether you are concerned or whether you see any(4:40:35)
issues with not limiting non-industrial uses there that's a question that I asked earlier to the department and the(4:40:42)

other one has to do with the the transition your recommendation to the transition zones it's interesting uh to(4:40:47)
hear that you're int you proposed to in a a increase the incentive but why not(4:40:55)
require stronger industrial retention I'm wondering help me understand your thoughts there we would love to see a(4:41:02)
requirement in the transition area of industrial we and I speak for myself at(4:41:07)
sbidc but I also speak for my colleagues at the industrial jobs Coalition under anhd who I know some of whom are(4:41:13)
testifying Charles just testified a minute ago um we have heard from Department of City(4:41:19)
Planning and from council members that because the m3a core or core district(4:41:25)
has an industrial requirement um the city is looking at that as the tool to(4:41:30)
provide an industrial requirement if we are able to get get an industrial requirement instead of just an incentive(4:41:37)
in the transition area that would be fabulous but we also recognize that for developers who are interested in taking(4:41:43)
advantage of an industrial um portion of their project a small amount of f is not(4:41:49)
going to cut it we saw that in the guanas mix that was proposed in the guanas resoning very few developers(4:41:54)
along the canal have taken advantage of that incentive because it's. three F it's not quite enough to actually make(4:42:00)
the project feasible if they want to put Industrial in that in that space um so we feel that there needs to be a(4:42:06)
little bit more space that's why our recommendation is for if you're going to do an incentive at all act you know we(4:42:12)
appreciate the creation of that tool um it we think it could stimulate some industrial projects in areas where you(4:42:19)
might not see it otherwise but we'd like to see that tool be strengthened a little bit *thank you* just really quickly(4:42:25)
you didn't mention the growth district and and I'm wondering if what is your take on that what does the Coalition(4:42:30)
think about them yeah I I think we heard a question from you about why the growth(4:42:35)
District at all why an M1A you know of that size of F and I I appreciate that question we asked Department of City(4:42:42)
Planning the same question in some of our conversations with the team um we have been testifying at Community boards(4:42:49)
and to our council members saying our mission is to protect preserve the industrial business zones of our(4:42:54)
communities again we represent sunet Park Red Hook and guanas that South Brooklyn area has a large ibz I think(4:43:01)
it's the second largest ibz in the city um and appreciate that this particular text Amendment does not include any(4:43:07)
residential in ibcs um but we have also been asking our because this is not(4:43:14)
getting mapped we've been directing our advocacy to the community board saying look don't put the growth districts in(4:43:20)
industrial business zones we don't think that's a good tool for industrial business zones because it's really hard(4:43:26)
to make an industrial or manufacturing project pencil out financially of that(4:43:31)
scale um because we're talking about really large buildings that DCP has said to us you know probably would only exist(4:43:39)
in parts of Manhattan or areas where they're trying to stimulate um other types of growth but don't want to(4:43:44)
exclude M zones from that area so we would like to see growth districts be left out of industrial business zones(4:43:51)
that's what important is important to us thanks so much I look forward to reading your comments no problem *thank you* thank(4:43:56)
you very much we appreciate you being here uh uh let me move on to

Cecilia Krishner

uh Executive Vice President and(4:44:02)
chief strategy officer of EDC welcome good afternoon everyone it's(4:44:08)
good to be um with you so I'm Cecilia Krishner I'm the chief strategy officer at The Economic Development Corporation(4:44:14)
and I'm coming um in strong support of the proposed zoning text amendment in front of you we believe this is an(4:44:20)
historic review of the growth and evolution of New York City's economy of the past decade and a unique opportunity(4:44:26)
to look to the Future and ensure that land use supports our changing City EDC(4:44:31)
works on behalf of the city to create a vibrant inclusive Ive and globally competitive economy for all New Yorkers(4:44:37)
the revision and modernization of the city's outdated zoning rules are envisioned by this plan and this text is(4:44:43)

critically important to our work and will help the continued growth of the city's economy along with the creation(4:44:48) and retention a family sustaining job for New Yorkers the important changes in this proposal will encourage the(4:44:54) formation and retention of small businesses support thriving commercial corridors and promote the spirit of(4:45:00) innovation that is the Hallmark of our economy EDC is completely in line with these goals and I would like to(4:45:06) highlight just a few examples of the way in which we believe that this text Amendment really um meets the need of(4:45:12) the moment first entrepreneurship is the life force of our economy just today one(4:45:17) in seven businesses that you see in New York City was created in the last year the willingness of so many New Yorkers(4:45:24) to take business risk and create jobs has been critical to the city's recovery from the pandemic and the creation of(4:45:30) close to 270,000 private sector jobs since the the beginning of this(4:45:35) Administration this proposed text Amendment supports the creation of small businesses and the New Yorkers will rely(4:45:41) on them for job opportunities by removing arbitrary time limits for reactivating uh local storefronts(4:45:48) simplifying rules for businesses permitting on Commercial streets and expanding opportunities for(4:45:53) entrepreneurs and small scale clean production Enterprises additionally the amendment legalizes a wide range of home(4:46:00) businesses that create greater access for New Yorkers from all economic backgrounds to start a business and be(4:46:05) part of the economy second EDC supports the leaf work Play and Learn model for New York(4:46:11) City's neighborhood and we strongly believe that business-friendly street Scapes with Active safe and walkable(4:46:17) Street for businesses and residents are critical for the success of this city this model which is centered in these(4:46:22) text amendments brings jobs closer to where people leave and ensure that our neighborhoods serve all of New Yorkers(4:46:28) needs the plans proposed zoning changes support our work to create job intensive(4:46:33) zoning District projects that allow modern style Loft buildings that would have higher density in close proximity(4:46:39) to public transit the creation of this district will support the city's recovery by better utilizing unused(4:46:46) commercial space as well as for creating opportunity for modern commercial and Manufacturing uses driving employment in(4:46:53) the out of borrows which is something that the city has been trying to do for a decade similarly many smaller(4:47:00) manufacturing and maker space that rely on food traffic are now restricted to less accessible industrial area and by(4:47:07) allowing small scale production in neighborhood commercial Corridor where such uses are currently prohibited the(4:47:13) cdvs really resolved that problem we have many other example as to why we're(4:47:19) very supportive um of these TX and we just want to thank um DCP for their hard(4:47:25) excuse me excuse me I'm sorry if I if I actually want to give somebody the(4:47:30) courtesy of an extra 10 or 15 seconds to wrap up I will do that that and that actually is not uh the discretion of the(4:47:37) crowd so you may finish you may finish your your statement and then we will move on to the *next* we we we appreciate(4:47:42) you being here *thank you thank you* no we just wanted to finally because I(4:47:51) know um that the life science Industry what brought up that it's an incredibly industry for the City of New York and(4:47:58) that this text Amendment really brings Common Sense regulation to bear that will be extremely important for the(4:48:03) industry's GR with in decades *thank you* for *thank you* very much we appreciate it *thank you thank you* very much and we(4:48:09) *will move on and I would just ask members of the public uh to not taunt(4:48:14)* *people as they are coming and* going and to not actually talk in the middle of testimony we're trying very hard to give(4:48:20) everybody their shot today um so I just ask you to be respectful of everybody let's move on to

suen Chong uh on Zoom(4:48:28)

to be followed by Maria Rocka(4:48:38)
um *thank you* for um the opportunity(4:48:44)
to by today um I'm a member of community board(4:48:49)
nine and Brooklyn last night we voted to oppose these text amendments in their entirety our recommendations have been(4:48:56)
sent to City Planning today I'm testifying on my own behalf also in opposition we all want our business(4:49:02)
corridors to thrive and be great places to shop eat and have fun as well as keeping space for necessary activities(4:49:07)
like car maintenance and good manufacturing jobs City Planning has told many of our community boards that(4:49:12)
we have high vacancy rates on our commercial corridors yet these amendments not only fail to address the primary reasons for those
vacancies High(4:49:20)

rents and spaces held empty in anticipation of Redevelopment but would clearly exacerbate them by adding potentially enormous amounts of(4:49:26)
commercial space and residential areas through the corner stores proposal and the upper floors and home occupations(4:49:31)
proposals they're pushing hazardous noise and traffic intensive uses into local retail overlay districts where(4:49:37)
people who live on top of and *next* to stores and old buildings would be harmed and businesses that benefit from pedestrian traffic and a pleasant(4:49:44)
shopping environment would also be deterred from locating they do not help fill large vacant spaces in our local M1(4:49:51)
and C8 districts where neither residential housing nor heavy manufacturing is allowed with appropriate businesses like large format(4:49:58)
consumer stores such as Home Depot or Ikea necessary automotive services wholesale distribution centers shared(4:50:04)
kitchens for food entrepreneurs biotech incubators Etc in order to justify these(4:50:09)
business unfriendly proposals they are trying to scare small business into believing that code overhauls are necessary because if a specific new use(4:50:16)
like cell phone stores or an accessory activity Like A store owner knitting in the back of her boutique is not included(4:50:22)
in the list of permitted uses for a zoning District then it is not allowed this is not true there are cell phone(4:50:27)
stores in C1 and C2 retail districts throughout the city since when has anyone received a do violation for that(4:50:33)
who calls knitting one scarf manufacturing presumably if an unstated new use clearly violated the common(4:50:39)
sense legislative intent section for the zoning District which they're also trying to change and neighbors reported a nuisance a violation would be issued(4:50:46)
the business would appeal to the BSA and a determination would be issued after enough such cases it would be clear what(4:50:52)
clarifications to the zoning text were needed or if some neighborhoods need Special Districts instead the Amendments(4:50:58)
throw open our mixed residential and Retail corridors to many uses we already know are deadly ebike and Moped stores(4:51:05)
textile mills and sugar refining and many others that we may discover are not clean only after significant damages(4:51:12)
occurred that would allow almost any Corner property owner in all residential districts to make a plausible argument(4:51:17)
for a corner store rather than restricting such waivers to unusual cases such as when three out of four(4:51:23)
corners in an intersection already have commercial overlays nightclubs are currently prohibited in our C1 and C2(4:51:29)
overlay districts because people live and sleep there they would now be allowed without any prior r at our(4:51:34)
community board we heard complaints about thumping *dance* music from a late night bar and we tried mediation and(4:51:40)
working with NYPD and D for several months only to reach a partially satisfactory resolution for tenants and(4:51:46)
with significant noise mitigation expense by the business owner zoning laws can help prevent these conflicts by(4:51:51)
steering such a business away from residential housing *thank you* ma'am the truth(4:51:57)
open and the city never gets minutes is up your three minutes is up(4:52:04)
wow I called that discrimination I'm hry to be(4:52:12)
Aware

Kevin Kim Commissioner of small business services

is our *next*(4:52:18)
speaker Kevin(4:52:32)
Kim hello hello yes Comm commissioner yes(4:52:40)
thank you um good afternoon *my name* is Kevin D Kim and I am the commissioner of the New York City Department of small(4:52:46)
business services also known as SBS every day at SP SPS our team creates(4:52:52)
Economic Security for New Yorkers by connecting New Yorkers to good jobs supporting local businesses and building(4:52:58)
thriving neighborhoods as the commissioner ofs I have the privilege of going around and speaking with small(4:53:05)
business owners across the five burus and it's clear to me that continued success for our entrepreneurs requires(4:53:11)
reforms to burdensome regulations and outdated zoning and that's why at SPS we(4:53:17)
support the city of yes for Economic Opportunity zoning text Amendment the Adams Administration has been steadfast(4:53:24)
in our mission to cut red tape for small businesses as part of Mayor Adam small business forward initiative SPS worked(4:53:31)

with many other City agencies to eliminate fines lower fees and ease regulatory burdens for small businesses(4:53:39)
putting millions of dollars back into the hands of business owners the city of yes for Economic Opportunity initiative(4:53:46)
Builds on this by eliminating outdated zoning that prevents businesses from opening and stops businesses from(4:53:53)
growing to meet the needs of their communities approving this initiative will make it easier for small businesses(4:53:59)
to expand hire New Yorkers and thrive in our commercial neighborhoods it's simple(4:54:05)
we all want to see more small businesses Thrive throughout the five burrows by supporting the city of yes for Economic(4:54:11)
Opportunity we can promote the continued success of the small businesses that led this city forward recovering from the(4:54:18)
covid-19 pandemic SPS looks forward to working alongside the Department of city planning to advance the city of yes for(4:54:25)
Economic Opportunity and cutting red tape for our Lo local businesses *thank you* very(4:54:31)
much *thank you* commissioner we appreciate appreciate uh your you're being with us today uh and uh as always(4:54:37)
your support um and *thank you* okay commissioner Benjamin has a question for you though before you(4:54:43)
go sure are you still there commissioner stay with us yep H how well do you(4:54:48)
believe these proposals address the issues you *hear from* small businesses that have been(4:54:55)
forced to close or relocate well I believe that the these(4:55:01)
uh amendments do a a lot of things I used to be a former state **liquor** Authority commissioner as well and just(4:55:08)
as uh an example there would be certain types of businesses that would just be(4:55:14)
not allowed to open based on outdated zoning rules versus Community boards also being able(4:55:21)
to chime in and be able to say whether they thought a business might be good for that District or not so I think in(4:55:28)
some ways as a former community board member as well in in some ways it's as(4:55:34)
we move forward as a city coming out of the uh covid pandemic and the recovery(4:55:41)
that we've been doing it is really good to take a look at everything that's been out there and encourage new businesses(4:55:48)
to continue open continue to open while trying to do everything we can to preserve businesses that have been there(4:55:54)
for generations to come before and for prior(4:55:59)
Generations but what are the main reasons you hear about why businesses(4:56:04)
have closed on local commercial strips that we see and are trying to(4:56:11)
reoccupy why what what is the main reason do here for their(4:56:16)
closure some have said it's high rents some have said it's lack of foot traffic(4:56:22)
what do you *hear from* them it's really a combination of challenges that small(4:56:29)
businesses have have been facing more recently also just traditionally um you know I'm a former small business owner(4:56:35)
my parents are immigrant small business owners I think rent is always a challenge I think you're seeing(4:56:42)
businesses adapt in many commercial corridors where they're combining businesses into one retail space for(4:56:48)
example uh you'll see that people have been looking out to build up complimentary businesses within one(4:56:55)
space to help share sometimes the burden of rent uh so you're seeing creative responses to some of the challenges but(4:57:02)
the biggest challenges we often hear when we're walking the quarters is access to Capital and that's why mayor(4:57:08)
Adams had in the blueprint for economic recovery we created the largest public private partnership Loan Fund directed(4:57:15)
just to small businesses and we were able to give out more than \$75 million(4:57:21)
and 75% of which is we we see now is going to mwbe businesses and also a very high(4:57:29)
percentage in LMI communities so Capital Access is something that we know is a tremendous barrier for many small(4:57:36)
businesses and we've addressed that headon the second part of it is we do hear of overly burdensome regulations(4:57:43)
and that's what I mentioned in my testimony about small business forward we have identified over a hundred(4:57:49)
regulations that were outdated or overly burdensome and not impacting the public(4:57:55)
health and safety directly we were able to find those rules that were in the books and(4:58:03)
reform them either by giving a firsttime warning or a cure period or eliminating them completely from the books and by(4:58:09)
doing that we're saving small businesses over \$8 million a year so there's Capital Access challenges there's(4:58:16)
obviously rent undeniable is a challenge um and government navigation is the(4:58:23)
third biggest challenge that we hear when we're walking the corridors *thank you thank you*(4:58:30)

commissioner commissioner sorio *thank you* chair *thank you* so much commissioner for your testimony um I have a question(4:58:35)
so we're we're in the process of uh analyzing the zoning text amendment in the context of larger uh policies and(4:58:44)

new legislation that will help understand you know what is the long-term plan for the Strategic(4:58:49)
industrial future of the city but I'm wondering if if you can help us understand from your perspective how far(4:58:56)
is this text Amendment positioning small businesses to attract or to grow in(4:59:02)
terms of green jobs green industries that the state is projecting in hundreds of thousands of jobs but warn us that(4:59:09)
they may go elsewhere if we don't specifically plan for them that zoning text Amendment specifically calls out(4:59:15)
Life Sciences nightlife but doesn't specifically refer to them in the same(4:59:21)
level of detail and from from my point of view you know these green jobs are specifically workingclass uh(4:59:27)
manufacturing jobs so I'm wondering if if there's anything that you can share with us in terms of how far are these(4:59:33)
proposals moving us in that direction I think it moves us very much(4:59:39)
towards where we need to position ourselves as a city as a global leader in Green Tech economy I think you know(4:59:47)
you just heard from EDC Economic Development Corporation one of their top top priorities is on Green Technology(4:59:54)
and climate tech technology and we see the opportunity it's not just a City(5:00:00)
versus another City race it's a global competition and I think everything that is being(5:00:05)
laid out as an Administration the strategy in totality with EDC with what(5:00:10)
DCP is proposing in these zoning text amendments and what we're doing atbs to help launch more and more startup(5:00:18)
businesses around this industry we are in a global competition and for us we(5:00:24)
believe that this all needs to go hand in hand and if we don't do that we will fall behind uh not just as a city but as(5:00:31)
a country and and we feel new New York City is poised with the talent that we(5:00:36)
have here with the top universities and cuni for example those students are the(5:00:42)
ones that need to be given the opportunity to enter into this emerging industry so that they can best benefit(5:00:49)
for for the economy overall in the city the state and the country *thank you thank you* very much(5:00:56)
thank you again commissioner it's good to see you *thank you* for being here *thank you* very much okay let's move *next*(5:01:02)
To

Mar Roa

to be followed by uh Ramy(5:01:09)
dinwi so now on the why I came here today um(5:01:16)
I lived in a building I Live Now in a co-op but I really live in a rental in(5:01:21)
the West Village for many years and I had an *next*door neighbor who loves to change the color over hair on a monthly(5:01:29)
basis I could smell that's one one woman I could smell the dye from because our(5:01:39)
bathrooms were sort of *next* to each other of that and I have a lot of allergies I tried nicely with her the(5:01:45)
landlord was not interested in anything this is when and then she would have parties she(5:01:52)
would invite people over and they would all dye their hair so this is three or four people dying their hair at the same(5:01:59)
time if if these um changes are adopted(5:02:05)
and now we are saying you can have three people in your apartment dying their(5:02:13)
hair and it is okay how did you enforce that you're leaving it to civilians to people to the(5:02:22)
manager of your building to the landlord who probably is not you know if it's a small building no no you figure it out(5:02:28)
for yourselves even in a co-op the co-op board normally goes can you guys just(5:02:35)
just work it out for yourself and weeks and months and later then you you know(5:02:40)
those everybody have the money to take somebody to court or the harassment that comes back and who is going to step up(5:02:47)
for the um the offending person to defend them against you there people are(5:02:53)
going to get hurt I am telling you I can see this coming and so that's just something to keep in mind as to what(5:03:01)
this what are we permitting regular people to do not businesses that(5:03:06)
have to carry Insurance use insurance or who may lose a license regular(5:03:13)
civilians putting putting the place putting responsibility on the(5:03:19)
shoulders of renters or a super or a manager I think it's very honourous the(5:03:27)
city does not have the capacity to um to enforce we know it right now we know(5:03:33)

with the issues right now 311 are you kidding me you know a a house could be(5:03:39)
being rebuilt or and you call and you send them pictures they show up two weeks later and have the the the(5:03:46)
building is finished and now all it's finished it's done and they pay a fine and they go on and they destroy the block we live with that in Sunset
Park(5:03:53)
we have been living with that since the 1990s and nobody has to take out the(5:03:58)
offending construction because the city doesn't have the enforcement of the ability okay I'm going to go down and um(5:04:07)
let me see um restaurants most of our restaurants not(5:04:12)
only Sunset Park because I travel around the city a lot are already hosting um music karaoke all of that and(5:04:21)
and I'll leave this with this thought Sunset Park alone has seen an increase(5:04:27)
of knifings because of people getting drunk inside of these restaurants(5:04:33)
be and no you cannot call anybody because no one is and this is around the block from where I live these are blocks(5:04:40)
where on the Avenue families upstairs business two three families upstairs(5:04:46)
with children let me pose my question you to give you an extra a couple seconds here so there so there's a restaurant in the neighborhood
people(5:04:52)
many many restaurants in the neighborhood people getting drunk making noise and it's disturbing people up who(5:04:58)
are who live in the area right so connect that for me to to this this proposal because I I just want to(5:05:05)
understand I I I understand your point about the the hair dying being disruptive obviously that's something that's allowed today you know if
you if(5:05:12)
we enabled a home business There are rules and licensure for home beauty salons things like that but but put that aside for a second let's
talk about this(5:05:18)
and just to give you an extra minute this is all happening in these restaurants when they do not have the(5:05:23)
right to uh host **dancing** they don't have the right to host karaoke because(5:05:30)
they're smaller buildings but they're doing it any way when people when these upstairs neighbors calls 311 for Noise(5:05:37)
by the time they come there's no noise and I understand the nice thing is that(5:05:42)
the violence is growing and it's not just Sunset Park so please I got it(5:05:48)
don't get people I understand I understand okay **thank you** your your point relates significantly to uh to(5:05:54)
enforcement and also to uh existing rules I'll just **observe on the on the**(5:06:00)
nightlife question and music and things like that you know we yeah but I I got it well anyway I I don't need to to harp(5:06:06)
on it except to say that we understand the point that you are making and there are things that we can we can do in(5:06:12)
zoning and there are things that are that we can't but we and we totally understand what you are uh what you're(5:06:17)
talking about here so we're trying to rationalize so that it makes sense in zoning but understand that that does not(5:06:23)
solve all the problems of the world but we we get it I understand I understand your point okay **thank you** for that okay(5:06:29)
let's go to

Ramy dinwi on uh on Zoom Zoom f

ollowed by Laura(5:06:50)
spalter can you folks hear me we can good afternoon uh **my name** is ramidi(5:06:58)
and I'm the environmental justice campaign and policy manager at El pente **thank you** for the opportunity to testify(5:07:03)
today elent is a community- based environmental justice organization located in North Brooklyn founded over(5:07:09)
40 years ago in the south side of Williamsburg luris um elent is also a part of The(5:07:14)
Last Mile Coalition which is a city-wide Coalition of environmental justice and public health Advocates working to regulate Last Mile Trucking
facilities(5:07:21)
in New York City DCPS dedication to updating regulation in response to the changing economic landscape is(5:07:27)
commendable however we express reservations um and we have so before(5:07:33)
regarding current proposals oversight especially concerning Last Mile warehouses and their impact on communities of color it is our belief(5:07:40)

that effectively addressing the challenges posed by rapid growth of e-commerce and specifically the influence of Last Mile warehouses is(5:07:47)

vital for cultivating a vibrant neighborhood and aiding in the economic recovery of New York City recognizing(5:07:54)

the surge in e-commerce as a significant macroeconomic Trend necessa(5:07:59)

necessitating reform city of yes for Economic Opportunity strives to support emerging Industries while minimizing(5:08:05)

adverse effects on other city land uses while DCP C of's proposal introduces the(5:08:11)

micro distribution facilities initiative it falls short in tackling the substantial land use conflicts arising(5:08:17)

from clustering of Last Mile warehouses although focusing on smaller facilities is crucial The Proposal overlooks larger(5:08:24)

facilities operating continuously contributing significantly to congestion safety risk and environmental concerns(5:08:31)

to address this C we advise the City Planning Commission to adopt a comprehensive approach we suggest(5:08:38)

expanding the proposal to include a specific text Amendment defining Last Mile warehouses as a distinct category(5:08:45)

complementing the micro distribution facilities proposal establishing a special permit process for Last Mile(5:08:50)

warehouses allows communities to participate in reviewing the sighting of these facilities the absence of Last Mile(5:08:57)

Warehouse regulation is conspicuous in light of the city of yes uh stated(5:09:03)

objectives tackling this issue is pivotal uh for the proposal's success and aligns with the broader City goal of(5:09:09)

modernizing zoning regulations a zoning text Amendment for Last Mile facilities(5:09:16)

is essential in managing the anticipated growth in Goods movement while prioritizing the well-being of environmental justice communities by(5:09:23)

promoting non-truck or van deliveries and supporting sustainable Transportation options we can alleviate(5:09:28)

congestions Embrace modern delivery practices and reduce the environmental impact on communities of(5:09:34)

color if we are really looking for a city of yes and an Economic Opportunity(5:09:41)

we need to take the the opportunity of today and make sure we do not come back to this later by saying we wish we had(5:09:49)

protected these communities by regulating these facilities we appreciate the opportunity to provide(5:09:54)

these comments and we will further provide written comments *thank you thank you* very much uh *thank you*(5:10:02)

very much um we have questions for you from commissioner(5:10:08)

goodwitch I wanted to ask you a question to give you more time to explain so my(5:10:14)

question is uh can you explain a bit oh do we(5:10:21)

Ling can you still hear me uh one moment I'm checking to see(5:10:26)

what just happened(5:10:44)

just one moment please(5:10:50)

Romo yes I I can still hear you I was just shifted from being a panelist to an(5:10:55)

observer oh okay um so I'll ask my question The Last Mile Warehouse uh in(5:11:01)

contrast to the traditional Warehouse can you talk a bit about how that has specific I I know for myself but I think(5:11:08)

it would be helpful for everyone to hear the specific impacts like the more truck stops because I you know I think what(5:11:14)

you're asking is to make a distinction between a traditional warehouse and a less um mile one so if you could talk a(5:11:21)

bit about how it specifically harms communities of color yes *thank you* for that question um(5:11:27)

for us at The Last Mile Coalition we've worked extensively to answer the question of what is a Last Mile(5:11:32)

warehouse and to us it this facility as we have seen through our studies is(5:11:38)

increases truck routes increases truck traffic in the neighborhoods and communities are being clustered in(5:11:45)

communities for example like Red Hook where then uh we see uh increased emissions from these facilities because(5:11:51)

they operate uh on a 247 basis and they do not just store Goods um at the same(5:11:57)

time um we have traffic congestion because of these trucks we have safety issues and all of these um facilities(5:12:06)

are cited in uh certain manufacturing and Industrial districts which are(5:12:11)

predominantly communities of color historically um impacted by this so what(5:12:17)

we are doing is you know we are taking the previous Antiquated um zoning laws(5:12:23)

that um um linked communities of color with uh industrial hazards and(5:12:29)

Manufacturing hazards and compounding it by allowing these warehouses to be cited as of right in these um communities so(5:12:37)

you know in short it is increased truck traffic it is congestion it is uh(5:12:43)

operating emissions so all of these combined really create a hazardous(5:12:49)

exacerbate the Hazardous condition of these uh disadvantaged communities as they are labeled by the state and the(5:12:54)
city and also the federal(5:12:59)
government *thank you* commissioner Comm s *thank you* chair *thank you* for your testimony um I have a quick follow-up(5:13:06)
question to
commissioner G wiard's question do you mind um sort of like uh(5:13:12)
expanding a little bit on what you said about micro distribution I mean it's clear that you know you're you're(5:13:17)
talking about a larger issue that needs uh additional Provisions to address Last(5:13:23)
Mile facilities but I'm wondering if you can share a little bit your perspective on the micro distribution proposal um(5:13:31)
you know for examp example uh the fact that you know the this could potentially(5:13:36)
lead to additional smaller warehouses in places that that may have additional(5:13:41)
impacts I'm I'm wondering if you can discuss a little bit you know what are your thoughts on on what the stoning text Amendment includes in
that(5:13:53)
regard yeah I mean you know our idea is um it is to have those micro(5:14:01)
distribution centers it allows us to be able to um manage the emissions of those(5:14:08)
uh smaller vehicles that do not produce um as much of uh impact onto the(5:14:14)
communities as big trucks and big uh last mile warehouses so having the create like having the opportunity to(5:14:21)
have those micro distribution centers is a move that um that we can um more or less uh work(5:14:30)
with and kind of regulate in a sense that has lower impacts we can think about(5:14:37)
alternative modes of transportation as well and Delivery for those micro distribution centers so it is a step um(5:14:45)
in the right direction but um there's a long way to go uh before(5:14:52)
before we can consider that um something that *thank you* thanks so much that's that addresses my question I had another(5:14:58)
really quick question which is so a question that I had just uh asked to the commissioner of the Department of small(5:15:04)
businesses was whether you know these proposals actually position the(5:15:09)
industrial sector uh in in in an advantage position given the potential green job growth that is projected with(5:15:17)
you know climate change legislation and so forth and I'm wondering you know what is your take on that do you feel that these proposals are
doing enough in(5:15:23)
terms of attracting green Industries um no it is not do like to us(5:15:33)
it is not doing enough to attract green Industries because it has to be within a within a larger understanding of um(5:15:40)
environmental justice and to ensure that um to ensure that there are actual um(5:15:49)
green jobs that are um beneficial to get these industries um up to uh standard to(5:15:57)
help the communities so again while it it does it does move in a in somewhat it(5:16:05)
nudges us somewhat in the right direction it is still um far away from(5:16:10)
being able to for from us being able to claim that uh it will be attracting green industry um both on a city state(5:16:19)
um level *thank you* very much *thank you* commissioner and *thank you* Mr dinwi for(5:16:25)
uh for being with us today um as we uh get organized and

go to uh uh spalter I(5:16:32)

will note that um the department recognizes the complexity of The Last Mile issue um and(5:16:38)
we are uh continuing to look at it with our city Partners particularly do um and(5:16:43)
you know and I will note about the micro distribution piece of this puzzle is we recognize that is not everything here to(5:16:51)
answer this problem uh by any stretch but it also is part of the solution(5:16:58)
because zoning right now doesn't allow for any any sort of ability for package de delivery to happen in the(5:17:06)
neighborhoods close to people where where the people of uh who are were getting these deliveries live so(5:17:12)
delivery vehicles end up having to drive back and forth between large distribution facilities and people's(5:17:17)
homes and businesses which uh obviously exacerbates the problem so what we are trying to do is reduce the truck trips(5:17:23)
here by uh making the freight deliveries and Logistics more efficient so for more(5:17:30)
discussion on that one but that is is certainly what we are intending to do let's go to

Laura spalter

to be followed(5:17:35)
by Karen poersi okay that might be Karen agenti(5:17:40)
she had to leave and she asked me to relay a message that she will sign on to speak later(5:17:47)
on oh okay let's well let's start with you yeah you got it okay go ahead good(5:17:54)
afternoon *my name* is Laura spalter today I'm speaking in opposition of city of(5:17:59)
yes for Economic Opportunity on behalf of the Broadway Community Alliance a Civic group formed in 2013 to address(5:18:07)
quality of life issues in and around the Broadway Corridor in Riverdale these(5:18:12)
massive deregulation measures will have negative impacts on our residential(5:18:18)
neighborhoods the department of City Planning complains that zoning often presents a barrier to opening operating(5:18:25)
and expanding a business in New York City there is good reason for that in(5:18:30)
their desire to offer new opportunities for businesses to grow City Planning has blurred the common sense lines between(5:18:37)
commercial and residential neighborhoods all in the name of progress this is problematic because by their very nature(5:18:44)
commercial businesses are accompanied by increased garbage deliveries traffic congestion and(5:18:50)
signage um city of yes creates a process for constructing commercial development(5:18:57)
2500 square fet in size on Corner properties in every residential(5:19:02)
neighborhood this is not a debate uh a bodega as the picture showed in the uh(5:19:07)
literature this is big uh current zoning prohibits them here why City Planning(5:19:14)
wants to extend commercial businesses into residential neighborhoods when there are already vacant stores in(5:19:20)
commercial areas is puzzling especially since new commercial businesses May(5:19:25)
compete with the current shopping districts including mom and pop stores(5:19:30)
another radical zoning change allows a process for commercial development up to(5:19:37)
15,000 square fet in residential neighborhoods if an owner owns a minimum of 1 and a half acres called a campus(5:19:45)
plan the department of City Planning references conversion of the bottom floors of Nitra buildings as if they are(5:19:51)
useless appendages this zoning change May incentivize developers to tear down(5:19:57)
private homes or low-scale buildings in residential neighborhoods for commercial use how hard is it for a developer to(5:20:04)
tear down homes to combine Lots in order to reach the criteria of one and a half(5:20:10)
acres we oppose the zoning changes developed by the mayor's office of nightlife to promote live music **dancing**(5:20:16)
and entertainment while this proposal does not apply to residential districts per se Our concern is noise from(5:20:24)
commercial districts carrying over into adjacent residential areas we are currently living through cuts to police(5:20:30)
and other enforc ment agencies and fear the unintended consequences of this change we also oppose the proposed(5:20:37)
zoning changes to allow home businesses in residential neighborhoods um to increase their square footage and(5:20:44)
employees and business categories when complaints for Neighbors arrive it will fall on the department of buildings and(5:20:51)
other agencies to coordinate and monitor a disaster City planning's one-sized(5:20:56)
fits all approach will destroy the unique character of our residential community(5:21:01)
while ignoring the struggles facing our commercial areas *thank you* for this uh(5:21:06)
opportunity *thank you* very much we appreciate you being with us today um I(5:21:11)
will note that in in corner stores uh as proposed every instance would require(5:21:18)
some form of environmental review uh and the way that the rule is being written(5:21:25)
says that any business that generates more than a minimum of traffic would not even be allowed so I just think that(5:21:31)
that's worth noting um okay is Karen pki there or is that the person who uh she(5:21:37)
was cited okay different person different person different spelling different pronunciation totally different person(5:21:43)
okay but is she there because I called her out first no I do not see Karen in Zoom okay um all right so we we're going(5:21:50)
to go to Molin MAA of the regional plan Association and then I believe we have an elected official coming(5:21:59)
in up to(5:22:16)
DC Molen you should be able to unmute in Zoom good(5:22:23)
afternoon

my name is mol meta

and I'm New York director here at Regional plan Association I want to thank chair gnik(5:22:30)
and all the members of the commission for the opportunity to testify today in support of the city of yes for Economic(5:22:36)
Opportunity zoning text Amendment post-pandemic Trends have created shifts that impact where New Yorkers are(5:22:42)
spending their time and money increasingly outside of the traditional Central business district emerging(5:22:48)
economic hubs in more residential parts of the city have seen the benefit of these changes and we must lean into(5:22:53)
these new Dynamics in order to Foster Equitable growth and to revitalize to realize the goal of reimagining our(5:23:00)
commercial districts as vibrant work live play destinations unfortunately the success(5:23:05)
has also meant that commercial rents outside of Manhattan have risen and industrial space has also become one of(5:23:10)
the most expensive markets in the country increasing costs and Regulatory hurdles have made it harder for smaller(5:23:16)
businesses or longtime Community Staples to expand and continue to serve their communities existing commercial(5:23:22)
districts also need to diversify our analysis of dozens of Transit oriented commercial clusters around the city we(5:23:28)
found that many established districts are too homogeneous is to become 24/7 destinations in Greater Midtown for(5:23:34)
example 73% of built floor area is commercial space and it has approximately 11 workers for every(5:23:41)
resident while the average across other commercial areas is closer to two workers for every resident the increase(5:23:47)
in local shopping and dining has also led to demands for better services and programming especially for the public(5:23:52)
realm however existing zoning makes managing these changes difficult for example managing deliveries is hard when(5:23:59)
hubs are prohibited in commercial districts no one likes double parking or idling creating congestion and pollution(5:24:05)
arbitrary vacancy regulations make it difficult to fill vacant storefronts creating an ey sore for communities and(5:24:11)
limiting opportunities for small businesses this is especially problematic since the pandemic has resulted in Long vacancies and(5:24:18)
residential districts already cover 75% of the city's zoned land area we need our zoning code to help us reactivate(5:24:25)
once thriving commercial corridors zoning tools won't solve these issues overnight but they they can set a(5:24:31)
framework to help us achieve better outcomes for neighborhoods and small businesses in the long term we have to(5:24:36)
seize this opportunity and the City of yes proposal will make it easier for businesses to find affordable space and(5:24:41)
invest in the communities instead of being forced to relocate or curtail Innovation we can achieve better(5:24:47)
outcomes while continuing to protect the health safety and quality of life that communities deserve over a century ago(5:24:54)
our city adopted the country's first comprehensive zoning framework it was meant to solve problems and improve(5:25:00)
quality of Life while guiding future change for New Yorkers it's been over six decades since(5:25:06)
we've made significant changes just led to our current regulations being ill suited to help us address our new(5:25:13)
reality we need to make it easier and more affordable for small businesses and entrepreneurs to contribute to this great City to encourage
better Street(5:25:19)
designs and organization in the right way and to ensure residents can more easily access the things they need and to finally do away with
arbitrary and(5:25:25)
inequitable regulations *thank you* for your time great *thank you* very much we(5:25:30)
appreciate your uh your testimony uh and we're going to go *next* to uh local(5:25:36)

council member Chris Marte!!

can I say local council member because he's the council member for the district where we(5:25:41)
are sitting right now uh council member uh whenever you are ready you can go(5:25:47)
ahead and get started hello chair and Commissioners *thank you* for allowing me to testify(5:25:52)
today I'm council member Christopher Marte and I represent district one which covers Lower Manhattan I condemn uh I(5:26:00)
commend uh DCP for taking on this tremendous effort and share the belief that zoning regulation should evolve(5:26:06)
alongside the changes we see in our city this text Amendment includes different zoning strategies and attempt to address(5:26:13)
commercial vacancies but I do not believe more lenient and uniform rules address the biggest challenges facing(5:26:19)
our small businesses which is rent allowing more kind of uses in storefront(5:26:25)

doesn't lower the tens of thousands of dollars that landlord across the city charge for even the smallest of(5:26:31)
storefronts while I know commercial rent cannot be directly regulated by zoning I hope this Administration as a whole can(5:26:37)
take a more direct approach to the vacancy and Rental crisis stripping away(5:26:43)
what zoning we do have to support small business and regulate commercial uses(5:26:48)
will only make things worse zoning regulations is meant to help balance our City's diverse needs and uses sweeping(5:26:56)
deregulation will tip the scale to serve the groups that already have too much power like large Property Owners chain(5:27:02)
stores and predatory predatory developers specifically newly expanded(5:27:08)
production and Commercial uses should be limited in primarily residential areas(5:27:13)
the vast amount of newly allowed production only uses in districts like C1 and C2 should be regulated in order(5:27:20)
to preserve neighborhood storefronts with required consumer facing components and stricter expansions of uses(5:27:27)
allowance in my own District I've seen how the storefronts can be occupied by grocery delivery warehouses that don't(5:27:35)
require any foot traffic their large footprint not only darkens the block but(5:27:40)
limits residents access to services that do require that do require a storefront(5:27:45)
and serve a walk-in purpose like tailor barber shops and bodegas in addition(5:27:51)
home occupation should be kept in mind the kind of uses and traffic that can NE negatively impact residential buildings(5:27:58)
and a floor area cap should be maintained the scope of new amusement and Recreation should also be restricted(5:28:06)
to ensure that the Commerce oriented District prioritizes more basic needs of(5:28:11)
residents and workers second residents must be protected in mix use buildings(5:28:17)
there's not a council member in the city that doesn't receive daily complaints from residents about the quality of life(5:28:23)
issues stemming from restaurants and bars but as a representative of of(5:28:28)
neighborhoods that are almost entirely mix use I can say confidently that existing regulation is already far too(5:28:35)
weak this text Amendment must differentiate between small bars and restaurants that might want to have a(5:28:42)
weekly live music or dance and large ticketed venues residents living(5:28:48)
directly above a bar like pianos or even blocks away from a venue like the Rooftop at Pier 17 experience almost(5:28:55)
daily violation to their right just to a good night's sleep but whether pianos(5:29:01)
large parties that spill onto the streets with no enforcements or peers DJs and concerts that Echo throughout(5:29:07)
the entire sport this text Amendment must do more to step up enforcement of(5:29:13)
environmental standards for noise air quality and vibration to apply to all(5:29:18)
businesses additionally these new mix use reg regulations should only go one(5:29:24)
way from commercial to residential so it does not lead to a loss of housing third(5:29:31)
some expansion of BSA variances and new as a right allowances weaken critical(5:29:36)
oversight for some of our most controversial uses and programs corner stores in residential district and micro(5:29:44)
micro distribution facilities should face extra approvals like through a CPC(5:29:50)
a CPC special permit I am especially against new commercial allowances on(5:29:55)
Nicha campuses without proper community and Council oversight we we live in a(5:30:01)
racist economic system and residents who have worked hard to undo stereotypes and(5:30:06)
build a safer and healthier public housing communities deserve inputs on what kind of establishments are going(5:30:12)
into these commercial spaces they don't need any more fast food corporations or(5:30:17)
liquor stores targeting this very vulnerable population I hope all testimonies her(5:30:24)
today are thoroughly incorporated into this text Amendment and I look forward to making this not just just about(5:30:31)
flexibility for landlords but more Equitable robust and affordable economy(5:30:37)
for all New Yorkers zoning at its core is meant to protect the health the safety and quality of life for people(5:30:43)
who live here the regulations that shaped our city for 60 years may not be(5:30:48)
the most relevant anymore but I don't believe the solution is to strip away protection but rather to modernize and(5:30:55)
strengthen them I recommend we keep the guard rails we have in place now before(5:31:00)
facing the consequences later I will be submitting a more detailed testimony(5:31:05)
that goes through every single goal of the plan after this hearing but thank you again chair ganic for allowing me to(5:31:12)
testify and hope this day doesn't last too long for you thank you uh thank you council(5:31:19)
member we appreciate you being here and and appreciate your your comments and we'll look forward to your your detailed(5:31:25)

uh review and we'll look forward to continuing that conversation uh about uh(5:31:30)
how um you know you think that this can best achieve the goals that we're that you're talking about here um uh so we we(5:31:38)
will look forward to that I will the only the only notes that I would make for your benefit as we as we continue that conversation is you know
we do make(5:31:45)
distinctions between the small bars and the large ticketed venues for the reasons that you you noted and want to continue to do that um and
I think that(5:31:52)
one of the issues that is important for us and we should talk about this further is um while you're correct we can't(5:31:58)
regulate the price of for commercial businesses um one of the goals of this(5:32:04)
proposal is through better defining use groups and also through creating more(5:32:10)
options for businesses and entrepreneurs we hope that that will give them the(5:32:15)
flexibility to seek more more options for space in way they don't need to just rely on the singular options that they(5:32:21)
have and so I I take your points very seriously and we will look forward to reviewing all those with you but I did(5:32:27)
just want to make that point just for the benefit everybody as to why we we think that that could have the benefit(5:32:35)
of uh overall reducing costs for businesses and creating more opportunities for businesses and entrepreneurs in this process but we'll(5:32:41)
we obviously will continue that conversation so *thank you thank you* chair all right um okay let's go to uh(5:32:49)

Kelly Carol of the Atlantic Avenue(5:32:58)

bid(5:33:04)
good afternoon Cher gnik and Commissioners *my name* is Kelly Carol I'm the executive director of the Atlantic Avenue bid in Brooklyn we
represent over(5:33:12)
300 small businesses in boram hill cabba hill Brooklyn Heights and downtown(5:33:18)
Brooklyn between the BQE and Fourth Avenue *thank you* for hearing my testimony today and *thank you* to DCP(5:33:24)
staff for meeting with our staff and explaining a lot of these proposals our district is mainly(5:33:31)
composed of the Atlantic Avenue subdistrict which is within the downtown Brooklyn special zoning District this(5:33:37)
special subdistrict along with the presence of four designated New York City Historic districts is why Atlantic(5:33:43)
Avenue is an aesthetically distinct commercial quor as such we are satisfied that the proposed text Amendment will(5:33:49)
not supersede our special district provisions and that the particular rules for Atlantic Avenue will remain so that(5:33:56)
our look and feel as a local and Regional destination will be preserved we welcome the text amendment that will(5:34:02)
eliminate hindrances from storefronts and historic districts currently storefronts located in a residen(5:34:08)
district that are also in a historic district cannot be reoccupied with commercial use if they are vacant for(5:34:13)
more than two years this proposal eliminates this arbitrary two-year deadline and allows our vacant storefronts to reopen commercial(5:34:20)
activity on Atlantic Avenue dates to the early 1840s and our side streets historically are head storefronts as(5:34:25)
well this change will legalize some of our dearest Legacy businesses such as montero's bar Long Island Bar the(5:34:31)
Brooklyn Heights Deli and nearly all of our side street businesses between Hicks and Clinton streets we also support(5:34:38)
allowing new corner stores in residential areas corner stores characterize our district and adjacent neighborhoods and currently no new(5:34:43)
stores can open in residential areas The Proposal would allow new stores of 2500 square feet or less to open within 100(5:34:50)
feet of an intersection this creates new places for small businesses to open and will enhance Public Safety by having(5:34:56)
additional Lighting on or near corners of blocks finally Atlantic Avenue serves(5:35:01)
our neighbors in guan's houses who come here to shop and dine this proposal introduces commercial uses in on Nicha(5:35:07)
campuses for the first time considering the fact that Nicha residents have been isolated and marginalized from the(5:35:13)
commercial conveniences of city life for decades development of commercial space for the benefit of an outside entity(5:35:19)
should strictly should be strictly and deeply tied to the benefit of Nitra residents examples of this could include(5:35:25)
entrepreneurship opportunities for residents and special lease access and terms unless this is an opportunity for(5:35:31)
Nicha residents to be empowered by the commercial reasoning we do not support it we understand that DCP regulates use and(5:35:38)
not the tenant but as proposed the text is too vague right now without explicit Provisions for Nicha the development of(5:35:45)
commercial space within Nicha does not benefit the local Nicha community enough to Merit it *thank you* very(5:35:52)

much okay *thank you* very much Miss Carol we'll move on to Michelle Cooper Smith followed by Candace Thompson's(5:36:16)
aary Michelle does not appear to be in the room does not appear to be in the room(5:36:22)
you said okay let's how about Candace Thompson Zachary Candace in okay Candace is and(5:36:29)
how about Karen arti we heard that K Karen arti was gone is that we heard from before well we'll give that a whirl(5:36:34)
in a sec she's *next* okay

Candace Thompson Zachary!

whenever hello(5:36:42)
welcome um greetings sh garnik uh *my name* is Candace Thompson Zachary she her(5:36:48)
pronouns and I'm the co-executive director of **dance** NYC a service organization advancing the interests of(5:36:54)
dance and the **dance** industry in New York I am here today in support of the city(5:37:00)
of yes Economic Opportunity proposal and more specifically supporting the removal of **dance** related restrictions from the(5:37:07)
zoning text for nightlife and entertainment venues as well as creating more available locations for **dance**(5:37:13)
businesses including an empty storefronts and local neighborhoods the current restrictions on **Dance** stem from(5:37:19)
The Cabaret law that we all know was created to prevent racial integration in jazz clubs and then weaponized against(5:37:25)
many other marginalized groups we have a great opportunity to to put that ugly past behind us uh remove a tool that is(5:37:33)
often unfairly wielded against bipolar immigrant lgbtqia plus communities and(5:37:38)
move into a future where we can **dance** and express ourselves freely we owe it to the great city of New York to create(5:37:45)
an environment where **dance** and art can Thrive and its businesses venues and entities are free from discrimination(5:37:52)
and burdensome bureaucracy the removal of these restrictions also benefits the(5:37:57)
dance Workforce with increased job opportunities with a greater option for standardized wages and protections it(5:38:05)
will benefit neighborhoods by creating local creative economies and having local meeting places where people can(5:38:11)
gather safety fostering joy and creativity at a time when we need it most these hubs like small bars and(5:38:18)
restaurants and event spaces play a pivotal role in giving rise to new cultural forms and phenomena like hip(5:38:25)
hop like salsa that were born in largely social Gathering spaces being uh accessible social **dancing** in(5:38:33)
Nightlife venues across New York is foundational for our advocacy uh and lastly as the city is(5:38:39)
actively looking to increase its economic Outlook this industry not only benefits residents but also attracts(5:38:46)
tourists internationally nationally and domestically who come to New York not only to experience Broadway but also the(5:38:52)
local neighborhood culture that our five borers offer our nightlife entertainment(5:38:57)
creates about 6.3 billion in economic output and separately the creative sector overall creates about 110 billion(5:39:04)
so we want to leverage that as much as we can um just want to commend the department of city planning for all of(5:39:10)
their efforts in making this happen and I look forward to more vibrant **dancing** for our **dance** constituents and for New(5:39:16)
York as a whole *thank you* great *thank you thank you* very much we appreciate you being here with us um okay let's

(5:39:24)

move on to Karen argenti is she here(5:39:32)

okay I think we heard that perhaps she was not from one of the prior uh people who testified let's look for Olive(5:39:51)

Freud Olive

we're trying to promote you and(5:39:58)

zoom and you should be able to unmute(5:40:12)

now all of you should be able to(5:40:28)

unmute all of you should be able to unmute in(5:40:37)

Zoom now how about now can you hear me we got you yeah all right thanks welcome(5:40:44)

go right ahead all right I can't see anything that's going on but I guess if(5:40:49)

you could see me that's all that's important well we can we can hear you loud and clear uh we can't see you but(5:40:57)

we can hear you so all right that's okay with you then you should go right ahead and okay let we're ready uh city of yes(5:41:05)

c y city of what what are the things um(5:41:10)

yeah yes to whom reading the whole proposal it is obvious the the(5:41:17)

developers will benefit but not so the residents of the city(5:41:24)

koi looks like a dis dismantling of regul(5:41:29)

ations put into place over generations to make living something better for New(5:41:36)

Yorkers koi seems to do away with ulip and public input some of the most(5:41:43)

egregious proposals are um among commercial(5:41:49)

Enterprises into the upper allowing commercial Enterprises into the upper floors of residential buildings such as(5:41:57)

dentist office of beauti call us a Prof a proliferation of restaurants to(5:42:04)

include **dancing** on the second floors or whatever of residential buildings amusements such of now such of(5:42:12)

those now restricted to con Islands will be allowed throughout the city a case in(5:42:20)

point is the a th000 foot super toall construction on 46th Street and 8th(5:42:27)

Avenue for the upper 3 100 floors are to include a free fall ride that is now(5:42:34)

illegal in Midtown this plan is currently being(5:42:39)

challenged at the department of buildings but would be allowed in the(5:42:45)

proposed Coy commercial use of up to 15,000(5:42:51)

square feet would be permitted into Nicha projects and into large scale(5:42:57)

residential projects such as Lincoln towers and Park West Village the city(5:43:04)

will destroy these outstanding past victories for urban living that include(5:43:09)

light in every window Gardens and benches these priorities these provided(5:43:16)

an improved quality of life for urban dwellers Koy dares to destroy(5:43:25)

this more business s belong in restaurant in Resident IAL areas nor ls(5:43:31)

it wise to increase density in the most dense(5:43:36)

neighborhoods Manhattan has 74,000 people per square mile Brooklyn(5:43:44)

38,000 Queens 22,000 and Manhattan during the business day has a(5:43:51)

70 170,000 these are the most dense areas in the city in the(5:43:58)

world worlds putting business into residential housing is the wrong approach the city(5:44:05)

should be making residence making residential more(5:44:12)

attractive less dense resilience to climate change with less noise and(5:44:18)

congestion whenever I hear the word growth I'm I hear grow **thank you** you mean the(5:44:27)

three minutes yeah you're up but finish your finish your thought and and then we'll we'll go to the **next** person well the(5:44:34)

idea of growth in the most overcrowded city is is impossible to understand it's(5:44:40)

as though no one ever heard of uh global warming of SE(5:44:45)

rise that's what we should be doing thinking about now and I I I just(5:44:50)
don't know where people are thinking they don't have seem to have mind on the larger part okay thank *thank you* thank(5:44:57)
you very much for for being with us today we're going to move on to the *next* person on our list Kevin Garcia of the(5:45:03)
New York environmental justice Alliance uh and queuing up cliff brookstein and(5:45:09)

Rod Herbert on(5:45:18)

Deck I do not see Kevin Garcia in the zoom room okay how about cliff(5:45:27)
brookstein he is not in the zoom okay how about Rod Herbert yes promoting(5:45:37)
now had some fans in the audience it seems okay all right Mr Herbert whenever(5:45:42)
you're ready(5:45:55)
welcome promotions are just taking a few extra minutes right now I think it may be a low bandwidth(5:46:05)
issue okay should we should we wait and and what what do you want us to do(5:46:12)
Tom um we could just give it a few more(5:46:18)
seconds no(5:46:27)
problem(5:46:40)
Rod you should be able to unmute and(5:46:57)
zoom(5:47:04)
Rod you should be able to unmute and(5:47:16)
zoom he may have stepped away come back we can come back to(5:47:27)
him hold on let's Okay Let's do let's do um(5:47:33)
Kevin Garcia and Michelle Cooper Smith and we'll bring um Mr Herbert up after(5:47:39)
maybe he'll be back by(5:47:50)
then Kevin you should be able to unmute and soon great um good afternoon everyone uh(5:47:57)

my name is Kevin Garcia

I am the transportation planner with the New York City environmental justice Alliance(5:48:03)
thank you for the opportunity to speak today uh founded in 1991 Nija is a Citywide membership Network linking(5:48:10)
Grassroots organizations from low-income communities of color in the struggle for environmental justice we appreciate DCPS(5:48:17)
efforts in recognizing the need to update regulations to align with the evolving economic landscape however we(5:48:25)
are concerned about the oversight in the current proposal particular particularly in the context of lasma warehouses and(5:48:31)
their impact on communities of color we believe that addressing the challenges posed by the rapid rise of e-commerce(5:48:38)
particularly the impact of Las mile warehouses is crucial for fostering vibrant neighborhoods and supporting the(5:48:44)
economic opportun uh recovery of New York City the rise of e-commerce is(5:48:49)
identified as a key macroeconomic Trend necessitating reform and the City of yes(5:48:54)
aims to support emerging Industries while minimizing the adverse effects on other land uses in the city although(5:49:01)
DCPS city of yes proposal introduces an initiative in the form of micro distribution facilities it falls short(5:49:08)
of addressing the significant land use conflicts stemming from the clustering of Last Mile warehouses the proposal's(5:49:15)
focus on smaller facilities is crucial but it misses the larger facilities that operate around the clock and contribute(5:49:22)
substantially to congestion safety risks and environmental concerns to rectify(5:49:27)
this we urg the City Planning Commission to take a comprehensive approach and propose an expansion of the city of yes(5:49:33)
proposal to incorporate a specific text Amendment defining last Mount warehouses as a distinct category to complement the(5:49:40)
micro distribution facilities proposal and establish a special permit process for Last Mile warehouses so that(5:49:47)
communities can participate in reviewing the sighting of these facilities the omission of Last Mile warehouses(5:49:53)
regulation stands out in light of the city of yes's stated objectives and address adding this issue is crucial to(5:50:00)

the success of the city of yes proposals and aligns with the city's broader goals of modernizing zoning regulations a(5:50:07) zoning text Amendment for Last Mile warehouses is crucial for managing the anticipated growth in Goods movements(5:50:13) while prioritizing the well-being of environmental justice communities and by promoting non-traffic or van uh(5:50:19) deliveries and supporting sustainable Transportation options we can alleviate congestion Embrace modern delivery(5:50:26) practices and reduce the enviro environmental impact on communities of color *thank you* so much for your time(5:50:32) and consideration and the ability to provide these comments great *thank you* very much we(5:50:38) appreciate it um and hold on one sec I have a question for you from commissioner ooro *thank you* chair thank(5:50:45) you so much for your testimony I I have a quick question so we we've heard a couple times now today about the like(5:50:51) this larger issue the chair clarified to us uh how the the specific component(5:50:57) that is right now within the proposal is just a piece of the larger puzzle but I'm wondering if you can clarify for us(5:51:02) like what is the status of that larger puzzle like are is there uh Are there(5:51:08) specific recommendations that that that have been that you will include that you will share is there another sort of like(5:51:14) a larger scope of work that we should review in this regard can you help us understand what you are referring to yeah uh happy to do so and *thank you*(5:51:22) so much for the question commissioner so um you know one of the things that we do acknowledge is that you know regular(5:51:28) ating Last Mile warehouses introducing these micro distribution facilities are pieces to the puzzle of really(5:51:34) regulating e-commerce right uh it's very similar to the uh City legislation that(5:51:39) was passed um last year um that that was introduced by Council M vas to redesign(5:51:45) our truck networks um so you know we understand there are a lot of tools in(5:51:51) the box that we're going to need in order to regulate these last mile warehouses but they're different than(5:51:57) these distribution facilities right um they're much larger in footprint building footprint size uh and they're(5:52:03) operating 24 hours uh 7 days a week and you know their demand for uh a lot more(5:52:10) trucks uh hundreds thousands of truck deliveries every day is leading to uh uh(5:52:15) greater vehicle traffic congestion and air pollution um so what we've done is submitted uh a zoning text Amendment uh(5:52:23) as a coalition to regulate these last mile warehouses but what we've also done um we've submitted comments we submitted(5:52:29) them yesterday and what we've done is in those uh comments we've drafted texts(5:52:35) that um you know mirrors the language that's for the micro distribution facility facilities and you know(5:52:42) complements th that proposal um and and happy to go further into that but(5:52:48) basically what ours would do uh the text that we propos is Define what Last Mile(5:52:53) warehouses are um and then also create that special permit process so that we(5:52:58) can you know provide these distances between these facilities and and site(5:53:04) them you know uh a certain distance 1,00 ft to be exact from you know uh playgrounds schools uh nursing homes and(5:53:12) and public housing developments so that we're protecting some of the most vulnerable communities in our(5:53:18) city *thank you thank you* for that and and this is what you were referring to as what we're proposing these are part(5:53:24) of your written comments submitted in in response to this text Amendment or is there something else that you referring(5:53:31) to uh it's uh the lad it's it's uh in our written comments that we submitted(5:53:36) yesterday um so we submitted um yeah *thank you* I look forward to reading them(5:53:42) *thank you* so much *thank you* very much commissioner and *thank you* again Mr Garcia uh let's move on to

Michelle(5:53:48)

Cooper Smith

please and Then followed by um uh Mr(5:53:55)

Herbert hi um my I apologize I'm actually taking my grandmother to a(5:54:00)

doctor's appointment right now so I apologize if there's any background noise um that's okay we understand not a(5:54:07)
problem yeah uh good afternoon *my name* is Michelle Cooper Smith and I'm a resident of Manhattan Community District(5:54:13)
3 um *thank you* Commissioners for taking the long hours out of your day to listen to us residents I support uh city of yes(5:54:21)
Economic Opportunity because I know it would modernize several much needed zoning regulations that are currently(5:54:27)
holding our City back as we try to adapt and grow post pandemic I ask that the commission Take Manhattan Community(5:54:34)
board 3's resolution that I believe it will be submitted to you to not support the ZTA with conditions with a large(5:54:40)
grain of salt the resolution only passed the board with 19 votes 38% of board(5:54:45)
members according to the Department of City Planning approximately 155,000 people live in this District I do not(5:54:52)
see how we can consider the voices of 19 board members or 0 one% of the population to be repres inative not only(5:54:59)
does the resolution submitted ignore the needs our district have such as allowing micro distribution centers for Last Mile(5:55:05)
deliveries to help alleviate the Gonzo distribution centers popping up on our streets and sidewalks but board members(5:55:11)
were not given time to substantively debate the resolution at cb3 full board meeting last night because the(5:55:16)
resolution on the vote sheet was incorrect the resolution was effectively jammed down the throat of the board members with a call to fall in
line and(5:55:23)
vote without debate because the board was out of time to debate and amend I also believe that the consultant that(5:55:28)
mcb3 hired misled the board and many other boards about the potential outcomes of the zoning amendments so(5:55:34)
please Commissioners evaluate if this is the type of input that really represents our communities *thank you* so(5:55:39)
much *thank you* we appreciate uh you're being with us U okay let's move on to(5:55:45)
Rod Herbert who I believe is now promoted and ready it appears Rod's gonna call in so(5:55:52)
we'll we'll wait for his phone number and then we can move on we should move to the *next* one okay so let's go to Jerry scup we'll come back
to Mr Herbert(5:55:58)

by phone Jerry scup of the Garment District(5:56:17)

Alliance hello can you hear me hello(5:56:22)
yeah great uh *thank you* uh commissioner grodnik and members of the commission for holding this hearing on on the city(5:56:28)
of yes proposal *my name* is jar scop and I am vice president of the Garment District Alliance a business improvement(5:56:34)
district in Midtown Manhattan and we strongly support this proposal this(5:56:40)
proposal will enable the city to unlock potential in neighborhoods like the Garment District that were historically(5:56:46)
economically significant but are now economically depressed the proposed changes will modernize the city's zoning(5:56:52)
regulations to support small business in businesses in our commercial corridors so that they are aligned with our(5:56:59)
adjacent neighborhoods while creating opportunities for those businesses to thrive eliminating Antiquated rules that(5:57:07)
dictate how a business's own space can be used and simplifying regulations that contribute to(5:57:13)
storefront vacancies are much needed and long overdue changes this initiative Fosters a more(5:57:20)
adaptive Dynamic environment for our local entrepreneurs simplifies and streamlines(5:57:25)
zoning regulations and makes it easy easier for businesses to find and utilize their(5:57:31)
space the proposed changes are of critical importance to the Garment District this historically single(5:57:37)
industry neighborhood needs the ability to adapt so that it can appeal to new(5:57:42)
users from all Industries we also welcome the changes that will enable the potential for a future residential(5:57:49)
population here that can support our ground floor retail and transform this area into a true mixed use neighborhood(5:57:56)
contributing to the vi of our city we really want to thank DCP for their honest and thorough Outreach to the(5:58:03)
community on this matter and we look forward to an expeditious implementation of these initiatives *thank you* sir thank(5:58:11)
you commissioner Benjamin has a question yeah Mr scop it's not my understand(5:58:16)
or is it your understanding that these zoning changes would CH make changes to(5:58:23)
the Garment Center special district and the underlying Provisions in the special special(5:58:29)
district well I don't think that the special district Provisions apply anymore regarding garment(5:58:36)
manufacturing but I would defer to city planning for(5:58:42)
that that's okay *thank you* you're welcome okay *thank you* uh Mr(5:58:50)
scup *thank you* for being with us we appreciate your support um let me move on to step Fabian of Evergreen(5:58:58)

oh I'm sorry do we have um Mr Herbert no not yet right not(5:59:04)
yet not yet okay sorry so let's go

to Stephen(5:59:24)

Fabian hi good afternoon *my name* is Stephen fan I'm the program(5:59:30)

manager for real estate and planning at Evergreen Inc your North Brooklyn business exchange Evergreen is a(5:59:36)
membership organization based in East Williamsburg that Champions manufacturing creative production and(5:59:42)
Industrial Service businesses in North Brooklyn and Beyond I'm testifying today in support of city of yes for Zoning for(5:59:49)
Economic Opportunity though with some suggested modifications to the proposal Evergreen appreciates city of yes's(5:59:55)
intent to keep New York City a thriving City and the attention paid to zoning policy for industrial areas as well as(6:00:02)
the opportunities we've had to engage with DCP throughout this process we believe that much of what is compiled in(6:00:08)
18 proposals would have a positive effect on making things easier and more conducive for economic growth we are(6:00:14)
also quite pleased that there is no plan to add residential uses to the industrial business zones which are the(6:00:19)
heart of our manufacturing communities throughout the city however we have some recommendations for changes to the plan(6:00:25)
that likely could have negative impacts on our manufacturing businesses uh my comments will focus on proposal 18 which(6:00:32)
is going to create three new districts of the m3a core the m2a transition and(6:00:37)
the M1A growth areas we like that in all of these districts industrial uses will(6:00:42)
gain density in the form of increased F and be better able to grow in place in(6:00:48)
the m3a core we recommend that non-industrial uses that are not compatible in a core manufacturing(6:00:53)
District be limited in size preferably to 10,000 square fet uh rather than a 1.0 F requirement the(6:01:01)
core should be a protected area for manufacturing businesses as we've seen that infringement of non-compatible uses(6:01:07)
has an effect of driving up land costs and making it more difficult to conduct business(6:01:12)
operations in m2a transition we recommend that the density bonus is applied with the retention or creation(6:01:18)
of at least 1.0 F manufacturing use making it more of a requirement than an option to have manufacturing and new(6:01:24)
developments in these areas an M1 growth both we recommend applying a stronger incentive of at least 1.0 F(6:01:31)
manufacturing use added for any project with seeking bonus density in all three(6:01:36)
of these areas while we know it's outside the purview of zoning we strongly recommend the establishment of(6:01:42)
oversight mechanisms to ensure the uses are what they're supposed to be and that any industrial uses that are are(6:01:48)
actually that any industrial uses included are actually feasible for industrial activity meaning that they(6:01:54)
would have proper ceiling Heights floor loads and so forth in closing we would also like to highlight our support for(6:02:00)
other proposals such as number four on updating loading requirements number six(6:02:05)
on modernizing the zoning code number 17 on waivers of bulking uh on waivers of(6:02:11)
bulking requirements and as well as uh generally three five 8 9 10 and 14 on(6:02:18)
potentially relieving pressure on M zones by expanding to other areas uh *thank you* and that's all great *thank you*(6:02:27)
very much we're going to move *next* to Jeremiah Cain of prologis it'll be followed by Robin(6:02:36)
Abrams so do we have Jeremiah(6:02:43)
Cain Madame secretary we have Jeremiah K he is being promoted now(6:02:56)
great(6:03:01)
hello hello uh I'm

Jeremiah Kane with prologis p

rologis is a developer and(6:03:08)
owner of logistics facil facilities worldwide handling the movement of goods equal to about 3% of global gross(6:03:14)

domestic product our local team develops and holds a range of property types in the New York metropolitan area from(6:03:21)
Modern sustainable Harborfront sites in New Jersey to Innovative multi-story facilities developed in Long Island City(6:03:28)
uh pris leases these sites to a variety of customers from small and mediumsized businesses to the world's largest Brands(6:03:35)
uh that ensure products and materials arrive when and where they are needed and I think this unique role provides us(6:03:42)
with an insight and understanding of the industry's current and upcoming needs uh pris is also a leader in sustainable(6:03:49)
development in major markets around the world and we are on track to be carbon neutral in our construction efforts by(6:03:54)
2025 and are a global leader an on-site solar generation uh we commend the city(6:04:00)
on its forward-looking actions to provide greater Clarity and certainty under the zoning and the City of yes(6:04:06)
initiative and the proposed text Amendment will support growing industries by reducing impediments for a range of business types uh
Among The(6:04:13)
Helpful clarifications we think in The Proposal especially with regard to micro distribution uses in commercial(6:04:20)
districts uh is we think that this is going to be an important ongoing work by the city to reduce truck traffic and(6:04:26)
provide for efficient movement of goods uh furthering uh efforts like the New York City commercial cargo bicycle pilot(6:04:33)
and the Dot's micro hubs pilot in 2023 and the ongoing blue highways initiative(6:04:38)
as well um micro distribution facilities are critical function at the neighborhood level of distribution this(6:04:45)
allows for off hours truck loading and it facilitates daytime delivery by lower(6:04:50)
impact modes such as electric cargo bicycles uh to accomplish this goal we(6:04:55)
urge the planned controls to allow for the 15,000 square feet uh to be(6:05:01)
permitted entirely at grade as currently proposed in the C4 and C7 districts or C4 through C7 uh 5,000 square F feet(6:05:09)
would be permitted on the ground floor and 10,000 square feet would be permitted above the ground floor well(6:05:14)
that 5,000 square feet uh may be sufficient for racking or shelving it does not provide the necessary support(6:05:21)
space for a facility that can actually remove the staging and vehicles from the street uh and instead will require(6:05:28)
vehicle elevator or in additional Materials Handling that would make these uh we think they would make these facilities infeasible in most
cases so(6:05:35)
to be successful in highdensity micro distribution you need vehicle staging Material Handling uh electric vehicle(6:05:41)
charging areas and then office space and bathrooms and break rooms and things like that so uh then as of right 15,000(6:05:49)
foot allowance the ground floor can include all of those functions as well as maintaining the transparency and activating the streetcape uh
so to(6:05:57)
highlight the above points we're also separately sharing uh layouts of uh we think functional micro distribution(6:06:02)
facilities that fit that uh archetype uh *thank you* for your time and consideration *thank you* very much um(6:06:10)
let's move on to

Robin Abrams(6:06:22)

please we are promoting now(6:06:27)
thought there was a no easy policy here yes hi uh this is Robin Abrams I'm Vice(6:06:33)
chairman of compus and I run the Abrams retail strategies group I focus on(6:06:39)
retail Leasing and Consulting and I have been involved um in real estate and(6:06:44)
lived and worked in New York City my entire adult life which is over four decades uh I'm first want to start by(6:06:52)
saying that I do strongly support the city of yes the Zoning for economic opportunity I'm very appreciative that(6:07:00)
the city has revised the zoning text which had been dated and didn't properly address many of the retailers concerns I(6:07:08)
recognize there are many positive modifications with regard to the uses(6:07:13)
that give retailers broader ability to locate their businesses in particular the recreation and entertainment uses(6:07:20)
will benefit but there are still some issues of concern and I want to talk(6:07:25)
about one specific issue today the regulation that calls for a minimum of(6:07:31)
30 feet of depth for retailers will hinder retailers ability to locate(6:07:38)
secure space and effectively operate and I think in particular it will hurt the(6:07:44)
local retailers who we are now trying to assist as they struggle to open stores(6:07:50)

and operate successfully um retailers in general are downsizing I think as rents have(6:07:57)
increased around the city and are picking up which is a good thing but a double-edged sword many retailers are(6:08:03)
taking smaller Footprints as they open stores the streetcape we want the(6:08:09)
streetcape to be activated and we want lots of stores we don't want large(6:08:15)
stores which in fact over the years the zoning has precluded from operating on(6:08:21)
certain corridors I do think that if there are um smaller stores(6:08:27)
we need to be cognizant of a couple of things if one is to do a store that is(6:08:32)
30 feet deep the retailer is going to have problems with laying out appropriately and with(6:08:39)
merchandising often they will have a very long store like a bowling alley that will not work there are tons and(6:08:46)
tons of local users that are operating 300 square foot 600 foot 800t stores and(6:08:53)
there is no way you can operate a small store like that with this 30 foot depth(6:09:00)
requirement I also think that there are security issues as tenants lay out in a(6:09:06)
store they need to have a space where they can see the entire store and operate effectively again if there's a(6:09:12)
small store it's 10 feet wide and 30 feet deep there's no way they can see what's going on in the back of the store(6:09:19)
it's going to lead to potential theft issues and other concerns you can't necessarily help a tenant a customer in(6:09:26)
the front a customer in the back in a long bowling alley shaped store so security issues layout issues(6:09:33)
merchandising problems great *thank you* that that's(6:09:39)
that's time we we we appreciate your comments and we we understand them so *thank you* very much um okay let's let's(6:09:46)
move on I believe we have the gentleman who was dialing in yes we have

Rod uh Rod we're gonna(6:09:54)

give you the ability to unmute great Rod you should be able to press star six(6:10:01)
to unmute okay can you hear me I just(6:10:07)
unmuted we got you okay very good sorry about the technical difficulties early I don't(6:10:13)
know what happened it's all right we understand okay all right very good well *thank you* for the opportunity to speak(6:10:19)
I'd like to just uh follow up on what another panelist mentioned her name was Ry Moore with regards to environmental(6:10:26)
conditions my concern with the city of yes and the introduction of let's say light(6:10:33)
Manufacturing in this case particularly uh jewelry the jewelry manufacturing it's the(6:10:40)
encroachment of environmental and hazardous chemicals that can be introduced into residential areas for(6:10:48)
instance parlor per Chlor ethylene and acetone are used in the jewelry making(6:10:55)
business and these cleaners are highly regulated and if they are within an(6:11:03)
residential area say within an apartment building or nearby if there's a fire these when they burn they will send(6:11:13)
out toxins in the air and if one were to breathe those toxins all right it can(6:11:19)
cause blood disorders liver damage and Cancers and all sorts of nasty things that can occur in the human body the(6:11:26)
existing zoning laws prevent that from happening and they protect us as well as(6:11:32)
the First Responders so and as far as enforcement(6:11:37)
who's going to do the enforcement to make sure that they don't have the pro the that they're storing the chemicals(6:11:44)
properly within said space and if we talk about the night(6:11:51)
life in my past life I was a bouncer security guy at the(6:11:57)
and I used to monitor traffic coming in and out my primary function was to make(6:12:02)
sure that the certificate of occupancy of the establishment was not exceeded with(6:12:08)
regards to nightclubs Cabaret and so forth many people wait outside of the line of these very successful businesses(6:12:15)
when they wait out for out there in the line for a time uh they have to relieve themselves I have seen them trespass on(6:12:22)
the neighboring property to relieve themselves or either to use recreational drugs or to have(6:12:30)
sex and that is happening today as per my conversation with my prior Associates(6:12:36)
who are still doing this business overall the city of yes eliminates restricts and bypasses(6:12:43)
Community involvement in projects and also bypasses the community board especially when it comes to the ulip(6:12:49)
process environmental review process and just overall EnV just overall processes(6:12:55)
and being involved it Stines us it holds us back these developers now will have(6:13:01)

the upper hand and they will build buildings that will cast Shadows that(6:13:06)
will cause irritable harm to neighborhoods and quality of life my(6:13:12)
father moved from Manhattan to Brooklyn because he could not stand the tall(6:13:18)
buildings and the atmosphere that was there I think my time is up it is but(6:13:26)
closing I just want to say that I I oppose the city of yes okay *thank you*(6:13:32)
very much um we're going *next* to Kiana Mickey please um and uh she's from the(6:13:39)
mayor's office of urban(6:13:48)
agriculture voting now okay *thank you* hello everyone good um good(6:13:55)
hello good afternoon um chairman and Commissioners *my name*

is Kiana Mickey

I am the(6:14:02)
executive director of the mayor's office of urban agriculture *thank you* for the opportunity to submit testimony in(6:14:09)
support of the city of yes for Economic Opportunity I'd like to thank the team(6:14:15)
at the department of city planning for their tireless and collaborative campaign to create public awareness(6:14:21)
around these important policy issues and changes the mayor's office at Urban(6:14:26)
agriculture is tasked with leading the city's efforts to increase access to and(6:14:31)
the production of fresh healthy locally grown food while strengthening climate(6:14:37)
resiliency and spurring economic activity across the city the city of yes(6:14:42)
proposal will directly support our efforts to advance environmental justice(6:14:47)
and food Equity while creating the opportunities for the green economy the city of yes for Economic(6:14:55)
Opportunity will will be a game Cher for urban agriculture in New York City and(6:15:00)
that is for folks that are new to the work as as well as longstanding practitioners it creates significant new(6:15:08)
economic opportunities for the food and urban egg sector while it removes barriers to locating and expanding Urban(6:15:15)
egg culture businesses as well as food small food businesses and activities in New York the proposed forward-looking(6:15:23)
policy changes include light Industrial businesses that process food or(6:15:28)
manufacture value added food products in commercial districts allowing enclosed(6:15:34)
agriculture within commercial districts and permitting rooftop green houses and non-residential buildings they also(6:15:41)
address confusing rules around composting by considering small scale(6:15:46)
organic composting as an accessory use and permitting neighborhood Focus recycling facilities and Commercial(6:15:53)
storefronts our office is based within the mayor's office of climate and environmental justice we uh public(6:16:00)
publicly supported the city of us for carbon neutrality that initiative focused on improving the city's waste(6:16:07)
system mitigating storm water and growing food from *Next* Level rain Gardens to expanded Urban agriculture(6:16:14)
businesses on and opportunities to increase local and scaled food production it will all be um(6:16:21)
substantially aided in advanced by the city of yes I commend mayor Adams chair(6:16:27)
Dan grognet and the department of city um planning team for their Vision their(6:16:33)
commitment to this much needed initiative we at the mayor's office at Urban agriculture will continue to(6:16:40)
support it in the best way we can *thank you thank you* very much we have a question from commissioner Benjamin yes(6:16:47)
thank you very much for your input I had some specific questions related to(6:16:52)
issues that have been raised by some of the community boards one of which is about uh growing(6:16:58)
cannabis and its legality both in the new areas but also in interior spaces in(6:17:06)
buildings is that permitted in the new(6:17:12)
zoning is that a question for me directly or a question to the yes that's a question for you directly oh sorry(6:17:19)
thank you um um actually cannabis um uh rules and regulations um come down from(6:17:24)
the state as well as our office of cannabis management it's not something I can um report on directly but it is(6:17:31)
something we continue to look in as a regulations continue to(6:17:36)
emerge I'd like to hear more about that because this has been a significant concern for a number of community boards(6:17:44)

so I'd like to understand where the ground is on that(6:17:50)
issue um well I think the the core expertise would be from the um the(6:17:56)
office at the state level as well as the city level who's focused on primarily cannabis um what we see in urban(6:18:02)
agriculture is the opportunity around cannabis is a further down the line in consideration of what's able to be(6:18:08)
produced um indoors but again we would be informed by regulations that are still um(6:18:15)
forthcoming and in general if one wanted to have an indoor growing space What are(6:18:22)
the regulations about what uh load the per square foot load is on the(6:18:30)
floor how how is it going to be regulated so(6:18:36)
that it does not become problematic and that we know that the addition of soil(6:18:43)
the addition of water will not unduly affect those who are underneath the growing(6:18:50)
area yes I mean again this is something that um oftentimes when people are new(6:18:56)
to new models around soil-based work and agriculture especially indoor spaces um(6:19:01)
we need to continue to look at the zoning laws and and building codes so(6:19:07)
again for cannabis I don't think it would be any different not just for cannabis for if I wanted to grow a truck(6:19:13)
Garden or a victory garden and oh yes in an indoor space yes um you know the(6:19:20)
department of buildings as well as um City Planning and probably other offices continue to be be informed on what is(6:19:27)
like loadbearing for rooftop garden and and other growing so what we continue to(6:19:33)
see is um adhering to those zonings and we encourage people to follow those rules what we are doing at the office of(6:19:40)
urban agriculture is continuing trying to find ways to increase awareness so if there is folks that are interested in(6:19:46)
those models how do we continue to learn by the actual regulations the actual rules and share that in connection to(6:19:53)
the education around Urban agriculture okay *thank you* very much *thank you*(6:20:00)
commissioner *thank you* Keana I will know we'll ask cannabis NYC to respond to some of the questions that you asked as(6:20:05)
a followup to this um and we'll have them either come by or send us something in writing um okay let's move on WE *next*(6:20:12)
have uh Jerry Goldman oh I'm sorry I didn't see you commissioner(6:20:24)
Goodridge um Keana if you're still there(6:20:30)
commissioner Goodridge has a question for you uh promoting back uh yes I(6:20:40)
am your policy question there's been some debate that there are the states(6:20:46)
that are legalizing cannabis unfortunately on public on public housing grounds and subs and any(6:20:52)
federally assisted grounds it still does not allow anyone um to have cannabis and(6:20:59)
there was some talk about I don't know if it was under city of yes but there was some talk for New York City to have(6:21:04)
some sort of waiver and I was wondering since we were talking about cannabis earlier if you had any more information(6:21:11)
about that because there there's a lot of talk about commercialization in in well I don't agree with the commercialization in Nicha but this is(6:21:18)
one part that I don't think has been discussed enough um so I was wondering(6:21:23)
if you have any more information about that oh *thank you* for your question yes I I honestly right now do not have that(6:21:30)
information that I would be able to explain in full but I do think the(6:21:35)
interest and um the awareness around cannabis and either the commercialization or the production that(6:21:41)
folks are continue to be interested it is something we will continue to research and and circle back um one of(6:21:48)
our hopes and um plans is to continue to um do Outreach in the community around(6:21:53)
the breath of urban agriculture modules and share information so I can take this question(6:21:58)
back *thank you* great *thank you* very much *thank you thank you* Kiana okay *thank you*(6:22:04)
let's let's move on to

Jerry Goldman! who's here with us Mr Goldman(6:22:18)

welcome *thank you* members of the commission *my name* is Jerry Goldman I'm speaking here(6:22:26)

with regard to Provisions relating to **dance** and **dance** only I and other members of New York(6:22:33)

dance parade have been fighting to get rid of restrictions on something that is(6:22:40)

part of human nature for around 20 years part of a regime that was set up(6:22:48)

in the 1920s **for racist purposes** something that has been used to(6:22:55)
explain gay people to exploit people who are look different for people who act(6:23:00)
different and for other political agendas something that's(6:23:07)
unconstitutional I'm only going to speak on the First Amendment piece and so things are absolutely(6:23:13)
clear I am an attorney I am doing this fully pro bono I do not have any(6:23:21)
economic interest in anything having to do with **dance** other than than the fact(6:23:26)
that I am human like every one of you and everyone in the(6:23:31)
audience everyone **dances** everyone moves to rhythms I don't care if you're old(6:23:38)
like me or young I don't care if you're rich I don't care if you're poor I don't(6:23:44)
care if you're gay I don't care if you're straight I don't care if you think you can't **dance** we all move to(6:23:53)
rhythms and rhythms are our way of communicating no different than speaking(6:24:00)
or writing a poem or making a comment from an audience and it's protected speech under(6:24:08)
the Constitution we challenged it before the 2017 Amendment the district court judge(6:24:15)
said we had a colorable case that it was unconstitutional it was unconstitutional(6:24:21)
then it is unconstitutional now and it cannot be in our zoning codes it cannot(6:24:30)
be treated anything differently people have issues about safety address them(6:24:36)
people have issues about noise address them people have issues about fornicating on the street address them(6:24:45)
but you cannot legally rep regulate **dance and under your Oaths as elected(6:24:53)**
and appointed officials of the city of New York you cannot take an action that(6:24:59)
violates the city and state constitution that's all we strongly support it I know there are other people(6:25:05)
here who are going to say things from a different perspective *thank you*

Teresa Wester doll

thank you very much we appreciate your your(6:25:12)
testimony uh okay let's move on to alok daa they are not in Zoom okay Teresa(6:25:20)
Wester doll(6:25:26)
he's here with us(6:25:37)
welcome hello everyone um *my name*'s Teresa Wester doll I live in Crown(6:25:43)
Heights near efield I'm on the uh cb9 Environmental Protection committee but(6:25:49)
I'm here to represent myself I am a(6:25:55)
Post in part mostly to uh city of yes text amendments that will bring Untold(6:26:03)
damages to my community I believe that flipping the zoning Tex to allow(6:26:09)
commercial and Manufacturing takeover of residential units is going to cause(6:26:15)
further degradation of affordable housing in my area particularly to black(6:26:22)
and brown people and the seniors in my community who are(6:26:27)
already I see the dumpsters out and I see people losing their housing regularly and it's really sad and(6:26:35)
depressing and this is happening in my neighborhood where there is an amount of development that(6:26:42)
is that is enormous like I live in one of the probably the densest areas in the(6:26:48)
city so um bringing manufacturing and Commercial businesses into residential spaces is also going to be dangerous for(6:26:55)
the residents we have a housing crisis and there are plenty of commercial places in our neighborhoods(6:27:02)
and for Zoning for commercial activities and we don't need them in people's homes(6:27:08)
in our apartment buildings removing people from those residents and it's going to allow landlords and people that(6:27:16)
own those residents to it's going to incentivize them to move people out which I am greatly fearful of so these(6:27:26)
uh new resonans are also going to allow the Takeover of mom and pop shops with(6:27:31)
micro dark delivery run by corporate entities such as Amazon designed to put local businesses out of business(6:27:38)
um I am concerned about inforcement every day I walk by several enormous(6:27:44)
construction projects on my way to Prospect Park from my house uh one project at(6:27:50)
170 uh excuse me 1730 Bedford Avenue off of Sullivan place has an enormous number(6:27:56)
of violations um leading to toxic air quality three street collapses broken(6:28:02)
fire hydrants storm drains clogged with cement scaffolding and collapsing shut down several times this project by FDNY(6:28:10)
but they ignored the shutdowns they continued building they have racked up enormous fines and they just continue to(6:28:18)
go forward and whatever they're going to pay the fines the they're going to fines will get dismissed D be come do comes(6:28:26)
people come shut them down and they just continue and they're continuing today and they'll continue tomorrow violating(6:28:33)
regulations and laws this is the norm for my community with Development(6:28:39)
and Construction so housing safety quality of life need to be Paramount for(6:28:45)
our residents and I want people to have safe housing *thank you thank you* very much(6:28:52)
okay *next* up is

Claudia Valentin(6:28:57)

no on(6:29:10)
Zoom Claudia you should be able to turn on your microphone and your camera(6:29:17)
okay okay we can hear you okay good *thank you* very much *my name* is Claud(6:29:24)
Valentino and I am president of the fars community and civic association *thank you* for your(6:29:29)
attention um I'm also a decades long resident of my home and of New York(6:29:35)
City I want to address the provisions tied to housing in these 18 items number(6:29:41)
11 and number 16 the one allowing businesses to run in the middle of a(6:29:46)
block with 49% of the F and three employees in the provision allowing a(6:29:52)
corner home I ask you to vote no on both of these Provisions here's why first it(6:29:58)
amounts to a de facto conversion of areas already knowledgeably zoned as(6:30:03)

residential by the individual neighborhoods themselves not so very long ago we do not consider ourselves to(6:30:11)
be a business desert but instead appreciate the calm quiet and privacy that we enjoy in our very small houses(6:30:18)
and backyards our infrastructure is also fragile it's our small house is 16 ft(6:30:24)
wide or merely a driveway apart and our streets are narrow and primarily one way(6:30:30)
if the plan were to go through a business in the middle of the residential block would mean endless drop offs and Pickups by FedEx Etc and(6:30:38)
suppliers are these home businesses to be subject to the same fire codes as actual businesses we also see nothing in(6:30:46)
in the plan to restrict hours of operation noise limits on numbers of people who might meet Etc we have long(6:30:53)
had to master the art of being good neighbors because we're so tight tightly located together businesses cannot be(6:31:00)
expected to accomplish that the same considerations apply to the concept of converting a corner home on a(6:31:06)
residential block uh corner or 100 feet in to uh What uh Department of City(6:31:12)
Planning has referred to as a bodega or convenience store or other retail uses(6:31:17)
Envision the Myriad of products that they carry there's a delivery truck for each(6:31:24)
one there's commercial grade food preparation equipment requiring requiring commercial level electric(6:31:30)
service there's also commercial garbage that much sit on the curb and so it's picked up at about 3:00 a.m. not to(6:31:36)
mention an increase in foot bike and car traffic all of this on a previously quiet residential block most importantly(6:31:44)
and I have not heard addressed here today is how exactly are the Neighbors on all three sides of either of these(6:31:50)
business types notified that they now will be living *next* to a commercial concern(6:31:55)
Community Board review will not entail this nor can it mediate these(6:32:01)
relationships this will shred the fabric of cooperation and trust that makes neighborhoods livable places it's very(6:32:08)
important that Community opposition not be mischaracterized as if we have our(6:32:13)
hair on fire we know our neighborhoods we don't think that hundreds of bodegas will show up we just don't want one on(6:32:20)
our Corner come visit me in my neighborhood I'll walk you all all around DEC came out when I down zoned(6:32:27)
and understood how very tight we were so I extend an invitation to all of you so(6:32:32)
you can see what a small residential Community really looks like *thank you* so much for your time I appreciate it great(6:32:39)
thank you we appreciate we appreciate you being here with us today um so *thank you*(6:32:45)

Keith powers!

https://www.youtube.com/live/M26QL4yNSNA?si=XXiZ_SgcyWYasLj6

and let me uh call up *next* uh we're very honored to have uh the councilman from(6:32:50)
the fourth district in the city council Keith powers Mr Powers welcome nice to(6:32:56)
see you nice to have you here *thank you* I'm sorry to uh jump in here in the middle I think you're familiar with the(6:33:02)
fourth Council District you know it well um I want to thank uh uh all my friends(6:33:07)
here I said to the City Planning Commission for giving me the opportunity to be here before you today I know it's been a long day so I hope
you guys have(6:33:14)
eaten your food and are uh taking taking time um just wanted to come by and talk(6:33:21)
about rezoning us before you guys today uh um I'm going to talk about one piece of it very very specifically but I do(6:33:27)
want to offer my support to many parts of the plan I think that both this and the other um city of es rezonings have a(6:33:35)
big opportunity for the city uh to move forward in a way that's sensible and modernize the city and well I'm sure(6:33:41)
I'll be back here to talk about the housing plan in particular which will be a big opportunity for the city to move(6:33:47)
forward with um needing the necess you know needing the the housing um that the(6:33:52)
city is so many people in the city are asking for right now so um *thank you* for(6:33:57)
the opportunity to be here I stated I'm council member Keith power city council member for district four on Manhattan SE(6:34:03)
side from 14th Street now up to 90th Street used to be 98th Street *thank you* redistricting um but *thank you* for the(6:34:09)
opportunity to testify today on the importance of this zoning I'm here particularly about one item that I(6:34:15)
actually talked about a few years ago which is uh *dancing*
proposal before you it's around night life and our small(6:34:22)
businesses um we always talk about New York City being the city that never sleeps and being famous all over the(6:34:28)
world for being famous for its bars and restaurants and dining at night life um(6:34:34)
but it was a few years ago and uh I think the at the time uh commissioner(6:34:39)
Gan chairman gck I think was in the city council the city council took a really important step to repeal the Cabaret law(6:34:46)
which many of us recognize as being outdated and Antiquated and so necessary(6:34:51)
to repeal at that point in time but was left in its wake was still zoning that(6:34:58)
upheld that law and didn't make sense for the time certain this make sense today but also was arbitrary and when(6:35:05)
you look at the map in certain places like the neighborhood I live in you can walk just a few blocks away from each(6:35:10)
other and see places living under much different zoning rules so it is time for(6:35:16)
us to move on from that entirely we moved on from the cab law as a Licensing and Regulatory procedure but we(6:35:23)
certainly should be moving on from it as a as a burden on small businesses(6:35:28)
because they're now right now they're faced with either not knowing it exists uh trying to come into compliance(6:35:35)
and paying thousands and thousands of dollars in fees and being here probably at the City Planning Commission to try(6:35:42)
to get rid of that zoning or trying to or trying to live outside of its compliance or perhaps finding a business(6:35:50)
if you're lucky enough that's in the zone so the in the current zoning so the(6:35:55)
proposal that's before us right now that's going to be coming to the city council is actually pretty common sense it brings businesses into
compliance(6:36:02)
that deserve it it limits the capacity of those businesses up to 200 businesses(6:36:08)
200 people rather uh that can be within those businesses and it is a really Common Sense proposal to help those(6:36:14)
businesses that have been struggling for the last few years a few years ago in the wake of covid it was myself now bur(6:36:21)
president Mark Lavine and the then city council Mark line and then bur president Eric Adams who actually talked about(6:36:27)
reforming list after covid to help out our bars and restaurants in a sort of a surge of uh of trying to repeal things(6:36:36)
that didn't make any sense more anymore for businesses that were really struggling during covid and this was one(6:36:42)
that we identified as an easy and common sense one so I want to add my level uh(6:36:47)
of support to a lot of the proposals that before you today because I know you're hearing on a lot of them but I want to identify this one
because I(6:36:53)

think it's really important I'm the son of a bar owner and a restaurant owner my first job was in my dad's restaurant and(6:37:00)
I know how important it is as an economic driver for the city but more importantly as a social component(6:37:07)
and part of what makes New York city so great so as you consider all the proposals before today and as we come(6:37:12)
bring that to the city council hopefully very soon I'm going to be asking my colleagues to support this proposal(6:37:18)
including that but I want to identify that one because I think right now so much of our city(6:37:24)
needs updating and modernization and I think certainly this one is a very low hanging fruit uh for the city so with(6:37:31)
that I know there's a lot of people behind me and online who want to testify as well so I'll keep it short until the point but I think this is a really(6:37:37)
worthy reasoning to move forward and I want to identify that one because I know we'll be coming up for discussion when it gets to the city
council that's great(6:37:43)
councilman *thank you* and before I go to commissioner gold let me just say we really appreciate your leadership on this issue you know for
uh rationality(6:37:51)
in our text of zoning r large and this in particular um and so uh thank(6:37:58)
you for being here uh to say that today and of course your leadership with the council and on the city so *thank you* for(6:38:04)
that

let me go to commissioner gold thanks councilman just a quick question given um your long history both as you(6:38:10)
mentioned as the son of a bar owner and also on this particular issue you speak a little bit I'm sure you've gotten a(6:38:16)
lot of feedback probably a some negative probably some positive but on balance it sounds like it's positive from the(6:38:22)
community and I'm one was can you just speak a little bit about that given I mean it sounds like it's 20 years you've been watching this issue
sure look I(6:38:29)
think that in my district my district is going to be different than others I totally recognize that and certainly in(6:38:35)
Manhattan we have plenty of uh night life and restaurants and things like that and so we have to look at the whole(6:38:41)
city in different ways without question but uh what I like particularly about the proposal that's before us is it's(6:38:49)
adding in uh to areas that where there already this is already happening it's taking away(6:38:54)
um penalties for very selective and arbitrary enforcements happening there's very little enforcement of this I should(6:39:01)
mention but if it is going to occur it's going to be very arbitrary and I think it's going to take uh be on the backs of(6:39:06)
businesses that just really don't need it and even IAL about the East Village you can look I think it's like Avenue a(6:39:13)
and Avenue B I think have different zoning regulations on them right now when I looked at the map they're all the(6:39:18)
same establishments so I think it's a little bit um arbitrary now but certainly I understand people reputation(6:39:24)
with it what I would say is that the capacity limits of 200 people seem extraordinarily helpful to the cause of(6:39:32)
telling people it's just not going to turn into massive night nightlife establishments in every neighborhood and(6:39:37)
really honestly what it is it's honoring

what's already happening in place and telling people that if a jukebox goes(6:39:43)
jukebox goes on in a restaurant that that shouldn't be the cost for somebody to lose their *liquor* license their(6:39:49)
business or lose their livelihood perfect *thank you* and just from your(6:39:55)
perception it feels like it's a small business issue I assume without question a small business issue this is honoring that places that are
already doing(6:40:01)
business here in the city shouldn't have to live under another regulatory regime we talk all the time about ways to have(6:40:07)
our small businesses out this feels like a really easy one perfect *thank you* so much thanks for coming down *thank you* guys *thank you*
commissioner *thank you*(6:40:14)
councilman we appreciate it very much uh

Vanessa Gibson!

next up we're really honored to have the president of the burough of the Bronx(6:40:19)
with us on Zoom uh Vanessa Gibson uh is here madam president *thank you* very much(6:40:25)
for uh for joining us(6:40:32)
today hello *thank you* so much good afternoon *thank you* so much chair Dan(6:40:38)
garnik *thank you* for the welcome *thank you* for the invitation really appreciate the chance to be before you and the(6:40:45)
Commissioners and uh City Planning Commission *thank you* CPC and the entire(6:40:50)
city of yes team uh really appreciate the opportunity to testify before all of you today I am Vanessa L Gibson the(6:40:58)
president of the great burrow of the Bronx and I am *thank you* thankful for the opportunity to be here with all of(6:41:04)
you today as we talk about the city of yes proposals and looking to remove(6:41:10)
impediments in the zoning text that will cut unnecessary red tape and allow for(6:41:16)
commercial retail and Manufacturing businesses to grow and adapt based on(6:41:22)
their needs in our great City uh the Zoning for Economic Opportunity proposal will help to reduce the cost of(6:41:29)
doing business in our city and expand location options consequently filling(6:41:35)
commercial vacancies as a result both the local community and the larger(6:41:40)
business community stand to ultimately benefit fostering the city's growth(6:41:46)
based on needs rather than stringent zoning regulations while I agree with(6:41:52)
the four goals of the zoning Amendment and I want to say *thank you* again to Mayor Eric Adams and the administration(6:41:58)
and DCP for your important leadership I have some concerns and observations that(6:42:03)
I want to raise to all of you today regarding some of the proposals I call your attention to proposal number five(6:42:11)
enabling commercial activities on upper floors the biggest concern I have is(6:42:17)
understanding how residential and Commercial activities could essentially coexist and Co locate and ensuring that(6:42:25)
the public understands the requirements for where residential and non-residential use users and uses May(6:42:33)
locate permitting commercial uses above and on the same level as residential(6:42:39)
should not be a green light for residential buildings to add these uses without first going to the Department of(6:42:46)
buildings to get required and necessary approvals requiring that buildings meet(6:42:52)
these requirements to show compliance with noise mitigation and ensuring that(6:42:57)
we have separate elevators entrances and exits is a real high Bar for a really(6:43:04)
important reason and the only way that this proposal will work is if the city enforces these requirements and while I(6:43:11)
am in support of this proposal I do so with the caveat that enforcement and(6:43:17)
Inter agency coordination is Paramount to making this a successful proposal I(6:43:23)
quot call your attention Commissioners to proposal number nine supporting nightlife with common sense dancing and(6:43:30)
live entertainment rules this proposal is finally addressing the discriminatory(6:43:36)
Cabaret laws that were repealed when I was a member of the New York City Council but still exist in the zoning(6:43:43)
resolution the ongoing concerns that are often raised around nightlife are typically tied to noise nuisance and(6:43:50)
enforcement and while there are no easy solutions to this issue I recommend that the mayor's office of nightlife(6:43:57)
proactively Works to identify businesses with noise related issues and work with(6:44:03)
them on education on Outreach and Advising them on building improvements and guidelines that would ultimately(6:44:10)
reduce noise pollution and by issuing violations more aggressively if those(6:44:16)
efforts fail we have an opportunity to be creative in this process and to be proactive in making sure that businesses(6:44:23)
adhere but they also know that we're not punitive in this work I call your attention to proposal number 11 enabling(6:44:32)
entrepreneurship for home occupations this proposal gives me a little bit of a(6:44:37)
pause simply because I have some concerns about the unintended consequences while I am not fully(6:44:43)
opposed to this proposal specifically I am also not yet ready to support it in(6:44:50)
its totality and the way it's proposed today I do believe that most businesses(6:44:55)
will be good actors and good neighbors to their fellow tenants in their(6:45:01)
particular locations and buildings but my concerns are for a handful of those(6:45:06)

Bad actors that we know could exist that will inevitably occur I believe that(6:45:12)
there should be a limit to the number of people that can be in any home business(6:45:19)
and I propose that there should be a five person maximum capacity that may be permitted in a homebased(6:45:25)
business to really reduce the amount of regular foot traffic that we know can occur I think by putting a limit it(6:45:33)
allows it to be a standard of what we want to see with home businesses and we can still allow the market to flourish(6:45:40)
additionally homebased businesses should also identify their business type and(6:45:45)
register their home address and notify the landlord Andor building management uh as applicable and also to ensure that(6:45:52)
there are no fire safety issues you know that our city and the Bronx has faced an(6:45:58)
extreme number of residential fires so I want to be very cautious about that as(6:46:03)
well but any business above a certain electrical need should be required to(6:46:09)
complete an electrical inspection because we know many of our residential buildings the wiring is not at the full(6:46:16)
scale will it should be and I don't want a home business to inadvertently open their business and not understand that(6:46:23)
and then there could be a potential fire so I want to be very careful about this proposal I call your attention to(6:46:29)
proposal number 15 facilitating local commercial space on residential campuses(6:46:35)
and when I think about this proposal I focus on residents that live in public housing in Nicha nearly one in 17 New(6:46:42)
Yorkers live in Nicha supported housing accounting for over 528,000 residents across(6:46:50)
335 conventional public housing and pack developments and while I do not believe(6:46:56)
that it is within scope I do recommend modifying the text to permit grocery(6:47:02)
stores upon the granting of a fresh zoning approval with the requirement(6:47:07)
that it is on campus with affordable housing regardless of the size of that(6:47:12)
grocery store this would really create an opportunity to provide fresh food(6:47:18)
health and wellness to Residents that are living in what we call Food deserts(6:47:23)
proposal number 18 creating new kinds of zoning districts for the future this proposal will create new zoning(6:47:30)
districts that do not exist today and will address the disconnect with current bulk regulations in manufacturing(6:47:37)
districts I have no objection and I do support this proposal but I would recommend that to keep good paying(6:47:45)
manufacturing jobs right here in New York the proposal should include some requirements for concentrating(6:47:52)
Industrial uses on the ground floor in the transition and growth districts and(6:47:58)
prioritizing those manufacturing uses within existing izs uh the industrial(6:48:04)
business zones that I'm very proud to support and work with the city on finally in conclusion coming to a close(6:48:12)
I want to commend the department of City Planning and really *thank you* all for your commitment to finding Innovative(6:48:18)
and creative ways to streamlining our current zoning regulation while really(6:48:24)
maintaining zoning core intention to protect the public health the public(6:48:29)
safety and the general welfare of New Yorkers of businesses of residents and families urgently addressing our(6:48:36)
outdated zoning ordinances since the 1960s uh is really crucial to supporting(6:48:42)
local businesses stimulating the economy creating jobs that are really vital to the stability of our city and many of(6:48:49)
our vibrant neighborhoods uh and so with that I recommend approv Ming these applications with my observations and(6:48:56)
some of the recommendations that we have made as an Administration for your review today I *thank you* so much again(6:49:02)
chair Dan garnik *thank you* to CPC to the City Planning Commission and everyone for allowing me the chance to testify on(6:49:09)
behalf of the great burrow of the Bronx *thank you* so much *thank you thank you* very much Madam President we really(6:49:15)
appreciate you being here with us uh and uh you know we so appreciate you and(6:49:21)
your thoughtful uh recommend recommendations and your thoughtful approach to all of this so we look(6:49:26)
forward to looking at everything that you have recommended uh very very closely and uh following up with you and(6:49:34)
your team uh but again we really appreciate you and the time that you took to uh to go through the proposal(6:49:40)
and to come to such thoughtful recommendations as always it's great to see you *thank you* I love giving you(6:49:46)
detail Mr chair *thank you* always thanks a lot okay um and by the way I will note(6:49:51)
that on some of the questions that the B president asked about um uh enforcement(6:49:56)
uh of nightlife businesses when complaints are made uh and uh how nlife(6:50:02)
addresses Bad actors and things like that it turns out *next* up is

Jeffrey Garcia!!!

um Jeff(6:50:07)

Garcia who is the executive director of The Office of nightlife and we're going to ask him to come and present and I(6:50:14) would just ask that if you can find a way to address some of those issues it's a perfect moment uh to do so and we're(6:50:21) really really happy that you are here *thank you thank you* for having me um I have copies of my testimony if you(6:50:34) need well good afternoon *thank you* for having me here today uh see some familiar faces so uh janic and members(6:50:42) of the commission *my name* is Jeffrey Garcia I'm the executive director of The Office of nlife uh at SP SPS *thank you*(6:50:48) for the opportunity to testify here today under mayor Adams New York C is becoming the city of yes for small(6:50:56) businesses we are pleased to express our strong support for the city of yes for Economic Opportunity as a common sense(6:51:02) initiative addressing zoning barriers preventing industry growth New York City has a long history of discriminatory(6:51:09) practices regulating **dancing** and nightlife venues until 2017 the Antiquated Cabaret laws van venues from(6:51:17) hosting musical entertainments singing **dancing** and other forms of amusement(6:51:23) without a formal license while the city council repealed The Cabaret Law's requirement it was not(6:51:28) able to address confusing restrictions on nightlife that remain in the city's zoning in 2021 office of nightlife(6:51:36) issued a report of policy solution changes challenges facing New York City nightlife one recommendation addressed(6:51:44) The Unfinished Business of the cabal Cabaret repeal efforts as zoning continues to limit music comedy and(6:51:51) **dancing** in many areas this proposal would finally address that(6:51:56) city of yes removes outdated restrictions on **dancing** and many commercial districts and establishes a(6:52:03) new category for performances venues with scheduled entertainment under(6:52:08) proposal nine they would they would be regulated not only by the type of ENT they would they would be regulated not(6:52:14) by the type of entertainment they offer but by their size neighborhood corridors(6:52:20) could have small venues up to 200 capacity with larger venues limited to Central Business districts and(6:52:25) industrial areas crucially small venues would not be restricted to offer comedy(6:52:31) lot music or **dancing** as they might be today this Common Sense approach can(6:52:37) ensure that our night our nighttime culture an essential part of our economy and our identity can continue to(6:52:43) flourish while minimizing potential impacts this is a targeted effort to(6:52:48) remove outdated discriminatory limits on **Dancing** yet other processes will remain(6:52:53) to protect Public Safety place of assembly rules ensure compliance with building and fire code where 75 or more(6:53:01) people gather indoors Community boards **and SLA can still Place Liquor License stipulations that address sound traffic**(6:53:08) and other concerns the noise code will continue to give D the authority to(6:53:14) review complaints and issue violations office of nightlife is proud(6:53:19) to have established a new mediation program as an addition additional tool to address quality of life complaints(6:53:25) mend NYC is a partnership with the center for Creative conflict resolution(6:53:31) at oath it provides free licensed neutral mediators to help resolve conflicts between venue operators and(6:53:38) Neighbors when the parties proceed to mediation men Works to successfully resolve issues in nearly 85% of the(6:53:46) cases office of nightlife is proud to partner with DCP to advance our(6:53:51) Collective efforts to build a city of yes for all small businesses and we're happy to answer any questions that you(6:53:58) may have now *thank you* great *thank you* very much Mr Vice chairman uh *thank you* Mr goia for your(6:54:04) your testimony I just for my edification do under your job are you required like to go out and have a good time every(6:54:12) night I mean what is what and there a component of it that is a component of(6:54:17) it um but there's a real work behind that going out and having a good time and it's really you know promoting our(6:54:24) small businesses here throughout this city that work hard every night um like we've heard many folks say to make this(6:54:31) a city that never sleeps where people want to come enjoy themselves have fun and and feel safe while doing(6:54:42) it sounds pretty fun and also pretty important at the same time *thank you* so let's um so do you(6:54:50) want to talk for a minute more about the uh enforcement questions and how you deal with um some of the issues that the(6:54:58) the Bronx Boro president was Raising about how enforcement is done when complaints are made and how nlife(6:55:04) addresses Bad actors out there um just just if you could just spend another minute on that and then uh then we'll(6:55:10)

we'll uh we'll free you but we we'd appreciate that sure absolutely um well a as an entity the offit to nightlife is(6:55:17)
a non- enforcement liaison between The Nightlife industry and those businesses(6:55:23)
however just recently uh at the end of last year we introduced cure which is a(6:55:28)
coordinating United resolution with establishments right and this is we will be working directly with NYPD to address(6:55:36)
issues of noise sanitary and other issues uh related to The Nightlife industry so even though we're not in(6:55:43)
enforcement uh we're not going there in an enforcement capacity we are going there to help mitigate any issues that(6:55:50)
are being raised by either 311 complaints Community boards or any one(6:55:55)
of these um Avenues with the establishment and the NYPD so um that(6:56:01)
will continue uh and we are here as a resource uh for NYPD or any other agency(6:56:08)
that chooses to call us to to help them in in this process Comm(6:56:14)
gold just one point of uh follow-up director um so in your experience and(6:56:21)
you have the seat that you said you're pretty close to this issue if you will um you think about it is this something(6:56:28)
where we think it's happening and we're trying to legalize it because it it's minimal harm if you will or is it(6:56:34)
something that um the nightl folks who you're speaking to the the the B the(6:56:40)
small businesses here in the city that they're actually clamoring for there are they are they asking for this and you(6:56:45)
know it sort of potentially changes things for them and you know makes things easier or is it something where(6:56:51)
we think it's happening we think maybe um it's not necessarily being enforced but candidly it's not really doing much(6:56:56)
harm and so we want to legalize it to you know help I don't know if that makes sense well it's definitely not causing(6:57:02)
any harm I don't think that allowing for some dancing would cause harm to anyone as a matter of fact this might be a good(6:57:09)
uh health issue because it gets people moving right and you know um uh healthy(6:57:14)
so um yes this isting you this the community definitely wants this(6:57:21)
insulting you go ahead on sorry you cannot interrupt any further we're not going to allow we're not going to allow for interruptions I'm sorry if
you would(6:57:27)
like a chance to testify you will have an opportunity to testify Mr Garcia my apologies to you uh you may proceed and(6:57:34)
I'm very sorry so yes the community of The Nightlife industry really wants this they don't want to have to be looking(6:57:39)
over their shoulders worried about what will happen when an inspector comes in(6:57:45)
and says see somebody you know just dancing near their table right cuz they like the song so I think that this clear(6:57:52)
that(6:58:01)
up so I believe that this will really clear things up just like we did with um(6:58:07)
the NYPD and March operations and introducing cure I think this really gives and will develop good uh uh(6:58:15)
economic development for businesses they could focus on running their business as opposed to having to look over their(6:58:20)
shoulders all the time or have to um talk to their customers if they get up oh no please sit down um I think that(6:58:27)
will clear that up and uh will definitely be music to their ears perfect thanks no pun(6:58:33)
intended great thank you very much Mr Garcia thank you for being here again my apologies for the interruption thank you(6:58:38)
chair thank you everyone

t Justine(6:58:44)

Roper

Let's uh let's move on to uh *next* on the list Justine(6:58:44)
Roper who I believe is here(6:58:51)
great welcome *thank you* for being(6:59:00)
here I believe it's evening time right now so good evening to all of you I'm(6:59:06)
Justine roer um *thank you* for um taking me to come here today and to listen to(6:59:13)
what I have to say I am going to be as brief as I can because I know there are(6:59:18)
other people there so I will not be taking up all of my time I'd like to be considerate of others um(6:59:26)
I I actually last night we just recently got this information I'm well first of(6:59:33)
all I'm Justine roer I'm from Brownsville Community of Brooklyn a beautiful Community very convenient um(6:59:40)
beautifully located um in I guess you call Central Brooklyn and uh it has a(6:59:46)
number of um convenience Transportation it has a number of um(6:59:52)
some community garden I am I am a homeowner I am also a veteran I am also(7:00:00)
a um Community Gardener as I mentioned before um I'm just going to take one(7:00:08)
aspect of the city of yes and that is um(7:00:15)
contractors developers because I was personally personally kind of like(7:00:21)
affected by exactly what's going on in my community um we have excessive amount of(7:00:27)
homes and we have an excessive amount course you know we have we're the we're the the Nicha capital of the city(7:00:34)
of New York because we have so many Nicha buildings in our neighborhood um(7:00:39)
right now we have contractors in our neighborhood that's just coming in and(7:00:45)
doing whatever they want to do I was effectively um actually affected by(7:00:51)
what's going on on with contractors um they actually pull down(7:00:58)
and I say I'm a community Gardener they actually pulled down and this is such a(7:01:03)
disbelief and such a disrespect for our community one of our cultural(7:01:09)
aspect just good rewards is our community garden it's just good rewards(7:01:14)
Children's Garden as a matter of fact and we had a memorial there which was(7:01:20)
dedicated to 911 victim which was also dedicated to a veteran of which I am(7:01:27)
which I mentioned um and he was also a food producer and we also produce food(7:01:32)
in our community garden our garden focus on working with teenagers working with(7:01:37)
young people working with adults and also working with seniors so we work with everybody we work with the schools(7:01:44)
we have different types of um we work with the mayor's office as well we work with the Department of Probation as well(7:01:50)
so we work with a number of City agents agencies and we have youth leadership that's going on now with the New York(7:01:55)
City service so when we got this situation and we got a new(7:02:03)
contractor we had about several contractors who actually wanted to um(7:02:09)
restore a building in well let you know I why we want to(7:02:17)
hear what you're we want to hear the connection to the to the proposal so let just if you if you don't mind(7:02:22)
I definitely not mind but I just don't want to well connect it to us or you can you can do it after by in writing(7:02:28)
whatever you prefer but we do want to hear what what you go ahead well what(7:02:33)
what I'm I guess what I'm saying is that this particular developer actually pulled down our mural and we feel(7:02:42)
that actually talking about um extending(7:02:48)
extending the time to give um Developers more of an opportunity in zoning that(7:02:56)
that would make them even more wanting to do different things pulling down(7:03:01)
cultural stuff in Brownsville pulling down different things even going and doing different things at other times so(7:03:08)
we don't want this we definitely do not want this and we're asking on just that(7:03:15)

proposal Community Gardens Community Gardens(7:03:20)
homeowners we are saying no no to the yes only on that aspect I am going to(7:03:28)
leave the rest of this for my community board 16 and they will collectively of(7:03:34)
course resolve any other issues on the other parts of this okay got it thank(7:03:39)
thank you we appreciate you're being here sure thing of course okay let's go to Laura(7:03:49)
Su hello good evening I'm Laura Su I'm the director of the East Village Community(7:03:55)
Coalition we have long worked to support local independent businesses in the East Village as well as tracking commercial(7:04:02)
uses and vacancies we worked with SBS to form the East Village small business(7:04:08)
East Village independent Merchants Association and uh continue to have(7:04:13)
strong relationships with the merchants and it members and non-members and residents in the community we are(7:04:20)
concerned that many of the proposals in the city of yes for Economic Opportunity(7:04:26)
will not help solve the commercial vacancy issues and housing issues in our(7:04:31)
particular mixed use neighborhood um our community's commercial zoning exists deserve the(7:04:38)
needs of residents it was not designed to be a major destination or commercial District even though it has become a(7:04:44)
major nightlife destination uh we have seen a steady loss of neighborhood serving businesses(7:04:50)
since we started tracking these Trends in 2006 as destination nightlife(7:04:56)
establishments which can afford to pay higher rents continue to push local serving businesses off the Avenues or(7:05:03)
away from the neighborhood entirely this increase in destination light knife has(7:05:08)
times created terrible conflict with residents where there was none when where local retail serves the resident(7:05:15)
needs um I can I'd like to I'll hand in my testimony online but I'd just like to(7:05:23)
talk about a few things that we've observed um that maybe haven't come up today so we do in our neighborhood it's(7:05:29)
the East Village the Lowry side this these ideas that oh no one would want to do that or no one will try that or(7:05:36)
that's going to be rare that's going to be an exception in our neighborhood somebody's done it already so we have clubs on the second floor
of a of a(7:05:44)
tenement building that's a brick framed tenement building with no insulation sandwiched in between two two partment(7:05:52)
where a couple's trying to raise their children and they're calling the you know calling 311 calling the community(7:05:58)
board this goes on for years uh they and they eventually end up being sort of(7:06:04)
legitimized um and continue to be a problem so that's one one example we ALS(7:06:12)
so then then we have before the cb3 SLA committee we often have people coming(7:06:18)
who want to expand down to the into the basement uh or in in non-conforming(7:06:24)
retail they want to expand down into the basement and or upstairs so um it is(7:06:30)
something that happens frequently we're in no danger of losing um businesses on(7:06:37)
our non-conforming businesses with the lower rents to continue because it's very very(7:06:45)
difficult to enforce it's nearly impossible to get a bad actor um rep(7:06:51)
placed or or have do enforce it we have to work with the community board with(7:06:56)
elected officials um this is very challenging *thank you thank you* very(7:07:02)
much we appreciate it okay

Lauren(7:07:19)

gashinsky

let's go to Lauren gin I'm sorry(7:07:08)
ginski be followed by Mark(7:07:13)
mcolnly hey good afternoon good afternoon um yep *my name* is Lauren(7:07:19)
gashinsky and I a resident um in Brooklyn and I'd just like to talk about(7:07:24)

my support of proposal 9ine specifically um thanks to nightlife and cultural spaces I've been able to build(7:07:30)
my career over the last decade plus and I've helped other people build theirs you know I've worked as an artist a(7:07:36)
festival director and a consultant uh for like nighttime policy and the small business of culture um and if we put it(7:07:44)
into perspective about what nightlife culture does so much of the music and art and performance that we see you know(7:07:50)
quote unquote elevated in museums and institutions began in Nightlife spaces(7:07:56)
and nightlife spaces um sustain them every single day uh so I think you know prop N9 as many people have said will(7:08:03)
put the discriminatory remnants of the Cabaret lot to bed which is nice um and it is a chance to find a home for(7:08:10)
locally run and accessible culture culture in Nightlife spaces um but as(7:08:15)
folks have mentioned yes like the rent is too high and so a caveat would be you know that we need to find a way to(7:08:21)
support people to access these spaces in a way that is Equitable um and really(7:08:26)
address this highest and best use Mantra that is driving our spaces right now um(7:08:32)
so those have to happen hand in hand uh if prop N9 and these other proposals are going to go through but just some uh(7:08:39)
quick things about prop 9 the bottom line is that no neighborhood will be zoned out from the choice to have business and creative
expression come(7:08:45)
together I think that's one great thing about it neighborhoods can decide what they want and have more flexibility to(7:08:51)
change over time um local nightlife businesses that start small are often more(7:08:56)
sustainable um and there will be more jobs you know most of this sector is working class and many nighttime workers(7:09:03)
are immigrants um and yet nightlife labor contributes billions to our economy so we need to think about how to(7:09:09)
care for for the workers um and I do think prop N9 has the potential to mitigate concerns that we hear about(7:09:15)
nightlife uh one being Mega clubs this isn't about large spaces this is about small spaces um and this can help offset(7:09:22)
the needs that we see where people are being driven to Industrial zones or being forced to open a space that is too(7:09:28)
large for the area and for what they can handle um smaller spaces are more affordable to soundproof this can really(7:09:35)
help with noise mitigation and a business can get off on the right foot when when it comes to crowd control(7:09:41)
smaller spaces are more manageable um this creates more connected and accountable communities both in and(7:09:47)
outside of the venue and with concerns about late nights not all spaces want to(7:09:52)
go late or have alcohol there are growing movements um that are sober and more age inclusive that would love to(7:09:58)
bring people together to **dance** uh to see live performance or comedy and as people(7:10:04)
have mentioned you know regulations permits safety all still need to be met um and thankfully we have you know SPS(7:10:10)
office of nightlife SLA and Inter agency programs to help do this in a responsible way um we all know the(7:10:18)
phrase music is a universal language um and the positive effects of this you know are very Broad and the last thing(7:10:24)
I'd like to say um go ahead just let's if you could one(7:10:29)
more thing um last thing I'd like to say is that this is an entry point we need entry points like this so folks have a(7:10:35)
place to start creating culture in business um and that residents have places to go and express themselves with(7:10:41)
or without words great **thank you** very much we appreciate it let me call Mark mcnoilty(7:10:47)
next uh and great thank(7:10:56)
you all right thanks everyone for taking the time to listen to me **my name** is

Mark MCN!(7:11:03)

I live in Bedford ston Brooklyn Community District 3 in Brooklyn I've been living in New York City for 10(7:11:09)
years in um the Bronx Manhattan and now Brooklyn I'm here speaking in support of(7:11:16)
proposal N9 uh to liberalize zoning regulations around **dance** and night(7:11:24)
life I'm a writer as well as a DJ I've I've written about this issue um I also(7:11:30)
used to work in land use planning and so I kind of see the issue from a few different angles I used to host events(7:11:36)
um with 50 to 150 people in spaces where it would be considered illegal to be(7:11:43)
dancing um but so as I've moved around from burrow to burrow from job to job in(7:11:50)
New York City one constant thing for me has been music and the community that(7:11:55)
surrounds it um all of my best friends I've met through music uh the woman who(7:12:01)
I live with uh who I'd like to marry I met on a **dance** floor uh we met you know(7:12:07)
on the **dance** floor and uh a lot of the greatest you know best moments in in my(7:12:13)
20s were on **dance** floors many of them in this city um someone said earlier you(7:12:19)
know no one wants to live **next** to nightclub uh I certainly understand that(7:12:24)
but one person's quality of life issue uh one person's inconvenience is another(7:12:30)
person's livelihood or even their reason for getting up in the morning and I(7:12:35)
think we need to be mindful of that and find a way to balance both um all this(7:12:41)
is to say that live music and **dancing** are not just entertainment um connecting with(7:12:47)
strangers on a **dance** floor is you know forming a spontaneous genuine connection(7:12:53)
with strangers is one of the most beautiful experiences anyone can have and I think it that you're able to do(7:13:00)
that in New York City more so than almost anywhere else in the world certainly anywhere else in the United(7:13:06)
States it's a distinguishing factor that this city has that no other place in the(7:13:11)
US has and I encourage you all to cultivate that and not demonize it and I(7:13:18)
think that these um that the this proposal does that um sometimes you know(7:13:26)
the rent is crazy and I could probably work in other places you know I've(7:13:31)
considered you know leaving New York City and I don't take that train of thought further because I can't find the(7:13:39)
community of Music and **Dance** anywhere else and so I'm like no I'm GNA stay here because I want that um and then(7:13:47)
lastly at the risk of maybe alienating everyone in the room um nightlife is not(7:13:53)
exclusively a Young Person's game but it often is and consider you know the age(7:14:00)
of the commission the age of all the people who've testified and the age of community boards think about the voices(7:14:06)
of young people that you're not hearing today when you consider your support for this proposal **thank you** very much thank(7:14:11)
you very much uh now we we we regard ourselves as young and(7:14:16)
spry and hip and all of the things but yes we take your point **Thank you thank you** very much let's go

gtino Deputy Commissioner of policy and legal Affairs at the New York City Department of buildings

let's go to guo(7:14:24)

patino um of the Department of buildings on(7:14:34)

[Music] Zoom Dar fell down a(7:14:41)

[Music] ni GMA you should be able to(7:14:49)

unmute hi good evening everyone chair even the City Planning Commission my(7:14:56)

name is gtino Deputy Commissioner of policy and legal Affairs at the New York City Department of buildings I am(7:15:02)

pleased to offer the department support for the city of The asro Economic Opportunity zoning initiative construction and real estate(7:15:08)

are the backbone of New York City a built environment unlike any other as the primary regul regulator of these(7:15:14)

vital Industries the department helps facilitate the creation of new residential and commercial space for our(7:15:19)

growing City all while promoting safety on tens of thousands of active construction sites and at the city's(7:15:25)

nearly 1.1 million existing buildings through its work the department Stripes to strike the right(7:15:30)

balance between compliant development and safety to further its Mission the department enforces the city's(7:15:36)

construction codes the zoning resolution and the New York State multiple dwelling law to Pro to protect those who live(7:15:42)

work or visit the city as the agency responsible for interpreting and enforcing the zoning(7:15:48)

resolution the department was closely consulted in the formulation of the city of yes for Economic Opportunity zoning(7:15:54)

initiative and is supportive of its goals to modernize zoning rules to support New York City's businesses(7:15:59)

including creating additional opportunities for businesses to open and expand under the leadership of the Adams(7:16:06)

Administration the department has continued to support businesses through the work of its small business team(7:16:11)

which reviews construction PL submitted on behalf of businesses expeditiously and assist businesses with any questions(7:16:17)

they might have about a construction project in their space the department has also worked to update its own rules(7:16:23)

pursuant to the small business forward initiative which lowered or eliminated certain fines and extended cure periods(7:16:28)

for certain violations giving businesses more time to address violating conditions without incurring(7:16:35)

fines the Department's responsibility to enforce the zoning resolution does not change under the city of yes for(7:16:41)

Economic Opportunity zoning initiative we will continue to enforce the zoning resolution resolution both through plan(7:16:47)

examination when construction plans are filed with the Department and in the field when we receive complaints from New Yorkers to ensure(7:16:54)

that the zoning resolution is being complied with of note when zoning rules are updated the department works to(7:17:00)

train both its plan examiners and inspectors so they are familiar with the updated rules before they take(7:17:06)

effect finally we are committed to addressing any Community concerns or questions that may arise if the zoning(7:17:11)

rules change which may include working to educate the public about the new rules *thank you* for the opportunity to(7:17:17)

testify before you today *thank you thank you* very much Deputy Commissioner we appreciate it we(7:17:23)

have a question for you from commissioner rampersad and then commissioner Benjamin *thank you* uh for(7:17:29)

presenting today um I have two quick questions with regards to the city of es(7:17:34)

once it is passed or if it is passed can you walk us through the training process that the do coordinates with CPC and(7:17:41)

also will the department of buildings be retaining or hiring more inspectors to(7:17:47)

to do enforcement jar taking your first question first um so once the once and(7:17:55)

if uh the zoning text is passed we do a rigorous training for both our inspectors and plan examiners and those(7:18:03)

are dayong training sessions that we hold for all of our plan exam and inspectorial staff um and those are led(7:18:09)

by our zoning experts in house and we certainly coordinate with the Department of City Planning as well and taking your(7:18:17)

your second question I believe you asked if we're planning on hiring additional inspector(7:18:22)

uh at this time we're budgeted for approximately 600 inspectors and we believe that's sufficient to address uh(7:18:29)

the complaints that we receive at this(7:18:34)
time *thank you* commissioner commissioner benman I have the same questions as uh(7:18:41)
commissioner rampersad about a number of these issues come down to and the(7:18:46)
response has been it's an Enforcement issue um and so I'm trying to make sure that we(7:18:53)
have the enforcement capacity to respond to complaints particularly by residents(7:19:00)
about home occupations that may have too many people or may(7:19:05)
have noxious smells noxious odors and you're saying that the(7:19:13)
inspectors you have now will take on these additional tasks and will be sufficient for the(7:19:19)
job that's right so as it relates to home occupation for example those are(7:19:25)
complaints that we intake now I will note that we receive very few home occupation complaints uh for example(7:19:31)
over the past several years we've received less than 30 complaints about home occupation so it's been very few um(7:19:38)
so we would continue to intake any zoning related complaints that we received through 311 or through members(7:19:44)
of the communities often times we receive complaints from elected officials Community boards and we intake(7:19:50)
those complaints and right now we do have sufficient capacity to address those complaints uh we triage the(7:19:55)
complaints we receive moonan complaints we treat them as priority B and we respond to them currently we're(7:20:00)
responding to those types of complaints within 10 to 11(7:20:07)
days *thank you thank you* very much commissioner and uh *thank you* GMO we(7:20:12)
appreciate you being with us tonight *thank you* okay

darus Sala small business Outreach

let's move on to DAR Sana of the Bronx(7:20:19)
chamber(7:20:25)
we are promoting uh Mr Sal Barry you should be able to(7:20:35)
unmute uh good evening everyone can you guys hear me clearly we can *thank you* great uh good(7:20:43)
evening chairman and Commissioners *my name* is darus Sala small business Outreach specialist for the Bron Chamber(7:20:48)
of Commerce um this testimony this evening is on behalf of Lisa sorin(7:20:53)
president of the Bronx Chamber of Commerce and my experience working with small businesses and communities across(7:20:59)
the burough the Bron shamber of Commerce probably represents over 30 30,000 businesses across the BAU the Bronx sham(7:21:07)
of Commerce strongly supports mayor Adam city of yes for Economic Opportunity proposal this initiative will Empower(7:21:13)
small businesses across New York City with flexible zoning create good jobs for New Yorkers Revitalize neighborhoods(7:21:19)
and promote inclusive economic growth for a more Equitable city city of yes removes outdated barriers allowing(7:21:26)
businesses to grow and bring opportunity to all New Yorkers we urge our elected officials to approve this critical(7:21:32)
initiative and help New York City remain a city of dreams for entrepreneurs and businesses alike this will boost(7:21:38)
economic growth create new sites for cleaning Industries and and reduce cost uh business costs this will allow for(7:21:45)
more vital commercial cor corridors replace vacant storefronts with bus wrestling businesses and Foster(7:21:52)
inclusive economic recovery to ensure everyone benefits from New York City's(7:21:57)
Prosperity these changes will support small businesses making for simpler regulations expanded home occupancy ease(7:22:04)
entertainment restrictions and Revitalize neighborhoods with safer streets improve micro distribution and(7:22:10)
modernize outdated rules to reflect changes in work living and adapt to business needs this will catalyze our(7:22:17)
city and help current and future business owners across the five boroughs we are grateful for the efforts of Mayor(7:22:22)
Eric Adams and the City Planning Commission for their work in the city of yes Economic Opportunity proposal we(7:22:28)
hope our local elected officials Ro to approve this initiative that will modernize regulations and help ensure(7:22:33)
New York City continues to provide opportunity for entrepreneurs and business owner business owners *thank you*(7:22:39)
again for this opportunity to speak on this important initiative today Mr Selana *thank you* very much we(7:22:46)
appreciate you being with us uh *thank you*

Jessica Lapin

we're going to move on to Jessica happen who's *next* to be followed by(7:22:53)

Katherine O(7:22:58)

Sullivan

I'm not Jessica Lapin yes I'm here to read testimony on behalf of Jessica Lapin welcome *thank you* so much(7:23:05)
who unfortunately couldn't uh make it here this afternoon as the business improvement district representing one of(7:23:11)
the largest why don't you introduce yourself and tell tell us about *my name* is TAA PR I'm chief of staff at the(7:23:18)
downtown Alliance uh we upstairs in our offices on the 33rd floor as the business improvement(7:23:25)
district representing one of New York City's largest business districts the downtown Alliance strongly supports the(7:23:31)
department of City planning's proposed city of yes for economic development initiative this package of zoning(7:23:37)
reforms would provide property owners and entrepreneurs in nor Manhattan with the tools and flexibility necessary to(7:23:44)
maintain the active and inviting streetscape that is so critical to the long-term success of our district(7:23:50)
District vibrant and diverse ground ground FL uses have long been recognized(7:23:56)
by urbanists and planners as a key Hallmark of a successful business district and Laur Manhattan's over 1,000(7:24:03)
storefront businesses have played a leading role in The District's reinvention over the last two decades(7:24:09)
but our district now faces serious headwinds changing consumer spending habits and the rise of e-commerce were(7:24:16)
already putting pressure on brick and mortar retail before the covid 19 pandemic uncertainty over office(7:24:23)
utilization continuing inflation and ongoing labor shortage shortages further(7:24:28)
Cloud the future of our District's retail corridors in this uncertain environment(7:24:33)
entrepreneurs and Property Owners need a regulatory flexibility to find creative attractive and viable uses for ground(7:24:39)
full retail space City planning's proposed set of zoning text amendments(7:24:44)
would go a long way toward allowing and indeed encouraging the sort of creativity that is needed to develop the(7:24:51)
reter corridors of the future allowing for maker spaces Urban Agriculture and(7:24:56)
small scale entertainment venues would also allow for more diverse and interesting retail updating long(7:25:03)
obsolete use restrictions would provide businesses and Community leaders alike with greater Clarity on how ground floor(7:25:10)
businesses ground floor spaces rather can be appropriately activated while we(7:25:15)
continue to strong support the overall package of proposed reforms some changes may be warranted one area of potential(7:25:22)
concern that has been raised by Community leaders specifically in Laura Manhattan is the possibility that the(7:25:28)
proposed zoning changes would allow too much flexibility for residents to operate businesses from their Apartments(7:25:34)
which may not be appropriate for some residential settings given a supportive(7:25:39)
regulatory environment small business owners and entrepreneurs can seize this opportunity this unique opportunity to(7:25:45)
create a new and sustainable vision for the future of our City's detail as such(7:25:51)
the downtown Alliance strongly encourages the commission to approve these much needed and Common Sense(7:25:56)
zoning reforms *thank you thank you* very much we appreciate it and uh we appreciate your being here and *thank you*(7:26:02)

Katherine ulvan i

to the downtown Alliance uh okay Katherine ulvan is *next* m o Selvin welcome to be followed by Susan ster(7:26:10)

good to see(7:26:17)
you good evening um *thank you* commissioner grodnik for hearing me I(7:26:24)
guess if this text Amendment goes through this may be the last time because as it is the two minutes a(7:26:31)
community board will give you to speak is minimal but that's going to diminish under these the these uh proposals and(7:26:40)
uh the requirement for uler will pretty much go out the window so um I'm not(7:26:46)
very wonky and I'm not very uh eloquent so I'm going to say that I support Chris(7:26:53)
Marte I support the historic District's Council um the woman who spoke from cb9(7:27:00)
I think was Suki uh and of course movement to protect the people Alicia Boyd and leson Ellis and also Paul(7:27:10)
gratiana um I think taking a sledgehammer making this sweeping(7:27:17)
deregulation is a big mistake you need to scalpel these zoning laws have have(7:27:22)
grown to protect people over the years and so just modernizing with a(7:27:28)
sledgehammer is not the way to go they should be very thoughtfully considered(7:27:34)
each one um I can tell you from now from my experience in New York I'm a New(7:27:42)
Yorker by adoption I'm an immigrant that getting any sort of uh(7:27:48)
Environmental control enforcement for smells coming(7:27:53)
from a neighboring uh plastics factory beside a residential building is(7:28:01)
impossible smells dissipate how do you capture the smell and give it to the D(7:28:07)
and ask them to mitigate it I don't even know what the smell was perhaps my life is shorter because of it noise I I have(7:28:15)
no problem with *dancing* I love to *dance* I love *dancing* all its manifestations I(7:28:21)
even do like music but noise and uh excessive decibel is something that(7:28:28)
needs enforcement and isn't I spent 10 years going down the 311 black hole(7:28:34)
trying to get some sort of mitigation to the noise on West Dykeman Street to no(7:28:40)
avail as it is now we've got a uh open street so mayor Adams and the do(7:28:46)
commissioner when they come to party father day in particular 89 DCB in my(7:28:52)
apartment 89 I mean who do I go to who can I ask(7:28:58)
for some help and some some sort of quality of life some sort of livability(7:29:03)
in the city so please when you consider I know that you're pretty much all sort(7:29:08)
of selected by the mayor and and the real estate industry I know rebney rules the city but try and consider what the(7:29:16)
city would be like without its residents it won't be New York City it'll be a(7:29:22)
theme park for tourists okay *thank you* very much um(7:29:28)

Miss steter!

okay Miss steter come on up I you know I just I I will just say one word on behalf of the proposal just for a moment(7:29:34)
because I I I understand those very significant concerns that were just raised by Miss Miss ulvan and I get it I(7:29:43)
understand the the challenges of enforcement in New York City uh and(7:29:48)
those are those are real concerns and I you know I think that we are we are trying you know what we are hearing is(7:29:56)
uh the application of real concerns about enforcement to what we are trying to do which we would regard as a scalpel(7:30:01)
not a sledgehammer by the way as it relates to our zoning text but we understand and it doesn't take away from(7:30:07)
the concerns that you are raising so I I just want to say that we we understand that the things that we are trying to do(7:30:12)
or the things that we can do within zoning but that does not take away the concerns that people are raising about enforcement um we don't
think that that(7:30:19)
me means don't do what we're suggesting but we do hear what you're saying and we(7:30:24)
would like to think about how best for the city to act on some of those things Miss deser it's great to see you thank(7:30:30)
you for being here and for your patience today *thank you* um *thank you* for this opportunity to testify I am Susan ster(7:30:37)
district manager for Manhattan Community board 3 representing the board and we(7:30:43)

will be um entering testimony on your portal the community board resolution(7:30:50)
but I'd first like to address um two points that came up earlier today and you want to hear this one yeah your(7:30:57)
staff is the best they are responsive they are(7:31:03)
informed um I last night at our community board meeting this actually came up and I said DCP staff was the(7:31:11)
best of any of the agencies we work with um and um Franchesca was there at the(7:31:17)
time um so we have been working three to four months on this proposal um with(7:31:23)
your staff and they know that we've been very critical of this and that has not(7:31:28)
changed at all the way they've been working with us so *thank you* for that um there is also a comment about our(7:31:35)
community board resolution our resolution was voted on properly um and absolutely the way it(7:31:42)
was supposed to and we stand by that um the objection so community board voted(7:31:49)
to deny with modifications objections and I'll just cover a few points um objections(7:31:56)
centered around the lack of detail to ensure changes would benefit and not harm communities and loss of community(7:32:03)
board and local input and decisions excuse me that would streamline processes but would lose Community voice(7:32:11)
Community boards are means for Community to have a voice in planning and we want to protect that from discussions among(7:32:18)
members and in hearing from the public we hear concerns that proposals will not(7:32:24)
balance both residential and business communities and historical experience(7:32:29)
with lack of enforcement by agencies does not promote faith in compliance um I'd like to cover two(7:32:36)
proposals one is lift time limits to reactivate vacant storefronts we have seen residential(7:32:43)
neighborhoods become nightlife destinations we have the second highest 311 commercial noise complaints of the(7:32:49)
59 boards the community board handles the complaints and I can report this is(7:32:55)
generally because of 4:00 a.m. non-compliant businesses and residential side streets we also have the second(7:33:02)
highest number of non-conforming sites and there's constant conflict between people trying to sleep and those parting(7:33:09)
below their bedroom windows we discussed uh the benefit of commercial that would(7:33:14)
close by 10 p.m. uh for this non-conforming but the city does not seem willing to look at time limitations(7:33:22)
we see benefit of low impact businesses but not late loud bars uh use group(7:33:29)
three Community facilities would offer much Spa um would offer much needed spaces for cultural nonprofit and other(7:33:36)
community facilities already why why don't you why don't you(7:33:42)
finish you have a if you could just wrap it up in the *next* 30 seconds it would be great I will do that well so um we think(7:33:50)
the side streets could be more affordable but for non-eating drinking and I want to say on proposal nine we(7:33:56)
are not against *dancing* we do not get complaints on *Dancing* uh they are fine(7:34:01)
on Commercial side streets it is the noise that is uh issue and that we have to uh want to continue to work with(7:34:09)
great *thank you* very much we appreciate wait before you go commissioner Soro has a question for you *thank you* chair thank(7:34:15)
so much for your for your your comment on your written testimony a quick question to clarify your your position(7:34:21)
on nine I'm wondering if as part of your conversations with the city there was some type of uh discussion about a(7:34:29)
addressing the issue in neighborhoods like yours that's so that are so different in terms of the amount let's(7:34:34)
say of *liquor licenses and of establishments is* there an opportunity for you to adjust or have you thought(7:34:40)
about any opportunities to adjust sort of like the the the proposal to address sort of like the differential impact(7:34:46)
that it will have or the disproportionate impact it will have in communities like yours I I'm not quite sure what I'm not sure quite sure what(7:34:54)
you're asking is there a way to adjust proposal 9 to reflect the high concentration of *liquor licenses and* so(7:35:00)
forth in well what we discussed was that um when you're looking at you're saying(7:35:06)
that something you know is not a large establishment so it shouldn't need so many restrictions but our concern is(7:35:13)
that we have 30 to 40 in any area 30 to 40 within a 500t dis distance we measure(7:35:21)
this all the time so you have to look at look at it uh holistically not just this(7:35:27)
is a small business but this is 40 small businesses in this tiny area and you(7:35:34)
know the enforcement doesn't happen and I know you you say you don't want zoning to depend on enforcement but there is an(7:35:42)
opportunity for the city to say okay we're going to show you we can enforce and it hasn't happened yet(7:35:49)
thank you that's that's super useful so thinking in other words thinking about the cumulative impacts that this can have in places that
concentrate them(7:35:55)

thank you appreciate *thank you* exactly cumul cumulative impact great *thank you* very much Miss Teter *thank you*(7:36:01)
commissioner and Miss tser also *thank you* for um what you said about the department staff and true when we(7:36:06)
appreciate it I I I know it to be true but really it's much more meaningful coming from you so *thank you* um okay(7:36:13)

next up we have uh

Andrea Gordo

um on Zoom great follow followed by(7:36:21)

Joseph(7:36:27)

mallister hi hello can you hear me we can okay great hi um I am here to follow(7:36:35)

up on uh my colleague Susan stutzer's um testimony um *thank you* for the(7:36:41)

opportunity *my name* is Andrea G I'm the chairperson of Manhattan Community board 3 as she alluded to our board did spend(7:36:49)

significant time reviewing the evaluations of the prop and evaluating the proposals and the merits of each and(7:36:55)

although we did vote to deny with a variety of modifications we did vote in favor of many and on behalf of the board(7:37:02)

I want to convey our Collective concerns and objectives to two other specific proposals outlined in the recent zoning(7:37:09)

changes proposal presented for our community these proposals if implemented(7:37:15)

may have significant and adverse effects on our our community and it's our duty to advocate for the well-being of our(7:37:23)

residents so with that um I want to highlight proposal three the um to(7:37:29)

expand opportunities for small scale clean production um we expressed reservations(7:37:34)

about this proposal um but we are open to considering it with modifications moving away from use(7:37:41)

groups to allow clean manufacturing is a major zoning change that may have unintended consequences especially in(7:37:47)

our community many as of right production uses may not serve residents(7:37:52)

and could lead to traffic problems dark sites and unnecessary competition for commercial spaces community board 3(7:37:59)

strongly advocates for ground floor businesses that contribute to the Vitality of the of the community best(7:38:05)

experienced on foot dark sites with production uses that do not benefit the local community should be avoided we(7:38:13)

would support production uses only if they serve the neighborhood and offer products for retail retail sale for(7:38:20)

instance an artial producer selling unique Goods not commonly found online would be a more suitable fit for our(7:38:26)

community and secondly I want to draw attention to proposal five um which is(7:38:31)

enables uh commercial activity on upper floors our community already faces(7:38:36)

substantial conflicts between commercial and residential spaces as demonstrated by ex existing exceptions for second(7:38:44)

floor commercial spaces the adjustment to the C1 and C2 overlay to allow(7:38:50)

commercial activities on upper floors is likely to maximize the commercial F leading to a reduction in housing stock(7:38:57)

before implementing this proposal we strongly recommend that the department of City Planning consider proposing(7:39:03)

proposing zoning regulations to address the current and worsening housing crisis moreover we have identified significant(7:39:10)

flaws in environmental considerations including inadequate coverage of neighboring buildings limited scope um(7:39:18)

cover covering only air quality noise and vibration and an arbitrary exemption for small spaces these flaws could(7:39:25)

result in conflicts between business and residents particularly in the case of eating and drinking establishments on(7:39:30)

higher rooftops and uh higher floors and rooftops community board three urges um(7:39:37)

uh the Planning Commission delay the implementation of this proposal time time up that was it I was okay Finish(7:39:43)

you you were wrapping up you can finish your thought go ahead um yes so we we're(7:39:49)

uh urging you to to delay the implementation of these proposals and thoroughly address the identified concerns to ensure the well-being of our(7:39:56)

community and carefully consider these objections and concerns before finalizing any decisions related to the(7:40:02)

proposed zoning changes *thank you thank you for thank you* for that and we will and we will(7:40:08)

because uh when community board is coming to us with We Believe yes on these no on these and you give us the(7:40:14)

reasons why it's exactly what we asked you for so we will *thank you* for that *thank you* you we appreciate you thank(7:40:20)

you okay let's go uh J

oseph mallister

we is here okay great on Zoom(7:40:44)
great Joseph you should be able to unmute(7:40:51)
unmute okay there you go we hear you now okay good evening all due respect to all(7:40:59)
the Commissioners on board we worked with you for many years ago and positive outcome that we had *my name* is Joseph(7:41:07)
McAllister I am the President and founder of the South Pacific Association we founded the South Pacific(7:41:13)
associate in 2001 due to the overdevelopment corruption and greed of(7:41:19)
our control building and with the building codes we work with City Planning Chief James moralia stand out(7:41:26)
here in 2000 we had down down zoning approved back then in(7:41:32)
2000 um we down Zone to r3x in South Beach ARA Fort Wadsworth Grassmere soon(7:41:39)
after the following months new text amendments followed with then B president Milo for other parts of(7:41:46)
statown to be down zoned Sandy superstorm hit us in 2012 five(7:41:52)
years later 2017 the eastshore resiliency planning was found formed and(7:41:58)
I was on that board to reconfigure the building codes to make future plan building safe with proper resilience(7:42:05)
strategies that's I don't know if you can see that that's the book that we had we had other people that were involved(7:42:12)
with this also now today we are here trying to reinforce better quality of life needs(7:42:18)
our future our community and all of Sten Island okay we oppose the city of yes(7:42:23)
plan this plan though this plan is excellent a excellent model for(7:42:29)
Manhattan New York City I do not object to that this is the the sketches that(7:42:35)
they showed us that goes great for New York City everything the 18 goals that they showed us all goes with New York(7:42:41)
City Manhattan unfortunately though this is not for the other Burrows and especially(7:42:47)
not St Island we of a different we are a different lifestyle here on S Island at(7:42:53)
the past Community two board meetings we were informed by City Planning they have(7:42:59)
met with the Stan on economic development Corp and the ston Chambers of Commerce these two named businesses(7:43:04)
are for the businesses of stown not for the residential homeowners or Property Owners of St they work for Economic and(7:43:12)
Business opportunity which is good but again we do not have the adequate(7:43:17)
resources to add these changes schools fire police sanitation health care(7:43:23)
hospitals wide and regular roadways sidewalks and most importantly the Buildings Department Personnel Resources(7:43:31)
for do has been overburdened and scarce for years Architects have been(7:43:36)
self-certifying plans where they go and they submitted to the to the plans to the deal be nobody's looking over the(7:43:43)
plans that they submitted because they're self-certified whereas then we find later on houses and bu build are not up the code and not
conforming with(7:43:50)
the building codes where is the enforcement okay this is It's just so(7:43:56)
disgusting of what has been happening for the past 10 years or so City plan(7:44:01)
figure redo the plans for all residential communities sit down with educated homeowners Community leaders to(7:44:08)
have proper insight and quality of life issues addressed to make this city of yes(7:44:16)
more okay Mr maau we love lost you there time was up my apologies we're going to move on to the *next* person uh but we(7:44:23)
understand your concerns about again we understand the concerns that you were raising and that other others have raised about
enforcement let's go to(7:44:28)

Maddie derbo from rebney

followed by Lucy Levine Alan sunna Kevin(7:44:38)
guscott welcome *thank you* um hi *my name* is Maddie derero and(7:44:44)
I'm here on behalf of the real estate Board of New York rebney represents commercial residential and institutional(7:44:50)
Property Owners Builders Architects and land use attorneys with Decades of experience in zoning matters who prior(7:44:56)
to referral have weighed in on various aspects of Zoning for Economic Opportunity we strongly support the(7:45:02)

goals of the proposed text to make it easier for businesses to grow and locate throughout New York City by providing(7:45:07) increased flexibility through zoning and thank the City Planning Commission for the opportunity to testify in support of(7:45:13) Zoning for Economic Opportunity rney commends the department of city planning for the proposed common sense changes to(7:45:18) modernize the zoning resolution and provide simpler rules for businesses to follow Citywide the stated goals for(7:45:24) Economic Opportunity highlight the importance of flexibility in our zoning regulations and several aspects of The(7:45:30) Proposal meet that test such as the consolidation and reorganization of use groups however other provisions of the(7:45:36) proposed text appear to work against the stated goals of allowing for more flexibility and enabling business-friendly Street skapes portions(7:45:43) of the tier b andc regulations would impose new restrictions that would make it harder to accommodate the many building infrastructure elements on(7:45:50) ground floors of new buildings these elements include elevator cores exit stairs required mechanical space(7:45:56) compactor rooms building amenity spaces waste containerization all alongside required building areas like reception(7:46:03) and mail package rooms as well as access to parking and loading the current proposal does not fully appreciate this(7:46:10) complexity the proposed text expands ground floor use requirements minimum death requirements and other(7:46:16) prescriptive rules to vast L of the City where such restrictions do not currently exist where the current regulations are(7:46:21) less onerous for example within several Special Districts and high density non-contextual Districts The Proposal(7:46:28) prescribes a minimum qualifying depth of 30 feet for ground floor uses and increases the percentage of Street(7:46:34) Frontage that is regulated these regulations will be harder to meet not easier and create(7:46:40) unintended consequences the current retail environment in today's market does not support this proposal and the(7:46:45) process for navigating the new regulations is over complicated lastly consistent with other zoning text amendments such as carbon(7:46:52) neutrality we urge the commission to include a vesting provision for inprocess projects that will be impacted(7:46:57) by the streets SE regulations and use group reorganization without doing so(7:47:02) projects will incur significant costs associated with redesign and will suffer delays in bringing new housing online(7:47:08) admix admix sorry admix a housing crisis R me support Zoning for Economic(7:47:13) Opportunity yet more work needs to be done to ensure that the proposed streetscape regulations are simple(7:47:18) and that Ving Provisions are put in place to ensure a smooth transition and we urge the department to work with(7:47:23) industry experts to refine these aspects of the text in addition to our testimony we'll submit an appendix with suggested(7:47:30) technical fixes for your consideration *thank you thank you* very much we(7:47:35) appreciate you being here okay let's move on to

Lucy LaVine

followed by Alan(7:47:42)
tuna Kevin [Music] guscott(7:47:53)
hello hi Commissioners *my name* is Lucy LaVine I'm speaking on behalf of the historic District's Council HGC has(7:48:01) submitted in-depth comments on CVS for Economic Opportunity to the Department of City Planning what follows is our(7:48:07) abbreviated testimony HGC appreciates that the city is interested in supporting economic resiliency in(7:48:14) post-pandemic New York unfortunately we believe that the proposed text amendments do not provide adequate(7:48:20) protection for small businesses and instead threaten to decrease the city's overall housing Supply while weakening(7:48:26) regulations that support special purpose districts we are heartened to see that(7:48:31) coo supports the retention of long-term commercial storefronts in historic districts by eliminating the 2-year(7:48:38) vacancy rule that currently restricts commercial use we believe this change will help long-standing Legacy(7:48:44) businesses by legalizing what is currently a non-permitted use and we feel that this provision must be(7:48:51) accompanied by commercial rent stabilization regarding Coo's proposals(7:48:56) for commercial development on Nitra campuses we urge close consultation with Nitra residents around these proposals(7:49:03) in order to prioritize residents needs and consider the historic Integrity of some campuses which are landmarked or(7:49:10)

listed on the national register of historic places we also find retention of housing to be one of the most urgent(7:49:17)
needs facing our city thus we are concerned that Provisions in coo could(7:49:23)
together lead to a net loss of housing in favor of office and commercial space(7:49:28)
however we are in favor of Coo's proposed modernization of loading dock(7:49:33)
requirements which we believe can yield more housing and ease the Adaptive reuse of historic structures that said we are(7:49:42)
concerned about Coo's proposed new discretionary zoning tool which would(7:49:47)
allow ow DCP to wave limited bulk rules we are concerned this would allow(7:49:52)
businesses to flout zoning at will simply by claiming that their businesses are constrained by the existing shape of(7:49:59)
their buildings given that DCP seems eager to allow vast changes to the size(7:50:05)
shape and usage of New York's building stock we are concerned about Co Yo's(7:50:11)
Provisions to create consistent groundfloor design requirements at the expense of Special Districts The stated(7:50:18)
goal is to Foster vibrant neighborhoods by activating commercial corridors but we fear that these changes will instead(7:50:24)
lead to less vibrant streets because the city will lose the regulatory power to(7:50:30)
leverage a given neighborhood's unique characteristics to help promote its social and economic vibrancy zoning that(7:50:36)
treats the wet lands of Staten Island exactly as it treats the shopping corridors of Madison Avenue is a(7:50:42)
detriment to both and a missed opportunity to leverage what's already there as we create something new special(7:50:50)
district zoning helps maintain the the specificity of our cities neighborhoods(7:50:56)
while allowing for growth if our street Scapes look like they could be anywhere they could also be nowhere *thank you*(7:51:02)
thank you very much okay let's go to

Alan sunna

Kevin guscott followed by(7:51:07)
Chris Walters on(7:51:12)
Zoom welcome *thank you* Dan good afternoon commissioner(7:51:19)
and to those that I known for a long time uh I'm Alan soon I'm chairman of silver cup studios here in New York uh(7:51:27)
we've been around for a little over 40 years and I'm uh here to testify in(7:51:32)
support of the uh city of yes and Economic Opportunity for all I want to(7:51:38)
commend the mayor and the New York Department of City Planning whose staff is terrific uh for taking the initiative(7:51:45)
to create a FR framework here for the city of Y in the zoning text Amendment changes uh(7:51:51)
the zoning text uh changes are contemplated that are contemplated will help create more jobs and an overall(7:51:58)
better New York and it can integrate growth and change to our city in a smarter way than previously contemplated(7:52:04)
when so many of the zoning text was written I had to say it around the time that I was born or before so uh and you(7:52:13)
know you've listened to a lot of testimony today that's just all over the place I'm really going to be very(7:52:19)
specific um we are one of the largest providers of film and television Studios(7:52:24)
and Facilities here in New York I doubt any of you have missed at least one show(7:52:30)
that has been done at our place uh a few of the proposed text changes will allow for the creation of more sound stages(7:52:36)
and support spaces which will generate hundreds if not thousands of jobs in our(7:52:42)
new economy here in New York without changing the overall zoning map uh nothing I'm saying talks about adding(7:52:48)
any F or going into residential neighborhoods I'm strictly focused on the M districts uh the anticipated uh(7:52:56)
you know these changes will allow us to create the kinds of buildings that are needed to facilitate this kind of work(7:53:03)
which is basically tall Square buildings uh that allow sets to be built and all(7:53:09)
kinds of things uh to be done um and we have some of those now but to build(7:53:16)
across the street we have whoops we have other issues that it's it's really it's about setbacks uh that don't affect the(7:53:23)
M districts at all and so uh none of these changes will be automatic we uh(7:53:29)
anyone will still have to go through an application process and an approval process with New York City Planning um(7:53:36)

so you know people that are fearful that oh my God these things are just going to happen like that that it's just not the(7:53:41)
case because City Planning is going to make certain that those things that we want to build which is like I said no F(7:53:48)
changes uh will be you know consistent with the neighborhood uh overall uh you(7:53:55)
know this just makes the whole process easier to navigate uh the city of yes uh opportunity simplifies these zoning(7:54:01)
resolutions to treat similar uses the same allow businesses to locate uh in(7:54:07)
appropriate districts and it just makes the rules clearer uh for businesses(7:54:12)
Citywide without doing a wholesale rezoning of the city uh and these adjustments are just changes to zoning(7:54:19)
text it does not rezone neighborhoods this is the kind of forward thinking that will enable us to create more jobs(7:54:26)
here in New York and that's what it's all about *thank you* very much we appreciate that and certainly agree so(7:54:33)
thank you thanks thanks a lot for being here okay Kevin guscott is up followed by Chris(7:54:39)
Walters and then Carolyn Ferguson good evening commissioners here(7:54:48)
good evening *thank you* for having me and I'm a special projects manager for the(7:54:54)
Brooklyn um Chamber of Commerce so I'm here representing um the position of the(7:55:01)
Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce on this on this issue so the Brooklyn Chamber of Commerce strongly supports the(7:55:07)
department of City planning's proposal city of yes Eon city of the yes for Economic Opportunity the Brooklyn(7:55:15)
Chamber of Commerce is a borrow worldwide membership and economic development organization dedicated to(7:55:22)
helping businesses through four channels that is promotion support(7:55:28)
advocacy and convening the Brooklyn chamber and its(7:55:35)
Affiliates and its affiliate organization the Brooklyn Alliance um the Brooklyn Alliance Capital um provide(7:55:44)
Direct business services technical assistance and support programs to help business grow in(7:55:51)
Brooklyn New York City needs modern zoning regulations to reflect our City's needs(7:55:59)
our commercial corridors or the lifeblood of our communities and this proposal will not(7:56:07)
only help to reduce retail vacancies but will ensure a wider range(7:56:12)
of businesses and support for job growth which is vital for the city's economic(7:56:21)
recovery the covid-19 pandemic highlighted the importance of flexibility in our zoning(7:56:29)
regulations businesses small and large or re re-evaluating how they use space(7:56:35)
where to locate and how they function in the face of changing consumer preferences and economic conditions by(7:56:43)
allowing businesses that cater to the spe specifc demands of the(7:56:49)
community Zoning for economic OPP opportunity will be promoting a more Community Centric approach to(7:56:57)
zoning *thank you* for the consideration thank *thank you* very much we appreciate(7:57:03)
you being here okay *next* up is
Chris Walters on Zoom
Chris Walters is not in the zoom let's go to
Caroline Ferguson
(7:57:11)
on Zoom Harolyn Ferguson is not in the zoom Joan Gilbert(7:57:35)
it appears Joan is not in the zoom how about

Eugene(7:57:41)

Phallic

promoting now great Mr Pall you're up you have three minutes(7:58:02)
hello I'm a member of the board of the baywater civic(7:58:07)
association uh I support the statements of uh Susan Nel Paul(7:58:12)
gratiano Susan spalter and misso Sullivan I think it's(7:58:19)

significant that all of the members of the public virtually whom you've had on(7:58:24)
today are opposed to your proposal businesses of course are somewhat in favor of specific(7:58:33)
things um when the bayw civic association recently had a meeting to discuss this and our council members(7:58:41)
sylena Brooks Powers came I think she was surprised at the high level of(7:58:48)
position let me talk about the lack of parking people from downtown Far(7:58:55)
Rockaway Redfern housing projects walk a mile into baywater to(7:59:01)
find a place to park and you guys think parking is not required the elimination of council(7:59:09)
approval is undemocratic and antisocial it continues your ongoing(7:59:16)
policy of not posting hearing notices as Nassau County does for anything that's(7:59:24)
changing I suggest if you're really interested you might take a look at baywater civic. org cityof yes.(7:59:33)
HTML you would allow eight stores on a street corner now when your people come(7:59:39)
to the community board they say well it's not really going to happen but(7:59:44)
you've already done things that you said weren't really going to happen you've contributed greatly to stores in the(7:59:52)
Nassau 5 towns through your development of downtown far(7:59:57)
Rockway I propose the most effective thing that could be done would be to shut down the department of City(8:00:06)
Planning and repeal the zoning laws since effectively that's what this(8:00:11)
proposal does you would allow unrestricted development(8:00:18)
thank you well *thank you* very much uh for for(8:00:24)
being here I think um you know we uh we certainly don't(8:00:31)
see uh the response from the public the way that you uh do sir uh we've had lots(8:00:37)
of support today from members of the public as well as half of the community boards that have weighed in have weighed(8:00:43)
in in favor um even the ones that have weighed in against have weighed in with conditions in many cases so um we we(8:00:49)
appreciate your you're being here we uh we also have three burough presidents(8:00:55)
have waited out and waited in in favor so I I just don't I don't I didn't hear it the way you heard it today um so um I(8:01:01)
will just note it we appreciate that you're you're taking the time to be with us but in terms of members of the public(8:01:07)
and New Yorkers who are weighing in there certainly uh we've heard uh(8:01:12)
concerns we've also heard a lot of things in favor as well so um okay let's move on to the *next* person we're going(8:01:18)
to *hear from* uh

Edwin uh Wesley of the Jackson Heights

beautification group and(8:01:24)
then Michelle Campo *thank you* very much Mr chairman uh(8:01:31)
my name is Edwin o'keef Wesley a former president of the Jackson Heights beautification group a member of the(8:01:38)
queen Civic Congress and 20-year member of community board Q3 *thank you* for(8:01:44)
inviting me to our our one of our outer Burrows of Manhattan uh I'm here to give(8:01:50)
testimony my first response or the organization's first response to the city of yes we have we have before us a(8:01:59)
complete gutting of our zoning laws total deregulation authored by the real estate(8:02:06)
industry and embraced by our mayor the City Planning Commission was the instrument used to develop 18 separate(8:02:13)
proposals as part of the second phase labeled Economic Development there was a(8:02:19)
time when City Planning protected our neighborhoods but now they act as agents(8:02:25)
for the developers I would specifically point out that the community boards had(8:02:31)
representatives from the Planning Commission that seems to have disappeared I go back to Fred Lee who(8:02:38)

was our man in Queens uh at our community board he was terrific he came(8:02:45)
out of the Queens office he was very candid gave us good advice I I(8:02:51)
did okay this package of proposals will remove whatever minimal protections our(8:02:59)
residential neighborhoods have today and legalize unbridled and unchecked Commercial development this is not a(8:03:06)
surprise since the pandemic has given the all clear our neighborhoods(8:03:12)
have been converted to the wild west vendors are unlicensed vendors have(8:03:17)
occupied our commercial streets and avenues fruit and vegetable stores now extend to the curb with the help of the(8:03:24)
ebike storage on our sidewalks over the past several months our community boards(8:03:30)
have been reviewing the city of yes proposal many have expressed total opposition to zoning deregulations as(8:03:38)
expressed in the 18 proposals the community boards represents the institutional memory to for each of our(8:03:45)
neighborhoods many boards have been overwhelmed with complex issues being presented all at once Casino proposals a(8:03:53)
new stud Stadium request in the beginning it was painful to sit through(8:03:59)
the presentation because of the lack of information and the inability to answer straightforward questions however the(8:04:06)
last presentation I attended was much better with most of the significant(8:04:11)
information presented and the narrative was quite good(8:04:16)
so my commendations however the boards have been given a very short window of(8:04:22)
opportunity to review before we are expected to vote New York City is the(8:04:28)
greatest city in the world we can and must explore other options a one-sized(8:04:33)
fits all for the city as complex as New York City fails short of meeting these(8:04:38)
important goals *thank you* very much *thank you* sir we appreciate it let's move to Michelle(8:04:44)
Campo she here in the room Miss Campo are you here going once going(8:04:51)
twice okay

David West of Hill West Mr West

(8:04:57)
here great welcome hello(8:05:09)
hello good evening I'm David West I'm an architect practicing in New York City(8:05:15)
I'm also AI a consultant to the rney zoning and design committee I'm(8:05:21)
testifying on behalf of my firm my clients and the development community in(8:05:26)
general the text amendment has many positives that are commendable reorganizing and simplifying the Arcane(8:05:33)
and outdated use group categories in the zoning resolution is welcome and overdue(8:05:40)
in spite of the positives there is an area of the text that will have far-reaching negative impacts on the(8:05:45)
design of many buildings this is the new streetscape text which has been(8:05:50)
described as a simplification and standardization of existing rules but(8:05:56)
which actually imposes new requirements that interfere with best design practices for new mixed use and(8:06:02)
residential buildings the ground floor is precious real estate subject to numerous conflicting demands(8:06:10)
prescriptive use width and depth mandates are counterproductive and will impact proper design of such necessary(8:06:17)
components as service entries fire exits package rooms bicycle storage trash(8:06:22)
storage and tenant amenities many requirements in the proposed text are clear increases from(8:06:29)
current regulations for example in R 10 equivalent contextual zones mandatory(8:06:35)
non-residential use will go from 15 foot minimum depth to 30 foot minimum depth a(8:06:41)
doubling of the requirement in similar non-contextual zones the requirement(8:06:46)
will go from 50% of Frontage to 100% also double while in the abstract this(8:06:53)
may seem relatively innocuous these types of prescriptive requirements can be very difficult to design around and(8:07:00)
frequently lead to unintended consequences crowding out other components that are necessary for these(8:07:06)
large complex buildings my suggestion would be to reduce the mandates at least(8:07:11)

back to what currently exists and not to impose new mandates furthermore where(8:07:17)
mandates exist it is imperative that the text be clear and comprehensive so that(8:07:22)
there are no questions as to what is and is not permitted the current proposal is(8:07:28)
not entirely clear for example as to what constitutes ancillary use or(8:07:34)
whether service and egress components are permitted and affected Street frontages the social block criteria must(8:07:41)
be clarified as well having tested it we see that there are ambiguities that would make this path challenging loading(8:07:48)
birth should be permitted in qualifying depth retail has been challenged in(8:07:54)
recent years many retail spaces remain empty negatively impacting streetscape(8:07:59)
by allowing more flexibility these spaces can be repurposed for other active uses including tenant amenities(8:08:06)
and in appropriate locations ground floor dwelling units the market should dictate these decisions not zoning(8:08:13)
mandates based on wishful thinking about economic conditions assuming these concerns can be addressed the overall(8:08:20)
text amendment is well crafted and will go a long way towards making our zoning more predictable and comprehensible and(8:08:28)
deserves support *thank you thank you* very much Mr West we appreciate it let's move on to Jesse(8:08:34)
Solomon Mr Solomon are you here no Mr Solomon okay

Zack(8:08:43)

Bernstein

followed by Paul sver Mr sver here he's here great okay all(8:08:51)
right welcome *thank you* T gnik and Commissioners I'm Zack Bernstein partner(8:08:57)
in the land use practice at freed Frank and member of many zoning and design committee my working days are spend(8:09:02)
reading the zoning resolution to help clients open businesses build new housing and otherwise improve their(8:09:07)
properties the city's Economic Opportunity proposal makes a range of thoughtful clarifications and updates to(8:09:13)
Long outdated zoning the updates will help clear up many uncertainties or barriers toward the goal of expanding(8:09:19)
opportunity for job growth and street life in our neighborhoods I have three recommendations for improvement of this(8:09:24)
initiative one micro distribution uses these small facilities have great(8:09:29)
potential to relieve Street and sidewalk congestion by taking trucks Caro cargo bikes and their related loading off the(8:09:36)
street in high density areas they also provide potential for safe dedicated electric charging for emission-free(8:09:42)
deliveries however splitting The Limited size allowance across multiple floors is Impractical for the operation of these(8:09:49)
facilities to accomplish the potential benefits of micro distribution The Limited allowance for this use must be(8:09:55)
permitted entirely at the ground level it's very important two Life Sciences(8:10:00)
the proposed zoning clarifies outdated terminology for Laboratories in this growing sector of the city's economy(8:10:07)
however the special permit that may be sought for bulk waivers should be available whether or not a project is(8:10:12)
also seeking use waivers life science uses that are as of right may still need to seek waivers through ulurp to allow(8:10:18)
for regular floor plates and to accommodate specialized mechanical and Life Safety Equipment the department and(8:10:24)
the commission should consider refining the special permit to allow for this three streetscape The Proposal includes(8:10:30)
new requirements for specific uses to specific depths at the ground floor buildings particularly in the new tier B(8:10:36)
these new requirements have given great pause to zoning practitioners for the potential to complicate planning for new(8:10:42)
buildings including much needed housing while there are benefits from standardization of certain existing(8:10:48)
rules the commission should ensure that any new rules take into account site planning for functional buildings and(8:10:53)
housing some ways this could be accomplished or with a 50% rather than 100% requirement and by providing Common(8:11:00)
Sense allowances for utility access egress and other necessary building functions *thank you* for your attention(8:11:05)
to these comments great *thank you* very much let's move on to

Paul Selver

welcome followed by David(8:11:14)

kovski welcome okay *thank you* Mr chairman members of the commission I'm Paul sver co-chair of the land use(8:11:21)

department at Kramer L and chair of the real estate Board of New York zoning and design committee I'm pleased to present(8:11:27)

RB's recommendation for a vesting provision for the Department's generally excellent city of yes Economic(8:11:33)

Opportunity zoning change Rey's recommendation has two goals the first is to ensure that projects in the(8:11:40)

advanced planning stages are not adversely affected by the city of yes changes in substantive zoning control(8:11:45)

controls especially those involving streetscape the second is to provide a template for a future zoning action that(8:11:52)

brings the general vesting provisions of the zoning resolution into the 21st century today the statutory standard for(8:11:59)

vesting is contained in section 11 30 331 of the zoning resolution and it(8:12:04)

requires that prior to the effective date of zoning change a full building permit for development must be issued(8:12:11)

and that foundations must be completed this text hasn't been changed in over three generations during the same period(8:12:19)

the environment in which development occurs has evolved in that one land and relocation costs have stored two(8:12:26)

residential tenants have received additional protections land assemblages have have uh become burdened by(8:12:33)

increasingly complex zoning regulations the entitlement process has become longer and more fraught by an(8:12:39)

overwhelmed permitting Administration by an expanded public review process and by increasingly litigious PR stakeholders(8:12:46)

and the pace of construction has been slowed to ensure the safety of those working on site the reforms rney is proposing are(8:12:54)

based on the same principles of fairness and due process that underly the existing vesting standard they also draw(8:13:00)

from a deep pool of precedent that include New York State's common law vesting standard numerous special(8:13:06)

vesting Provisions in the zoning resolution itself and vesting standards of other jurisdictions across the(8:13:12)

country they will ensure that statutory vesting takes account of the real world timing and business challenges of(8:13:18)

developing in New York and they will also reasonably protect the long-term Investments of risk Capital made to fund(8:13:25)

land and pre-development costs uh the the proposed modifications are as(8:13:33)

follows projects will be able to vest against the zoning change by filing a work permit application prior to the(8:13:39)

date of adoption of the zoning change and securing approval for a foundation(8:13:44)

NB or all permit with within one year of its adoption two a building will be able to be enlarged by up to 20% of its floor(8:13:50)

area pursuant to the pre-amendment zoning controls and remain invested three a building larger than 200,000(8:13:57)

Square fet will have up to 5 Years From the date the work permit is approved to secure its first temporary certificate(8:14:02)

of occupancy and the right to extend construction on the same terms uh(8:14:07)

permitted today for there will be protection against frivolous challenges to a vested permit and five zoning(8:14:13)

challenges will be permitted only a of the first time that a specific zoning issue is(8:14:19)

permitted um that's actually substantively everything great okay(8:14:24)

excellent right on time *thank you* commissioner Benjamin has a question hello uh Mr(8:14:30)

svr do you believe that these vesting Provisions are within the scope um I believe that the vesting(8:14:37)

Provisions that we're suggesting for this text are within the(8:14:42)

scope I I'm not suggesting that you can do any anything more than work within(8:14:47)

the provisions of this work work to deal with the vesting for this text so you're(8:14:52)

not suggesting that we should amend 11331 not at this point I'm suggesting(8:14:59)

that I'm suggesting that what we're recommending be looked at as a template for amending 11331 in a subsequent(8:15:07)

zoning action perhaps the uh uh City ofs Housing Opportunity text so where would(8:15:13)

you put this in the new text this would be this would be um you know(8:15:19)

they have in in article one chapter chapter one uh they have special vesting(8:15:25)

Provisions for you know different zoning uh zoning text or map changes the the hotel(8:15:33)

special permit has its own special vesting Provisions within its the permit(8:15:38)

text itself so you you'd have you'd have a choice I think here because you're dealing with something as broad as the(8:15:46)

uh as as broad as as The Economic Opportunity text is You' you'd put it in(8:15:52)

article one chapter one but as a special provision for dealing with the(8:15:58)

zoning change that was approved on such and such a date under calendar number such and such a calendar(8:16:05)
number which how they've done it we have certainly done other vesting(8:16:11)
modifications um most recently we did investing modification(8:16:17)
inal carbon neutrality um but 5 years is(8:16:23)
really more than we've seen before and you don't consider that problematic well(8:16:29)
I think I think it's it isn't quite because the hotel special permit and I realized there were a lot of special(8:16:35)
considerations involved there but the hotel special permit gave people a lot of time to vest and I think what what we(8:16:41)
are seeing today um is that there is on(8:16:47)
many projects uh an inability to go forward either because if you're residential there's no tax abatement if(8:16:53)
you're commercial if your office is office space there's going to be a long time before we're going to need new(8:16:59)
office space if you're retail maybe you can't get it financed right now so there's a there are market conditions(8:17:06)
that could delay the start of a project um as well as uh uh inability to get(8:17:14)
financing so it it really gives people a little bit more Running Room uh when it(8:17:20)
comes down to uh being able to get started under adverse(8:17:25)
circumstances and you would propose this for new construction but not(8:17:31)
alts um I think uh the five years would be for new construction yes over 200,000(8:17:37)
square feet okay *thank you thank you* commissioner Mr sver *thank you* for being(8:17:42)
here uh

David carosi i

s *next*(8:17:49)
welcome evening chair garnik and Commissioners I'm David carosi like Zach also from freed Frank and a member of(8:17:56)
the rney zoning committee uh I'm here to speak in support of Zoning for Economic Opportunity but also to endorse Rey's(8:18:03)
testimony that the streetscape provisions uh of the text require further discussion in order to ensure(8:18:08)
that they don't have unintended effects of creating practical difficulties in the design and construction of new(8:18:14)
buildings contrary to the stated objectives of Zoe itself now streetscape(8:18:19)
rules activate the street Frontage and that's obviously a worthy goal but they're tricky because by requiring(8:18:25)
active uses on a street Frontage they also limit the area available to meet the many needs of a building ranging(8:18:31)
from the location of elevator cores to exit stairs to compactor rooms and more competing needs for space make the(8:18:38)
design of a ground floor challenging under any circumstance and streetscape rules can add to this complexity much as(8:18:45)
streetscape rules are important from an Urban Design perspective they also need to take into account the importance of having buildings
that work the current(8:18:52)
proposal has two general thrusts the first as it's been said is to standardize and simplify rules where(8:18:58)
they apply today that's generally along designated streets and Special Districts and in some highdensity non-contextual(8:19:04)
zoning districts and second it creates Universal streetscape regulations applicable to parts of the city where(8:19:10)
the regulations don't apply today at all I'm going to focus my comments on the first category and the interest of of time and to avoid some
repetition the(8:19:18)
proposed standardization of existing rules has clear benefits for example by creating more liberal allowances for(8:19:24)
Lobby widths than is the case today but at the same time the proposal in its current form would increase restrictions(8:19:29)
along many designated streets for example it would establish use requirements along a 100% of a frontage(8:19:36)
at locations where a 50% requirement applies today and likewise The Proposal would would establish a 30 foot minimum(8:19:42)
retail depth in areas where there is no depth required today these changes can have all kinds of unintended(8:19:48)
consequences today for example it's sort of obvious that the design of a ground floor of a building with a frontage(8:19:53)
subject to a 50% requirement uh can use the other 50% of the area to locate(8:19:59)
critical building functions that would no longer be possible and I want to note that the extent to which these changes(8:20:05)
could have unintended consequences depends in large measure on what the text Will Allow as permitted(8:20:11)

obstructions within the minimum depth area this is something that needs to be better defined and understood and I(8:20:16)
hope that we can have further discussions about that uh *thank you* for your consideration of these comments I(8:20:22)
just want to add one remark about youth groups which is that when I joined the(8:20:27)
Department of City Planning in 1998 there was a lot of discussion about how we have to reform this the youth groups(8:20:32)
and we never did so what you've done is an incredible accomplishment *thank you* very much and(8:20:38)
it's always good to have you back here *thank you* David okay let's uh move on to Susan(8:20:43)
Simon Miss Simon are you here in the room no okay

Victoria(8:20:51)

hilstrom

is uh she she's now on Zoom(8:20:56)
okay(8:21:07)
you can you hear me we can hello Dan gnik this is Victoria(8:21:15)
hilstrom uh I was there earlier and of course I know that you know us uh(8:21:20)
Justine alad Carlos's daughter uh just above me and of course we are a very(8:21:27)
very huge fan uh you must know that Carlos is a quite famous restaurant tour(8:21:32)
and architect and I hello truly object uh to the office of(8:21:39)
nightlife uh what he was suggesting isn't true but that's not why I came to(8:21:45)
testify what what I'd like to bring uh to the commissioner's attention is that(8:21:50)
we are of course in Tribeca Justine grew up in our Loft and on Spring Street(8:21:57)
there have been massive resoning uh in Tribeca in SoHo uh in the sea ports(8:22:05)
where many of the uh I should just say I am a designer we are not adverse uh to(8:22:11)
development in any way shape or form design stores my work has been published(8:22:17)
around the world Carlos's work is quite well received around the world and I am(8:22:23)
just very taken back that if in fact you(8:22:29)
believed in live workpace and many of the things that this seeks(8:22:36)
to achieve then why are we resoning our industrial(8:22:42)
zones when we have a thousand Loft bill buildings in North Brooklyn and we(8:22:49)
have now rone Soho in a plan to knock down 185 rent stabilized buildings alter(8:22:57)
artist lofs to commercial to office space for Tech adding big box retail uh(8:23:04)
restaurants and hotels that is essentially privatizing residential(8:23:09)
neighborhoods when our need is residential and so I would just like to(8:23:15)
say that I am extremely disappointed that City Planning would ever dream in a(8:23:22)
trillion years of no ulur of the community no longer having a say in our(8:23:30)
case we converted industrial buildings to residential code impacting design and(8:23:37)
architecture around the world and the very thing we built the movie industry(8:23:43)
fashion film music entertainment and the Arts and in our manufacturing zones that(8:23:50)
what you are suggesting cannot be put into a residential neighborhood what you(8:23:56)
may not realize uh Dan gnik is that the city did not legally convert Loft(8:24:02)
buildings at to market rate legally where many of the buildings were illegally vacated where all of the(8:24:09)
permits have been falsified and literally there are 46 buildings that(8:24:15)
were fraudulently converted that that the suggestion that you could do this is(8:24:22)

off the charts so I I just wanted to contribute that I I'm just very taken(8:24:28)
back by the not we lost you miss hilstrom U sorry(8:24:35)
your your time was up but I will note um for the benefit of those listening the(8:24:40)
famous Justine alada that she's referring to was my chief of staff once upon time in my days in the city council(8:24:46)
um and a great great person um as for the the the facts and figures here um we(8:24:53)
are not um resoning industrial zones as part of this proposal um we are not(8:24:58)
touching the Loft law in this proposal so um I just you know for the benefit of(8:25:04)
of clarity here but we we we appreciate uh Miss hilstrom uh being here uh today(8:25:09)
in person and then also joining us on Zoom let's go to

Carol Donovan

is she available *thank you*(8:25:19)
Carol you should be able to unmute on your phone in(8:25:24)
Zoom yes *thank you* for giving us an opportunity to speak uh I'm president of(8:25:29)
the Richmond toown and Clark Avenue civic association in Staten Island and I(8:25:36)
agree with uh residential communities that are voicing their opinion in total(8:25:42)
opposition of this plan I'm in all due respect I understand the city wants to(8:25:47)
be a vibrant place but we want our residential communities preserved we do(8:25:54)
not want to lose our voice in in the process of reviewing applications for(8:26:00)
construction or development the community boards don't want to lose their voice we want residential(8:26:06)
communities to remain a place that you can actually come home to that people(8:26:13)
can enjoy the Solace of a quiet residential area and we do not want to(8:26:18)
be like a Times Square situation A 247 operation that's referenced in the(8:26:26)
project descriptions and as others have pointed out the city is already uh(8:26:32)
overloaded if you will in terms of our essential Services trying to uh monitor(8:26:40)
uh businesses where you as they've others have spoken about uh **dance** halls(8:26:46)
or clubs where everything is out of control you have drug addicts in the street we don't have enough police right(8:26:52)
now to enforce the law and the Buildings Department is sadly understaffed uh(8:26:59)
as many people will attest if you try calling 311 with complaints about issues(8:27:06)
they're often unresolved or it's done too late uh similarly if the BSA(8:27:14)
the board of standards and appeal is given free reign to approve everything with uh little or no input from(8:27:22)
residents uh we see it as a zoning free-for-all we don't see in any way(8:27:28)
that the citizens of New York who are paying the taxes uh to keep the city running how do we benefit we don't see(8:27:36)
it written anywhere in the language of these proposals so and we have heard(8:27:42)
this type of response this outrage from other Burrows as well not just our(8:27:49)
area so *thank you* for giving us the an opportunity to speak of course *thank you*(8:27:55)
very much Miss Donovan let's go to veto laella Vito is not in the(8:28:01)
room

Willis Elkins

here in person oh on Zoom(8:28:13)

okay(8:28:27)

wellis you should be able to yeah do you hear me yes we can okay great *thank you*(8:28:34)

so much uh was there in person before 10 o'clock AM and glad to be able to testify so uh *thank you* all um *my name*(8:28:42)

is Will Elkins I'm the executive director of the Newtown Creek Alliance for a communitybased nonprofit dedicated(8:28:47)

restoring revealing revitalizing New Town Creek an industrial waterway that borders the ibz of North Pro long on(8:28:54)

City and Maspeth organization Works to clean the creek of historic toxins and ongoing pollution sources as well as(8:29:00)

reconnect the surrounding communities with this inaccessible Waterway additionally we seek to preserve the surrounding areas as industrial(8:29:06)

manufacturing zones that are providing accessible blueco collar jobs and essential services that make the(8:29:12)

nation's largest city function while we support productions for industrial manufacturing uses we are acutely aware(8:29:17)

of the need for thorough and forward-looking controls to properly address environmental and Community Health impacts that stem from specific(8:29:24)

Industries this is specifically the case uh when emerging Trends in industrial land use go unchecked we know this well(8:29:30)

at Newtown Creek is evidenced by the toxic leg Legacy left by the petroleum industry that once dominated our(8:29:36)

shoreslines more recently areas around New Town Creek saw the proliferation of waste Transfer facilities handling(8:29:43)

approximately 40% of the City Solid Waste fortunately recent legislation helped create more equitable(8:29:49)

distribution of waste Transfer sites but not before damage was done to the local communities in the forms of poisoned air(8:29:54)

and elevated asthma rates today there's a new unchecked growing industry that is quickly consuming large industrial sites(8:30:01)

uh like Newtown Creek and that's Last Mile distribution warehouses you've already heard this afternoon from many of our colleagues in the Coalition but(8:30:08)

as with waste transfer stations these operations are bringing elevated truck traffic not just to the industrial Zone(8:30:13)

but the environmental justice communities that often exist exist *next* door every year we see more and more(8:30:18)

massive corporately owned environmentally hostile facilities built here in New York State Assembly District(8:30:23)

37 which includes most of the queen side of Newtown Creek it has the highest amount of large warehouses in all of New(8:30:30)

York State total there are 193 large warehouses that's over 50,000 square feet each in the three districts that(8:30:36)

border New Town Creek 193 for comparison the entire burough of Manhattan has only(8:30:42)

12 it is because of this just an unregulated concentration of distribution facilities that we are a(8:30:48)

proud member of the last M Coalition as such I want to reiterate the coalition's ask uh that the city of yes proposal(8:30:54)

establish a spe a special permit process for Last Mile warehouses of at least(8:30:59)

50,000 square feet and I really encourage everybody on the commission to read those comments that were submitted yesterday um by the Coalition(8:31:07)

additionally I still have a few seconds I want to also bring up some other concerns that we feel are lacking um(8:31:14)

from this proposal uh we urge the city to fully consider how izes can be more(8:31:19)

than just economic engines but also create environmental and Community benefits that are currently completely(8:31:24)

ignored uh interest of time I'll summarize this basically means more green infrastructure and industrial(8:31:30)

areas this seems to be completely left out of the conversation issues like extreme heat Urban heat island effect(8:31:36)

increased rainfall uh local flooding lack of wildlife biodiversity and of course poor AA quality can all be uh(8:31:43)

remediate through green infrastructure *thank you* I'll submit the rest of our comments and writing *thank you* much for your time great *thank you* for being here(8:31:51)

earlier and for being here later we appreciate it very much let's move on to

Hunter PUD on(8:31:59)

Zoom Hunter is not in the room okay we've heard from Kevin Kim Karen(8:32:05)

arti promoting

M arti when you're ready you(8:32:10)

can go ahead and get started can you hear me we can oh good hi um I too am(8:32:18)

really surprised that you're doing this so quickly I um have been involved in a(8:32:24)

lot of planning activities throughout the years and we always have an opportunity to talk to the people(8:32:31)
community boards too but also the people um I lived on a block that had a nursing(8:32:37)
home on the uh corner and um it's allowed and it's a it's and and it's(8:32:44)
going and it was very big it was 400 uh Beds which is a big hospital for the(8:32:50)
rest of the state of New York um and the it's not a problem that of the nursing(8:32:55)
home it's a problem of the people coming the garbage they put the parking spots they take and the most serious problem(8:33:03)
is the beep beep beep of the garbage truck that collects the waste at the end of the night um so I think if you would(8:33:12)
to take all of that stuff out of the economic development on um that has(8:33:17)
anything to do with housing and residential areas that you would be in a better position but more(8:33:23)
importantly the thing that gets me the most is during all my years of being involved as an advocate sometimes I was(8:33:31)
on a community board sometimes I wasn't I also work for the city council president um so all the time there was(8:33:38)
every you would speak to people the regular people had a voice and we don't(8:33:43)
have a voice we have to go to a community board meeting not a hearing we can't sit down and do an envisioning(8:33:50)
like we did when we all were in a Ruckus about the nursing homes we said(8:33:57)
we need to have a plan for community board eight in the Bronx and so we went and we did a 1978 that was 20 years ago(8:34:04)
that plan needs to be updated if you want to do something to our neighborhoods what you should do is give(8:34:11)
us a planner or let us all do a one night 997a but at the very least don't(8:34:16)
tell me that you've spoken to all of the people in real estate and in construction and people who own stores(8:34:23)
but you haven't spoken to the regular people and I think that is really a very important and critical thing and I'll(8:34:29)
just throw two cents in about how the more you build the worse it is for(8:34:34)
climate change because concrete cement and iron all it does is increase CO2 and(8:34:42)
that's not helping and you have to figure out a way to put green infrastructure on places that in(8:34:47)
existence rehabilitate things that are already there but building new either(8:34:52)
for economic development for manufacturing or for housing is not going to get you to your goal by the end(8:34:58)
of this uh 2030 *thank you* very much *thank you* Miss arti we appreciate it

Ria(8:35:05)

Garrett at the fresh Creek civic association

is she here she on(8:35:11)
Zoom um she is(8:35:19)
oh I'm sorry good after good evening I was here earlier back and um I'm coming(8:35:27)
to speak about the city of yes um I have a civic association and on Saturday last(8:35:35)
Saturday we had a meeting and we spoke about the city of yes now I live in the(8:35:41)
coastal protection a Coastal area and um we have concerns about infrastructure(8:35:50)
and the fact that are you guys doing any type of uh uh study about um putting(8:35:57)
these businesses and having other people increase their um their buildings and um(8:36:08)
you know businesses and those um Waterfront areas and I'm in community(8:36:14)
board 18 and community board 18 we um voted down the city of yes because we(8:36:22)
think that our district is unique we're(8:36:27)
one and two family homes we don't live close to stores which is fine with us we(8:36:34)
don't mind driving to a store and getting what we need we want to keep our(8:36:42)
area um for our children and it's quiet and it's peaceful now if we have stores(8:36:50)
on every corner then that means that there's going to be more ruckus on the(8:36:55)
street corners um and excuse me and we're not going to be able to you know(8:37:02)

have our quality of life and as for the person that was talking about dancing(8:37:08)
and having um you know people dancing I love to dance I'm a dancer I'm a native(8:37:15)
New Yorker I was born and raised in New York and I saw New York go through many(8:37:20)
many changes but this change right now it seems like the city is selling out(8:37:26)
the residents they are not thinking about the mama and the Papas that built(8:37:31)
their homes for their families and all I hear that accept in this project is(8:37:38)
mostly businesses Consulting real estates the city is selling out the(8:37:46)
residents and I do not agree with this so I think that the city of yes they(8:37:52)
need to go back to the drawing board and keep it in the commercial zones yes we(8:37:59)
do have storefronts that's been um vacant but you need to find out why(8:38:05)
those storefronts are vacant okay and some of the cor quarters where I live in(8:38:11)
here in canari they've been vacant for many years that's because the people(8:38:16)
that own these places is warehousing it for something like this for the city to(8:38:22)
come out with this massive change so um zoning changes so they could um make(8:38:28)
money off of us that's what I have to say thank you so much okay thank you(8:38:34)
very much Miss Garrett we appreciate it um okay next up is

low vandervalk on Zoom

promoting now(8:38:47)
hello low whenever you're ready you have three(8:38:56)
minutes sorry can you hear me we can(8:39:01)
great um we I will be submitting uh on behalf(8:39:07)
I'm I'm my name is I vandervalk I'm president of Carnegie Hill neighbors and I'm speaking on behalf of Carnegie Hill(8:39:13)
neighbors as we speak uh community board 8 is wrapping up its consideration(8:39:21)
detailed consideration of um of the city of yes for Economic Opportunity and um(8:39:30)
we we are we are following that and we will we will reflect some of that in our(8:39:35)
written comments but I just want to say uh some key(8:39:40)
concerns uh one is the is what will be happening to special um Special(8:39:47)
Districts um such as the Madison Avenue uh preservation district and the park uh(8:39:55)
Park and Fifth Avenue Improvement districts um and I know that that the(8:40:01)
dimensional aspects of the Madison Avenue district for example will be(8:40:07)
maintained however the uses will be radically changed in fact(8:40:15)
all almost all uses will be allowed um and we think that this is(8:40:21)
very concerning uh one of the most [Music] immediate that points that comes to mind(8:40:28)
is that is the idea of the dance halls and and uh and(8:40:34)
um because that will you might think that Cooperative(8:40:41)
buildings will will prohibit things uh for the Ground Floor commercials but uh(8:40:48)
there are many condos that are and where the Ground Floor commercials um areas(8:40:54)
are privately owned and they will not heed to the building's wishes and that(8:41:01)
could be a very big problem you know it doesn't the problem doesn't occur until(8:41:06)
one one uh happens and we've seen that with the popup shops and therefore(8:41:13)
before we can expect something could occur which is beyond our control and(8:41:19)
which which does not rep reflect the kind of community uh that has existed(8:41:27)
and and and that we value so much and I just want to say that the uh Madison(8:41:32)
Avenue special district was created in 1973 at the same time that we got a tiny(8:41:39)
historic district but the uh City Planning Commission said well don't worry about that historic district we're(8:41:45)

going to we're going to limit what can happen on Madison Avenue and so that's uh that was sort of a pledge and it's(8:41:52)
worked out very well for us and uh so we we we demer that development we also are(8:41:59)
concerned about commercial establishments on the corner of corners of big Avenues um those are just two(8:42:06)
points I will add others in my written testimony *thank you* for this opportunity you got it thanks very much I good to(8:42:13)
hear from you um and I will just note um that on the special district rules for(8:42:19)
places like Madison Avenue we think there's uh some ambiguities there and that the proposals that we're advancing(8:42:25)
here will actually add some uh Clarity to them uh and that they are you know(8:42:32)
any use changes we think are actually within the the spirit and intent of the special district so we'd like to uh we'd(8:42:38)
like you to consider that and also uh certainl

y we'll U look forward to seeing your uh further comments okay let's go uh to(8:42:46)

Chris Walters next(8:42:51)

please promoting to(8:43:04)
panelist you should be able to unmute great *thank you* so much um thank(8:43:11)
you CH ganik and Commissioners um *thank you* for for still being here in a long day *thank you* to your staff for(8:43:16)
accommodating me switching to zoom um *my name* is Chris Walters and I'm the senior L use policy associate the association(8:43:22)
for neighborhood and housing development anhd is a member organization of neighborhood-based Housing and economic(8:43:28)
development groups and all five bureaus with a mission to ensure flourishing neighborhoods and decent affordable(8:43:33)
housing for all New Yorkers as a key part of our work we convene the industrial jobs Coalition a city-wide(8:43:39)
Alliance of policy Advocates Community organizations and Industrial business service providers fighting to protect(8:43:44)
preserve and grow the industrial sector in NYC and we do this work because we recognize the vital role the industrial(8:43:50)
sector plays in creating a more Equitable thriving and functioning City industrial jobs offer High wages low(8:43:56)
barriers to entry and opportunity Pathways for a Workforce that is 80% workers of color and over 50% foreign(8:44:02)
born as industrial Advocates we're heartened that the administration is taking steps to reform outdated Zoning(8:44:08)
for manufacturing districts however it is imperative that the zoning rules for these districts are structured in a way(8:44:14)
that one prioritizes the preservation and growth of industrial districts excuse me industrial businesses in the(8:44:20)
core district and two better incentivizes the inclusion of industrial businesses and new developments in the(8:44:26)
transition and growth districts we ask this commission to make the following vital modifications to the new(8:44:31)
manufacturing District's text amendment to ensure these goals are met for m3a or(8:44:37)
core industrial districts again to prioritize the preservation and growth of industrial businesses we ask that you(8:44:43)
limit uh further limit non-industrial uses and provide additional density for industrial businesses where appropriate(8:44:49)
by uh first restricting all non-industrial uses to 10,000 square feet per zoning lot and creating(8:44:55)
additional m3a districts offering higher F of four and five for qualifying uses(8:45:01)
for m2a transition districts to better incentivize the inclusion of industrial businesses and new developments we ask(8:45:08)
that you increase the size of the incentive bonus for qualifying uses of across m2a zoning districts and for m1as(8:45:16)
or growth districts we ask that you include an incentive for qualifying uses along the lines of transition districts(8:45:23)
and again across all of the M1A zoning districts we've shared these requested modifications with DCP and we will share(8:45:30)
them with the Commission in more detail in our written comments *thank you* very much for your time and consideration(8:45:36)
happy to answer any questions if you have them we we do commissioner Soro thank *thank you* chair *thank you* for(8:45:43)
your testimony I have a quick question so you know we we've heard for some of the other members of the your Coalition(8:45:50)
uh We've also discussed to some extent uh issues or challenges with enforcement(8:45:56)
and so I'm wondering if you have any and obviously there are aspects of that that are you know beyond zoning but I'm(8:46:03)
wondering if there's anything that you've uh thought of that could share with us in terms of how do we guarantee(8:46:08)
that those minimum requirements for industrial in in the three uh proposed District uh districts actually come to(8:46:15)
fruition one and two you know is there a role for the IBC like framework and and(8:46:21)
sort of like guaranteeing that is there's anything that we can include or consider as we're discussing these(8:46:26)

districts that can help us address the Enforcement issue more directly and perhaps relying or partnering with the(8:46:32)
IBC ecosystem sure *thank you* yeah *thank you* very much for that question um you're(8:46:38)
right that enforcement is always an issue I think that we would say look to(8:46:44)
uh the existing ibia language but then work to um work to improve upon that and(8:46:51)
I think you know speak to our ibsp our industrial business service provider members um who have a lot of experience(8:46:58)
and I think ideally right would be you know I think ideally would love to see where they are sort of the administering(8:47:04)
agent that is ensuring um that that it is actual manufacturing that actually(8:47:10)
the use groups that are required that are filling uh that space I believe that is the spirit of the language in ibia(8:47:18)
but I think there's ways that that can be um that we think that could be uh improved further and and I think that(8:47:24)
just up up one place to sort of one place to start *thank you* I appreciate it thank(8:47:31)
you *thank you* commissioner and uh *thank you* Mr Walters good to see you and yes we uh we've got those comments and(8:47:36)
we'll look forward to talking with you about those further so *thank you* um okay let's go *next* to

I Ortiz uh on Zoom uh

(8:47:45)
welcoming her back former commissioner glad you're(8:48:00)
here hello can you hear me we can okay let me get on on video I know you guys(8:48:07)
have been there for a very long time um(8:48:13)
we have um *thank you* so much um commissioner uh *my name* is Lura serz I'm(8:48:19)
testifying today as a Jackson Heights resident but I'm also an urban planner retail strategist this is work I've(8:48:25)
spent 25 years of my life I'm dedicated to specifically to commercial districts I'm also a former City Planning(8:48:31)
commissioner on this body where I frequently Champion more rational zoning policies for our City's businesses and(8:48:38)
Commercial districts and that's what I want to talk about today um let's step back revisit the big picture which may(8:48:44)
be obvious um but the world has changed um covid has accelerated so many Trends(8:48:50)
um online shopping in particular changes the way that businesses function but our(8:48:56)
outdated use table and Retail definitions have not kept up but businesses know that now they have to(8:49:02)
provide services activities and experiences that can't be purchased online if they're going to survive so(8:49:09)
the way I see it this is not a proposal as some have suggested for big businesses those businesses have always(8:49:17)
had the resources to go through expensive approval processes processes this is about our City's small(8:49:23)
businesses which make up 98% of all of the city's businesses and these(8:49:29)
businesses are cash starved um on average they have 27 days worth of cash buffer retail businesses have even less(8:49:36)
19 days and minority owned businesses even less 14 days cash buffer(8:49:43)
so what happens when a business doesn't have the resources or the expertise to hire expeditors or lawyers or Deep(8:49:50)
Pockets to pay rent while they're waiting for permits and approvals well if they even get through that process(8:49:56)
which is a hurdle in and of itself they start their business underwater because we have effectively set them up for(8:50:03)
failure um so I I do a lot of this work all across the country and what we're seeing right now is 80% recovery is full(8:50:10)
recovery um businesses are still struggling to pay rent and um it's not(8:50:16)
just businesses that are affected the Center for Urban future estimates that we've lost about 40,000 retail jobs(8:50:21)
that's 11% decline in jobs in that sector um and who does this affect most(8:50:27)
job Seekers without college degrees so that creates even more disparities and that's a concern for all of us so what(8:50:34)
does zoning have to do with it business and entrepreneurs are just trying to do what they do best they want to be(8:50:40)
creative they want to Pivot they want to bring an income and simply put the current zoning doesn't let them do this(8:50:47)
so the last thing the city should be doing right now is making it even harder um cleaning up the code is just a really(8:50:54)
long time incoming and I hope you Embrace this opportunity to get it done thank(8:50:59)
you *thank you* very much good to see you *thank you* for being here with us we appreciate it very much *thank you* um(8:51:06)
okay everybody's waving yeah um okay all right let's go to

Greg Miller

Greg Miller who I believe is here in the(8:51:15)
room welcome *thank you* um I'm here to support uh the proposal(8:51:23)
nine of the Zoning for Economic Opportunity um for **dancing** um **dancing**'s(8:51:30)
not for everyone um I hear it throughout the testimony people laughing at maybe(8:51:36)
it's a trit issue but it means a lot to a lot of people I'm a **dancer** I'm a **dance**(8:51:41)
ad kid I'm the director of the 501c3 nonprofit that started **dance** parade and(8:51:48)
there are 10,000 **dancers** every year of a hundred styles of **dance** that are living(8:51:54)
their passion and living their culture and so uh **dance** parade started you know(8:52:01)
as a protest of the Cabaret law 20 years ago about 20 years ago and that's when(8:52:07)
we were doing our work to get the public to know that there was even a cabaret law(8:52:12)
um you know the zoning is the last vesage of that and we're really excited(8:52:18)
about the current proposal um **dance**free NYC is an advocacy campaign that has(8:52:25)
collected 3,747 signatures from a petition that we are submittting to you today 75 Pages(8:52:32)
here um and um I'd like to say that our city really thrives when all cultures(8:52:39)
can express their Traditions including black Asian Arab Caribbean latinx lgbtq(8:52:45)
communities from sooka and Caribbean in Flatbush to paa in green points salsa(8:52:51)
manga Bachata and queens hip hop in the Bronx each should be protected as a(8:52:56)
First Amendment activity Additionally the expressive forms of Swing voguing house and(8:53:02)
whacking in Manhattan and all over the city contribute to this Rich Mosaic(8:53:08)
Citywide zoning restrictions that curtail this diversity erode the essence(8:53:13)
of who we are as proud New Yorkers the Planning Commission needs to understand(8:53:18)
that if these Provisions are minimized as nightlife issues you may unintentionally perpetuate systemic(8:53:25)
racism instead of eliminating barriers that disproportionately affect ethnic(8:53:31)
minorities we support the proposal to consider **dancing** as scheduled entertainment to allow bars and(8:53:37)
restaurants to permit poetry comedy painting and incidental **dancing** to be in(8:53:44)
line with how live music is already permitted as a First Amendment right under these Provisions building noise(8:53:50)
and fire safety codes among the most stringent in the nation would remain in place and uh we thank mayor Adams uh for(8:53:59)
his 2020 pledge to fix Zoning for **dancing** at that time also uh bro(8:54:05)
president Mark Lavine Keith Powers uh they were all seeing this as a way forward from the pandemic(8:54:12)
and uh it's been a marathon day and a marathon 20 years of this work for me so(8:54:17)
I really I appreciate you all *thank you* for your work for the city *thank you* for that *thank you* for being here and for uh(8:54:24)
for for offering those thoughts we appreciate it very much

okay let's go to Som(8:54:31)
dong my time all right it's your time come on up come on up I feel like very(8:54:37)
special for me today great and first time today great yay *thank you thank you*(8:54:44)
hello everyone *my name* is from Thailand and uh(8:54:50)
special today I come here because great he invite me today special guest he said(8:54:55)
come to talk I'm the running the owner of the restaurant in 25 East bway for(8:55:00)
Thai vegan food I have been for 36 year 1988 in Thailand with I 15 years but I(8:55:07)
bring to New York almost uh Seven Years in New York manhatt uh low is uh really near the uh(8:55:15)
Manhattan uh way 25 and today the I feel the uh I want to talk something about(8:55:23)
the **dance** you know **dance** is very special for **dance** you know I like the Dan um I(8:55:29)
bring the food and culture from Thailand you know to show the people how the experience and the how is the my(8:55:37)
restaurant you know I build a for long time you know when young that's why I(8:55:42)
know about the Thai culture I want to bring the Thai culture here that's uh(8:55:48)
that's why I come here I come from small village you know like the uh uh(8:55:53)
Northeast Tha it callate proing and I went to the uh the north of Thailand you(8:56:00)
know the people really poor you know but the simple the the the Val simple the(8:56:05)
ten of the family and Tha ten at my the(8:56:11)
restaurant you know we have uh carving like the food carving cutting the vegetable like the art you know for(8:56:18)
people also and uh every the satday night we have like a small machine like(8:56:23)
the col for the people you know want to Joy then together and uh also I would(8:56:30)
like to the con consider consider of the(8:56:35)
garden uh labor in um sorry my English have not good I(8:56:42)
tried learning more and talk okay and uh(8:56:47)
asement and uh in the addition of the uh(8:56:52)
weekend cooking also and we offer the cooking class you know as well from the(8:56:58)
in Thailand Bangkok we have like the two location also and also the the tradition(8:57:04)
the Tha Thai **dancing** you know we bring here and I am really proud of my Tha(8:57:10)
that why I want to bring to here and we Pro uh we Pro participate in the an(8:57:18)
dance parade and uh festival with the tration Thai music and Tha Dan I am(8:57:25)
great tell you that this from of the entertainment and uh from the concentr(8:57:32)
uh under of the current sing(8:57:39)
Labor uh left be be because(8:57:45)
sorry because uh chanting all the level(8:57:52)
mind dcy to the nation that's the thing of the(8:57:58)
district either I try II is the strength to(8:58:05)
the uh let go to leave the music and be when the con to the(8:58:13)
beautiful and *thank you* for today great well *thank you* very much we appreciate you're being here to testify before us(8:58:21)
thank you very much okay let's go *next* to funi(8:58:30)
chzn hi welcome *thank you* welcome everyone here I know you guys are(8:58:36)
exhausted um hello commissioner the city plan of the city planning Comm Mission(8:58:42)
and *thank you* for having me *my name* is

fam ozni !

and I'm first generation immigrant from Guyana and Brazil and(8:58:49)
have lived in Brooklyn ever since I come here before you to show(8:58:55)
support for the Department of City Planning proposal to effectively end(8:59:02)
prohibition on **dancing** in New York City I have been a **dancer** and **dance** educator(8:59:08)
for over 40 years with a particular focus on African **dance** I have come to know the limitations on **Dancing** Through(8:59:14)
the advocacy work of **dance** parade New York and the legalized **dance** NYC(8:59:21)
organization I am a teaching artist for and as well a teach I'm a teaching artist I run a **dance** company fushia(8:59:28)
Dance Company since 1995 and I'm a teaching artist all around the city and(8:59:34)
um working also for **dance** parades Community engagement programs we present **dance** workshops in schools and Adult(8:59:41)
Learning Centers mainly in Brooklyn Queens and Manhattan and finding space to practice my art form is extremely(8:59:48)
limited as a **dance** educator with smaller children I have created call and response activities that help children(8:59:55)
grow independently and adopt responsible behavior to their parents teachers and peers for older kids I teach about some(9:00:02)
of the historical injustices that have occurred by the slavery trade in Africa the influence of slavery in the United(9:00:10)
States and the systemic systemic racism that still exists and can be seen by(9:00:15)
zoning laws that have limited **dancing** and cultural expression among ethnic groups at times I rent Studios rehearsal(9:00:23)
space to practice with my students and professional African **dance** company fushia **Dance** Company I support the city(9:00:30)
of yes proposal to allow rehearsal studios on the ground floor of buildings(9:00:35)
which today are not permitted under the current zoning laws during other times(9:00:41)
and I must say on rare occasions I'm invited to present **dance** in a restaurant(9:00:46)
bar lounge or nightclub usually in Brooklyn and Manhattan these venues tend(9:00:51)
to be smaller establishments under 200 patrons and current zoning regulations have prohibited venues to allow such(9:00:59)
dance both on an intermittent level and also as scheduled entertainment(9:01:04)
currently live music is permitted in any bar or restaurant Citywide but in most(9:01:09)
of these establishment **dancing** is not permitted and I strongly support the Zoning for Economic Opportunity(9:01:16)
proposals which would allow **dance** in smaller venues with less than 200(9:01:22)
patrons **dance** for me is a lot it's very it's a healthy vibrant activity that(9:01:28)
needs to be encouraged um it has helped me a lot as far as Mind Body Spirit(9:01:35)
balance um **dance** helps to break blocks we all need to move especially after(9:01:41)
sitting you guys you need to move *thank you* so much for having me *thank you thank you* for that um and I will note(9:01:48)
that one of the proposals uh in in uh in the city of yra Economic Opportunity is to remove ground FL floor limitations(9:01:56)
for **dance** studios and C4 and five and a number of Special Districts um they're(9:02:01)
often allowed but just not um in storefront so that of course would be a big uh uh big an important change here(9:02:07)
okay let's move on uh to the zoom uh

Samara Cohen in the Sam is not in the(9:02:14)

room how about Bria Donahue also not in the room Parker(9:02:20)

Ramirez promoting(9:02:27)

now hello can you hear me we can hi good(9:02:33)

evening I you're exhausted I'll make this as quick as I can so good evening(9:02:38)

to the chair and the commission *my name* is Parker I am a choreographer **dancer** student and(9:02:45)

cool hip young person here in New York City I'm here to support I'm here to support the city of(9:02:52)

yes use Land Reform with regard to Economic Opportunity specifically prop 9(9:02:57)

I support this reform as a student because I'm beginning to transition from my Conservatory education at marry Mount(9:03:03)

Manhattan College into the professional creative industry I can tell you that koi will soften the grind of the(9:03:09)

audition process by by implementing Common Sense rules for **dance** by making nightlife spaces open for social and(9:03:16)

professional growth through Community Gatherings for **dance** and Creative Arts events I understand that residents are(9:03:22)

worried about noise and nightlife problems as Bronx president Vanessa Gibson as previously mentioned with(9:03:29)

resolutions proposed the city already has an existing initiatives for artists(9:03:35)

and affordable housing um and I believe that zoning could include proposals to incentivize artists to take housing(9:03:41)

where nightlife venues need creatives in my support for koi I want to graduate in a New York where I can enjoy the Vibrant(9:03:48)

Community and diverse cultures that Express themselves through movement and I know that I can contribute to that(9:03:53)

future growth through my work as a choreographer I know I am not alone in my testimony as many of my fellow(9:03:58)

classmates are wondering where the *next* opportunity will come from and with koi I want to report to them that the city(9:04:04)

of yes for Economic Opportunity prop n will support us um yeah and I would just love to thank the **dance** Community for(9:04:12)

coming out here you know for this is like hour eight I was here since 10:00 a.m. and you know that's how much I love(9:04:18)

this community I love **dance** and I really want as a young person as a creative who(9:04:24)

is trying to contribute to uh New York City's creative economy uh you know to(9:04:31)

make a lasting impact and I hope that you know uh with the uh city of a city(9:04:37)

of yes that that will you know help out um and also yeah for those who are like(9:04:44)

considering noise complaints and nightlife problems those I believe are(9:04:50)

personal issues those are individual Acts created by individual backed actors which should be dealt with by people(9:04:57)

like again this will create jobs for security for bouncers there's a whole intersecting community of professionals(9:05:03)

related with night life and I know that um **dance** is definitely a big engine and(9:05:11)

driver for that so I would like to thank the commission and the chair for your time and listening today uh and with(9:05:17)

that that is hour s for me good night good night to you *thank you* very much uh(9:05:23)

for all the hours you spent listening today uh we we appreciate it um okay let's move on to

Jeremy Coen

who may be(9:05:30)

in the room(9:05:37)

welcome okay good evening Commissioners uh *my name* is Jeremy Coen I am a land use attorney at Fred Frank Harris(9:05:43)

Shriver and Jacobson I am here today speaking on behalf of builds bio a new(9:05:49)

york-based 501c3 organization in which Fred Frank is a member that specializes(9:05:55)

in bringing life science design construction and the real estate Community together through research and(9:06:01)

educational programming members of builds bio include the city's Premier real estate developers investors owners(9:06:08)

Architects Engineers like life science operators environmental safety firms and construction companies for many years(9:06:15)
builds bio has worked with EDC and other City agencies in support of the city's initiatives including lifi NYC to(9:06:23)
encourage the development of the life science Industry in the city the city(9:06:28)
and especially EDC are great proponents of the life sciences industry and builds(9:06:33)
bio looks forward to continuing to working with them on life science development issues in the future Life(9:06:39)
Sciences are growing sector of the city's economy and Foster scientific and medical breakthroughs towards a more(9:06:46)
sustainable and Equitable future while providing quality jobs across a range of Education(9:06:52)
levels we applaud the city of yes Economic Opportunity proposal as it makes a wide range of updates to out(9:06:59)
outdated zoning Provisions in particular the updated use group listings provide an easily understandable framework for(9:07:07)
determining permitted uses for Life Sciences the update from an outdated term to the simplified laboratory use(9:07:15)
designation provides Clarity for a growing industry we do have one important recommendation regarding the(9:07:21)
special permit for laboratory uses life science facilities typically need regularized floor plates and floor- t-(9:07:28)
floor Heights sufficient to accommodate specialized mechanical and Life Safety Equipment this is true even for as of(9:07:35)
right facilities under proposed use group 7 we encourage the department of City Planning to ensure that developers(9:07:42)
of these as of right facilities have the opportunity to apply for special permits under the required public review process(9:07:49)
for bulk waivers even where the use does not require a special use waiver as well(9:07:55)
we *thank you* for the opportunity to present testimony today and remain supportive of the city's continued(9:08:00)
efforts to promote life science uses great *thank you* very much okay *next* up(9:08:05)
is Caroline Engle on Zoom(9:08:17)
hello hello hello we got you Hi how are you this is actually

Sandra jaquez I'll!!!(9:08:24)

be um doing the testimony myself okay that's fine go ahead thank(9:08:31)

you uh *thank you* chair and the members of the City Planning Commission for the opportunity to testify today

my name is(9:08:38)

Sandra jaquez and I serve as president of the New York State Latino restaurant bar and lounge Association which(9:08:44)

represents the interest of hundreds of minority and immigrant-owned restaurants and nightlife establishments throughout(9:08:50)

the city of New York I'm also the owner of two small restaurants ille and satos(9:08:56)

which are located in Inwood I would like to focus my testimony today on the city of yes economic opportunities provision(9:09:03)

to end the **dance** ban in New York City current zoning law only allows **dancing**(9:09:10)

in high density commercial and Manufacturing districts in venues for over 200 patrons this zoning creates(9:09:18)

confusing and arbitrary rules around **dancing** comedy and music and(9:09:23)

discriminates against smaller venues and clubs that larly serve marginalized(9:09:29)

communities take my restaurants for example they're located in an area zoned as a C2 which currently places(9:09:37)

restrictions on **dancing** and other forms of live entertainment that means if I was to rent out my space(9:09:43)

for a private event the patrons will not be able to Simply **dance** in place the(9:09:48)

city of yes proposal revises these regulations by allowing social **dance** to take place in any bar restaurant in any(9:09:55)

commercial or manufacturing District under a 200% capacity I am here today to(9:10:02)

express that the New York State Latino restaurant bar and large Association strong support for the city of yes(9:10:09)

Economic Opportunity specifically ending the **dance** ban the proposed zoning amendments will(9:10:15)

strengthen our minority owned establishments already struggling to overcome the many challenges present(9:10:22)

today in the hospitality industry our industry was one of the hardest hit during the pandemic and many of our(9:10:28)

members are still recovering from the economic strain induced by the pandemic city of yes for economic(9:10:36)

opportunities will allow our minority and immigrant owned establishments to expand their businesses and build their(9:10:41)

customer base by allowing for **dancing** in bars restaurants and nightclubs it will(9:10:47)

also Champion the culture of many of these establishment where **dancing** and music is a focal point we urge the(9:10:53)

commission to com to con reconsider and consider the advantages of the city of yes for economic opportunities for the(9:11:00)

hospitality industry and minority owned restaurants and nightclubs *thank you* so much for the opportunity to speak on(9:11:06)

behalf of the New York State Latino restaurant bar and lounge Association today great *thank you* very much uh *next* up is(9:11:14)

Rob Holbrook

the executive director of get stuff built Mr Holbrook good to have(9:11:19)
you here welcome evening Commissioners *my name* is(9:11:24)
Rob hook I am the executive director of get stuff built to the mayor's office of policy plan delivery I'm tasked by the(9:11:29)
mayor with streamlining the many approval processes and procedures that construction and developments follow in our city I also lead the
office of(9:11:36)
residential conversion accelerator program established by the mayor to streamline the conversion of vacant Office Buildings to active
residential(9:11:42)
use I speak in support of the city of yes Economic Opportunity text Amendment with two(9:11:47)
perspectives first I would like to highlight the damage to real businesses caused by unclear and complex rules and(9:11:52)
our zoning regulations the economic friction caused by complex land use regulations is particularly problematic(9:11:59)
to New Yorkers with small businesses seeking to create or expand commercial activity in existing spaces these(9:12:05)
businesses are not experienced developers complexity in the zoning resolution is a barrier to the market(9:12:10)
market for those without Deep Pockets or the patients to seek land use changes uh(9:12:16)
uh before us the cost of navigating the zoning resolution both in soft costs and time is a burden that we can reduce by(9:12:23)
simplifying the zoning resolution second there's been significant public discussion recently about the Adaptive reuse opportunities(9:12:29)
to convert vacant Office Buildings to residential use providing more flexibility in the stacking requirements(9:12:34)
of mixed use buildings as proposed in these own amendments allows opportunities for partial conversion and(9:12:40)
vacant buildings that have remaining upper story commercial tenants regulation changes that allow partial adaptive reuse supports our
housing(9:12:47)
goals and also buttresses the financial viability of commercial spaces with commercial tenants that remain scattered(9:12:52)
in half MV office buties *thank you* for your time today *thank you* very much Mr H Brook we appreciate it *thank you* for(9:12:58)
everything you're doing uh let's move on to Julie Stein of the Union Square partnership on zoom and author of a(9:13:04)
great uped in today's Daily News(9:13:18)
good evening *my name* is

Julie Stein and I'm the executive director of the Union Square partnership

I'm speaking here(9:13:25)
tonight in support of city of yaser Economic Opportunity as a business improvement district one part of our(9:13:32)
mission is to strategically plan and advocate for the economic prosperity of the Union Square 14th District 14th(9:13:38)
Street district and the health of our dynamic ecosystem of public space offices retail Hospitality arts and(9:13:44)
culture EDS and meds institutions and our residential Community Union Square is a vibr vibrant live workpl(9:13:51)
neighborhood and thanks to that mix of uses and the dedication of each and every one of our local stakeholders Union Square's Journey
Through the(9:13:57)
post-pandemic recovery has been relatively strong with foot traffic recovery nearly recovered to pre-pandemic levels however we are still(9:14:04)
seeing elevated retail and office vacancy aligned with city-wide Trends our goal is not just to recover these(9:14:10)
losses but to modernize our commercial landscape so we can jump start a virtuous cycle of economic growth that propels us into the future
today we have(9:14:17)

the opportunity to do just that the text amendments to the zoning resolution that we're here to discuss are meant to get(9:14:23)
zoning out of the way of opening or expanding a business in New York City the proposals not only best position all(9:14:28)
of our neighborhoods for continued recovery but they will usher in opportunities for Innovative and flexible use of available space in the(9:14:34)
city's commercial corridors we have the chance to bring in modern Industries like life sciences Urban a experiential(9:14:40)
retail and clean manufacturing so that they can contribute to our commercial District ecosystems and soak up some of the excess vacant
space in our business(9:14:47)
districts New York City's small businesses are in need and these zoning amendments include Common Sense(9:14:53)
proposals to support local entertainment venues like theaters and comedy clubs while allowing restaurants cafes and bakeries to more
seamlessly expand(9:15:00)
business owners are asking for clarity and necessary flexibility to allow them to invest in New York City and grow here(9:15:05)
ultimately improving the health of our neighborhoods in the process it's time to remove outdate zoning limitations and(9:15:11)
ensure that local retail streets and Commercial centers across the city can remain Lively places that sustain our neighborhoods into the
future critically(9:15:18)
these amendments will also provide the department of buildings with clear updated guidance to give Builders answers more quickly and in
turn get(9:15:25)
business operation businesses operational faster that will undoubtedly attract new investment and Industry to(9:15:30)
New York City and will lead to activated storefronts and a diversity in ground floor offerings which means more vibrant(9:15:36)
street life to revitalize our neighborhoods and anchor businesses to recovery across all five Bros this kind(9:15:41)
of energy leads to expanded fot traffic increased tourism and a livel public realm all of which support businesses(9:15:48)
increases in public safety and it improves quality of life on behalf of the Union Square partnership I share my(9:15:53)
strong support for the passage of city of yes for Economic Opportunity *thank you thank you* very much Julie we(9:15:59)
appreciate it and congrats again on that piece today um okay *next* up is

BJ Jones(9:16:05)

the executive director of the new New York panel Mr Jones welcome good to to see(9:16:14)
[Music] you I'd like to uh note for the record that I may not be young hip or cool but(9:16:21)
I am Pro **dance** um again I'm BJ Jones executive(9:16:27)
director of the new New York I'm testifying to express my strong support for the city of yes for Economic(9:16:34)
Opportunity this zoning text amendment is one of the 40 key initiatives recommended by the new New York panel a(9:16:40)
group of 59 Civic leaders and Industry experts convened by governor hokel and mayor Adams to develop an action plan(9:16:48)
for the Equitable recovery of the city initiative number two specifically calls(9:16:53)
for updating zoning to provide businesses with more flexibility and opportunity to(9:16:59)
thrive businesses need a clear and sensible zoning framework that gives them the ability to adapt and grow(9:17:04)
especially as our city recovers from covid-19 the city of yes for Economic Opportunity would remove outdated(9:17:10)
limitations and ensure that commercial corridors can be Lively places that help sustain our city this proposed zoning(9:17:17)
text Amendment sends a clear message that our city is committed to Common Sense yet long overdue updates that(9:17:23)
support entrepreneurs seeking to start businesses local stores seeking to expand and developers who would like to(9:17:29)
rent their spaces but are hampered by these outdated Arcane unnecessary and confusing restrictions the city of yes(9:17:35)
for Economic Opportunity presents a unique chance to enhance our City's competitiveness and(9:17:41)
prosperity as the new New York panel co-chairs Dan doov and Richard buy said(9:17:46)
late last year in championing this initiative as part of The Suite of city of yes reforms and I quote we are a city(9:17:53)
of Strivers who in times of Crisis rally to make our city greater than ever now is not a time for acquiescence or(9:18:00)
business as usual now is the time to lean into our natural adaptability and unleash New Yorkers full Ingenuity to(9:18:07)
create an even stronger more resilient City these are the right proposals at the right time and we urge everyone to work(9:18:13)
for their Swift implementation I'd also like to note based on my own many years in government(9:18:19)
how important I believe this initiative is government can make a future focused impact in many ways but few changes have(9:18:26)
such lasting and Broad positive impact like regulatory reforms such as this and(9:18:31)

it is no small feat requiring tireless dedication and thoughtful attention to detail from the staff at the department(9:18:37)
of city planning to make it possible it is a credit to you chair garodnick(9:18:43)
the commission and your team that the city is advancing this measure working collaboratively with a wide range of(9:18:49)
stakeholders in communities across all five boroughs over many long days you(9:18:55)
are Paving the way for a prosperous future for all New York City residents and businesses *thank you thank you* very(9:19:01)
much we appreciate that and we appreciate the work of the new New York panel and *thank you* for the support it means a lot um okay let's
go to Derek(9:19:08)
Washington on Zoom derck is not in the zoom okay Michelle(9:19:14)
Janie in the room and this will be a final call for anybody wishing to testify on CBS for(9:19:20)
Economic Opportunity welcome you may end up being the last word of the day so the final(9:19:26)

Michelle Joanie!!

word hi everybody I'm Michelle Joanie thanks for having me today I am the owner of operator of Glend of the good(9:19:32)
bus I drive around we do uh I'm also part of the Brooklyn Bushwick **dance**(9:19:39)
scene I feel I can also represent a larger segment of New York in our **dance**(9:19:44)
scene and what is possible when we allow the streets and the whole city to be our **dance** floor I like to I like to say to(9:19:51)
people I'll see you on the **Dance** Floor Of Life uh my two-year-old will tell you you know always time to **dance** and you(9:19:56)
know just **dance** being an expression of the soul that helps like make our minds(9:20:02)
more agile and to come up with Solutions together I think is really uh part of(9:20:07)
part of what we're proposing and I'm a totally yes to the city of yes uh proposals for economic recovery and(9:20:14)
expansion and I think a big part of this is just rethinking what NTI really is(9:20:20)
because I think a lot of people associate **dancing** with the the night you(9:20:25)
know the hours between 1000 p.m. and 4:00 a.m. and drinking and I think what(9:20:31)
we have the opportunity to really do is make night life more like Day Life make day life more like night life and(9:20:38)
encourage in in small businesses um spas and(9:20:44)
restaurants and even places to to run errands you know people have to be done with their errands by 7 p.m. and they(9:20:51)
have to be once 10 p.m. comes along you better have ordered your food or gotten your food and you better be ready to(9:20:56)
dance and go to the club but what if there were just more opportunities to go be co-working at a coffee shop at night(9:21:03)
or you know go run go to the bank in in the evening or go shopping because you(9:21:09)
got out of work and you needed to get stuff for your family um and you know kind of blending this you know this(9:21:16)
opportunity of taking these businesses that do need help with economic recovery and something new to to be inspired by(9:21:23)
that they can actually do more with the hours of the day that they operate and that **nightlife** venues could offer more(9:21:30)
during the day and that **dancing** isn't just this pigeon hold thing of this you(9:21:36)
know strict nightlife uh activity and that you know people really need I see(9:21:41)
firsthand all the time what it's like when I roll up and there's a **dance** party and people can just join and they have(9:21:48)
the opportunity to meet people and connect and you know that's really what our city needs and as a city that(9:21:55)
doesn't sleep we can think about how we can encourage and support businesses in(9:22:01)
operating differently so that they can bring in new business and and not have you know just just rethink the way(9:22:07)
things are happening and you know employ artists and musicians to do things at(9:22:13)
different hours in unusual places I throw **dance** parties in bodegas uh you know people are ready to connect and(9:22:20)
Boogie and it's not just about you know one you know it's not just about night life it's about life it's about life(9:22:28)
it's about creating an amazing New York City that can be anything we want it to(9:22:34)
be great

thank you very much uh and that it would be great way to finish today(9:22:40)

but I will ask if there is anybody else who wants to be heard today who has not had the(9:22:46)

opportunity anybody on Zoom that remains Madam Secretary okay with that we will close(9:22:55)

the hearing on city of Yer Economic Opportunity Calendars number 30 and 31 *thank you* for a great last word uh we(9:23:03)

really appreciate that we appreciate your being here Madam Secretary is there any other business before the commission(9:23:08)

today no know chair grodnick there is no other business before the commission but I do have some public information to(9:23:13)

share for those of you who are unable to or did not wish to testify you can **submit written testimony online by(9:23:18)**

selecting this hearing on the upcoming meetings page of the NYC engage portal through DCPS website or by mailing your(9:23:25)

comments to City Planning Commission calendar information office 120 Broadway 31st floor New York New York(9:23:32)

10271 that's great well *thank you* very much Madam Secretary I just want to express my appreciation uh to you uh to(9:23:39)

the staff of the Department of City Planning the best in the business let me just say that you guys are amazing uh(9:23:46)

you know the folks that you saw the folks that you didn't see the folks that are out at the community boards every(9:23:52)

day sometimes under some very difficult circumstances they're doing an incredible job uh and they deserve all(9:23:59)

of our appreciation we've heard a lot of comments today uh which we obviously will review and reflect on and consider(9:24:05)

there'll be follow-ups here before the commission and uh along those lines I would like to express my thanks to(9:24:10)

members of the commission who are now here 9 hours and 20 minutes today alone(9:24:15)

uh it was a long hearing an important hearing so *thank you* all for your time and your patience and attention and with(9:24:21)

that Madam Secretary the time is now 7:22 and we are(9:24:38)

adjourned(9:24:51)

for

English (auto-generated)

Live chat replay was turned off for this video.